

STATE OF NEW MEXICO
ENERGY, MINERALS AND NATURAL RESOURCES DEPARTMENT
OIL CONSERVATION COMMISSION

IN THE MATTER OF THE HEARING CALLED BY)
THE OIL CONSERVATION COMMISSION FOR THE)
PURPOSE OF CONSIDERING:)

PROPOSED AMENDMENT TO 19.15.1 NMAC) CASE NO. 13,269
ADOPTING A NEW SECTION TO BE CODIFIED AS)
19.15.1.21 NMAC. THIS SECTION APPLIES)
TO THE CHIHUAHUA DESERT AREAS OF OTERO)
AND SIERRA COUNTIES, NEW MEXICO,)
PROHIBITS THE USE OF PITS AND IMPOSES)
ADDITIONAL LOCATION, CONSTRUCTION,)
OPERATION AND TESTING REQUIREMENTS ON)
INJECTION WELLS AND RELATED FACILITIES)
USED TO DISPOSE OF PRODUCED WATER)

ORIGINAL

COMMISSION HEARING
EXCERPT OF PROCEEDINGS (Testimony of Robert Sivinski,
Rachel Jankowitz and Steven Finch)

BEFORE: MARK E. FESMIRE, CHAIRMAN
JAMI BAILEY, COMMISSIONER
FRANK T. CHAVEZ, COMMISSIONER

June 17th and 18th, 2004

Santa Fe, New Mexico

This matter came on for hearing before the Oil Conservation Commission, MARK E. FESMIRE, Chairman, on Thursday and Friday, June 17th and 18th, 2004, at the New Mexico Energy, Minerals and Natural Resources Department, 1220 South Saint Francis Drive, Room 102, Santa Fe, New Mexico, Steven T. Brenner, Certified Court Reporter No. 7 for the State of New Mexico.

* * *

I N D E X

June 17th and 18th, 2004
 Commission Hearing
 CASE NO. 13,269
 (Excerpts of proceedings)

PAGE

DIVISION WITNESSES:

<u>ROBERT C. SIVINSKI</u> (Forestry Division, New Mexico Department of Energy, Minerals and Natural Resources)	
Direct Examination by Ms. Bada	3
Examination by Commissioner Bailey	14
Examination by Commissioner Chavez	20
Examination by Chairman Fesmire	21
Further Examination by Ms. Bada	22
 <u>RACHEL JANKOWITZ</u> (New Mexico Game and Fish Department)	
Direct Examination by Ms. Bada	24
Examination by Commissioner Bailey	35
Examination by Commissioner Chavez	38

OTERO MESA COALITION WITNESS:

<u>STEVEN T. FINCH, Jr.</u> (Hydrologist, Shoemaker and Associates)	
Direct Examination by Ms. Belin	40
Examination by Commissioner Bailey	64
Examination by Commissioner Chavez	72
Examination by Chairman Fesmire	77

REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE	79
------------------------	----

* * *

1 WHEREUPON, the following proceedings were had at
2 3:28 p.m. on Thursday, June 17th, 2004:

3 ROBERT C. SIVINSKI,

4 the witness herein, after having been first duly sworn upon
5 his oath, was examined and testified as follows:

6 DIRECT EXAMINATION

7 BY MS. BADA:

8 Q. Could you please state your name for the record?

9 A. Robert C. Sivinski.

10 Q. Where are you employed?

11 A. I'm employed with the Energy, Minerals, Natural
12 Resources Department, Forestry Division.

13 Q. How long have you been employed with the Forestry
14 Division?

15 A. With the Forestry Division for 15 years.

16 Q. And what are your job responsibilities?

17 A. Seventy-five percent of my time I am a botanist
18 for the State of New Mexico, mainly studying rare and
19 endangered plants throughout the state, to fulfill the
20 requirements of the New Mexico Endangered Plant Species
21 Act, and to implement the state's full authorities
22 agreement with the US Fish and Wildlife Service to conduct
23 most of the research and recovery operations for endangered
24 plant species in New Mexico.

25 The other 25 percent of my time I work with

1 various land conservation programs, including the Forest
2 Legacy Program, the Natural Lands Protection Act, and the
3 Land Conservation Incentives Act

4 Q. Where were you employed prior to working for the
5 Forestry Division?

6 A. Prior to that by the same department, Energy,
7 Minerals and Natural Resources, but in the Mining and
8 Minerals Division for five years.

9 Q. And what were your job responsibilities there?

10 A. I was a coal mine reclamation specialist, and by
11 the end of that term I was the chief of the Surface Mine
12 Permitting Bureau.

13 Q. And what did you do in the coal mine reclamation,
14 what were your specific duties?

15 A. It was inspection and enforcement of reclamation
16 regulations that the State has that were based on federal
17 regulations, and approving mine plans and close-out plans,
18 such things like that.

19 Q. And what is your educational background?

20 A. I have a bachelor's degree in wildlife biology
21 from New Mexico State University with a minor in range
22 science. I have a master's of science from New Mexico
23 State, also in wildlife biology, and an additional two
24 years of graduate work at UNM in plant taxonomy and
25 systematics.

1 MR. BADA: I'd like to offer Bob as an expert in
2 botany and rare plants.

3 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Is there any objection?

4 So accepted.

5 MR. SIMPSON: Could you have the witnesses speak
6 louder. The background -- the air is -- hard to hear.

7 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Okay. Mr. Sivinski is
8 acceptable to the Commission as an expert.

9 Q. (By Ms. Bada) Bob, are you familiar with the
10 Chihuahuan Desert area in Otero and Sierra Counties?

11 A. Yes, I am. Like I said, I went to school in Las
12 Cruces. I also worked for the Bureau of Land Management in
13 the Las Cruces District for a year and in the Socorro
14 District for a year and spent most of my life in New
15 Mexico. My work with rare and endangered plants has also
16 taken me to practically every county in the state. I have
17 done quite a bit of field surveys in these two counties.

18 Q. Bob, did you take this photo?

19 A. Yes, that's on Otero Mesa, just north of the
20 Cornudas Mountains. This is the famous Chihuahuan Desert
21 grasslands with a lot of elk on it. I took this photo last
22 December.

23 Q. Could you run the other three?

24 A. Same area. This grassland, as you can see, does
25 have some minor shrub component, but that just adds to the

1 species diversity out there. It is predominantly
2 grassland, black grama, purple three-awn, Torrey muhly,
3 various native species of grasses, quite a diverse
4 assemblage of plants.

5 This is on the northern end of the Otero Mesa
6 looking at the Cornucopia Hills. This is more of a playa
7 area that's mostly burro grass and Tobosa grass.

8 As you can see, there's quite a bit of plant
9 diversity out here in the Chihuahuan Desert, especially of
10 yuccas, agave, cacti, as well as the grasslands. But this
11 is kind of a soaptree-yucca savannah out Otero Mesa.

12 Q. Could we go back to slide 9? Could you identify
13 the approximate area on this vegetation map of Otero and
14 Sierra Counties that contain Chihuahuan Desert vegetation
15 types?

16 A. Just about anything you see that isn't green.
17 These green designations represent coniferous woodlands,
18 starting with piñon-juniper elevation and up into higher
19 elevation coniferous forests. Below piñon-juniper we are
20 in Chihuahuan Desert, the Chihuahuan Desert ecoregion,
21 throughout the remainder of these two counties.

22 Q. What makes the Chihuahuan Desert important?

23 A. It's really a huge desert. It extends from
24 approximately Socorro in New Mexico on the north, all the
25 way down to Nuevo Leon in Mexico. About 70 percent of the

1 desert is in New Mexico, but the northern subunit of the
2 Chihuahuan Desert is predominantly in southern New Mexico
3 and west Texas.

4 It is one of three most species-diverse, as far
5 as plants and animals, of the arid regions in the world.
6 There is even greater species diversity in the Chihuahuan
7 Desert than there is in the Sonoran Desert next to us in
8 Arizona and southern California. Although that desert gets
9 much more attention because it has big saguaros, we
10 actually have greater species diversity in the Chihuahuan
11 Desert than the Sonoran.

12 The northern unit of the Chihuahuan Desert that
13 occurs from, say Chihuahua City up through New Mexico and
14 west Texas, was predominantly grassland in historic times,
15 and that's one of the things that make it really unique,
16 is, it is a desert grass.

17 Q. How much of the Chihuahuan Desert grasslands
18 remain?

19 A. There's various estimates. Anywhere from 50 to
20 70 percent of the Chihuahuan Desert grassland has been
21 eliminated and replaced with shrublands, less species-
22 diverse scrub. In this particular area, the Bureau of Land
23 Management has estimated that in the last 150 years
24 approximately 62 percent of the grassland in these two
25 counties have been highly degraded or eliminated.

1 Q. In New Mexico, what counties have a majority of
2 the remaining grasslands?

3 A. Can I use this?

4 Q. Uh-huh, sure.

5 A. There is a little bit of grassland going up the
6 Pecos River, not very much, but it's usually confined to
7 the river valley. The largest examples of remnant
8 grassland in New Mexico are from the Otero Mesa to the
9 southern end of the Tularosa Basin. Then the northern end
10 of the Tularosa Basin, there is some on the bajada of the
11 San Andres mountains and a band of grasslands coming down
12 the bajada of the Black Range in Sierra County.

13 There are some further north in the Jornada del
14 Muerto, although they're more spotty in that area, all the
15 way up to the city -- the National Wildlife Refuge near
16 Socorro.

17 So there are remnant spots of grassland in quite
18 a few places. In fact, if you get into a different section
19 of the Chihuahuan Desert, which is called the Apachean,
20 over in the boot heel of New Mexico and adjacent Arizona,
21 there are some remnant grasslands in those locations.
22 Probably the best known is the Animas Valley.

23 Q. Why are the grasslands in the Otero Mesa area
24 different than those in the other counties?

25 A. Mainly their size. It's really a large,

1 relatively intact piece. There are still impacts to that
2 area. They're somewhat higher in elevation, so they get a
3 little bit more rain. They're mostly black grama
4 grasslands, which are unusual for Chihuahuan Desert
5 grasslands. Down lower it's usually various species of
6 dropseed, but the density of background on this area is
7 really kind of outstanding, really an outstanding example
8 of a black grama grassland.

9 Q. Why are the desert grasslands important?

10 A. They're species diverse as far as plants, as far
11 as wildlife. You'll probably hear testimony from the Game
12 and Fish Department on why they're necessary for continuing
13 populations of the antelope, prairie dogs, various
14 predators in that area.

15 They have changed, though, over the last century
16 or two, due to the pressures on them, mainly through
17 grazing during drought periods and the elimination of
18 wildfire that typically maintains grasslands.

19 So just having these remnant pieces, it's
20 important to protect them, because animals move around.
21 They need to be able to migrate, such as birds. Even
22 larger animals will move from grassland to grassland, and
23 it's good to have quite a few in proximity to one another
24 so that movement -- those ecological processes can occur.

25 If we can maintain just the remnants we have, we

1 would have pieces of grassland all the way from the
2 Sevilleta National Wildlife Refuge, down through the
3 Jornada del Muerto, into the Tularosa Basin, across Otero
4 Mesa, down to the Davis Mountain-Marfa grasslands in
5 adjacent Texas, and then across the river to the remnant
6 grasslands in central Chihuahua

7 Q. We've heard a lot of talk about pits, so I wanted
8 to ask you about the problems that might be encountered in
9 attempting to reclaim the vegetation over pits where
10 drilling muds and other drilling wastes are buried.

11 A. I think it's going to depend on what it ends up
12 in the pits. In reclaiming coal mines, our experience was,
13 anytime you're dealing with very sodic material, a lot of
14 salts of sodium, that material can migrate into whatever
15 top dressing you use for the reclamation.

16 What you're burying these pits with, I assume,
17 would be suitable root material for plants. But yet over
18 time, if it's quite a bit of salt in that area, it can
19 migrate upward into the root medium and essentially
20 sterilize the soils.

21 Q. Are there any endangered or threatened plants in
22 Otero and Sierra Counties in this area of the Chihuahuan
23 Desert?

24 A. I wasn't finished on the reclamation part.

25 Q. Oh, sorry, go ahead and finish.

1 A. Also, when you disturb grassland soils, which are
2 out here typically fairly shallow because of a caliche
3 layer, when you mix all that up, you're breaking up that
4 soil horizon and typically making that area suitable more
5 for taprooted plants than you are for grasses, and you'll
6 see a lot of annual herbaceous species coming in and even
7 shrubs coming in. And it's perfect root medium for noxious
8 weeds as well, and we see that quite a bit in the well
9 patch, because noxious weeds follow the roads, the
10 pipelines, the wellpads, and it just takes a long time for
11 that -- maybe centuries, for that soil structure to
12 redevelop into grassland-type of soils.

13 Also, one of the main problems for reclamation
14 out here is, practically all of the species -- the grass
15 species that I mentioned that occur on this area, are not
16 available commercially. There has been so little
17 reclamation done in the Chihuahuan Desert that growers have
18 not begun to supply seed for reclamation purposes. There
19 is no seed source on the open market for black grama, for
20 Tobosa grass, for three-awn. All of the common grass
21 species out here, just about, are not available for
22 reclamation purposes. So even though this area might be
23 seeded for a post-impact land use, it's probably not going
24 to be seeded to effect restoration of what was there
25 before.

1 Q. Okay.

2 A. Now your next question.

3 Q. Thanks, Bob. Are there any endangered or
4 threatened plants in the Chihuahuan Desert in Otero and
5 Sierra Counties?

6 A. Yes, there are six. Two are federally listed
7 species. They occur on the Sacramento escarpment. One is
8 the Sacramento prickly poppy. That's a very endangered
9 plant that's on its way to extinction. It occurs on the
10 lower part of the escarpment.

11 Just north of that is the Todson's pennyroyal,
12 which occurs on gypsum outcrops on the escarpment. Those
13 both are federally listed plants.

14 There's -- Villard's pincushion occurs on the
15 escarpment just below Alamogordo. That is a state-listed
16 cactus.

17 Duncan's pincushion occurs all over here, near
18 T or C and the Mud Springs Mountains. That is a State-
19 listed endangered cactus.

20 And down in the Crow Flats area there's the
21 gypsum scale broom that occurs in the Alkali Lakes regions
22 of Crow Flats.

23 And at Cornudas Mountain there's an endangered
24 species of orchid called the shining coral root.

25 There are several other rare plant species out

1 here that do not have any formal protections under the
2 federal or the state law but could be pushed in that
3 direction, depending on what the land management in the
4 area occurs as.

5 For instance, the Guadalupe mescal bean is in the
6 Broke Off Mountains and the lower part of the Guadalupe
7 Mountain escarpment.

8 And just right in here on gypsum is the Guadalupe
9 blazing star and Howard's ringstem, which -- both of those
10 plants were just found ten years ago. They were unknown to
11 science until just ten years ago.

12 Q. The other thing I wanted to ask you is, how
13 complete are the biological studies of the Otero Mesa area?

14 A. Very incomplete. This is probably one of the
15 least botanically and biologically surveyed areas of New
16 Mexico. It's very remote. There hasn't been a lot of
17 agency interest in this area, because a lot of those types
18 of surveys are project driven, so there's been very little
19 survey in that area. I know I haven't looked at it all
20 that much myself.

21 And I mentioned those two plants that were just
22 discovered in the Cornudas Mountains. On the Texas side in
23 the last ten years there's been two new species of ants and
24 a new isopod discovery. So, you know, it's not just all
25 antelope and prairie dogs out there, there's quite a few

1 other endemic species that could be unique to this area
2 that just aren't known yet.

3 MS. BADA: I have no further direct questions.
4 Does the Commission have questions?

5 EXAMINATION

6 BY COMMISSIONER BAILEY:

7 Q. What impact have the hundred or so previously
8 drilled oil and gas wells had on the grasslands and on the
9 endangered species you talked about?

10 A. No impact on the endangered species to this
11 point. I have not personally looked at those hundred
12 wellpads but I'm sure they have roads associated with them,
13 which disturb large linear areas that could influence
14 ecological processes out there, such as roads stop fires.
15 Natural fire is very important in maintaining natural
16 grasslands, and roads stop fires.

17 So there could have been -- you know, it's all
18 incremental. I'm sure each pad disturbed a certain
19 acreage, each road disturbed a certain acreage. But when
20 we're talking about an area that only has 32 percent -- or
21 38 percent of its natural grasslands left, there are
22 incremental impacts that will push that number even higher.

23 Q. Have you seen how many of the wellpads have been
24 revegetated naturally?

25 A. You know, I've only looked at a couple of

1 wellpads in that area, and one was brand new, so I couldn't
2 tell. I looked at an old wellpad and a pipeline running
3 through the area that doesn't look like it's getting much
4 natural vegetation on there.

5 There are a few annual species, native annual
6 species coming in on them. But typically that isn't used
7 as a reclamation criteria because it really doesn't --
8 annual species typically do not support a post-impact land
9 use for, say, livestock grazing or wildlife habitat. And
10 they don't show up every year. When there's insufficient
11 rain they just don't come up, so they're not that useful.
12 We need permanent vegetation coming in on these things.

13 I did see some shrub species come in, but for a
14 grassland, adding more and more shrubs actually degrades
15 the grassland.

16 Q. Talk to me about plant succession order, of how
17 the grasslands become shrublands and how that's becoming
18 more and more apparent in this area, even without oil and
19 gas.

20 A. Okay. Out in this area, recovery -- if that's
21 what you mean, succession, coming back to a climax
22 grassland -- could be very slow, perhaps centuries.
23 Perhaps never at all, if the soils are completely changed.
24 For instance, there's very little of it in Sierra County,
25 but there is some in the Jornada del Muerto.

1 But throughout Doña Ana County and southern Luna
2 County, along the Mexican border, that was all grassland at
3 one time, and now it's nothing but mesquite coppice dunes.
4 The soils have moved away, and they're piled up around very
5 long-lived shrubs. That area is never going to be
6 grassland again.

7 So if you do really dramatic changes out there,
8 recovery probably will not happen at all. There will be a
9 different community, and the plants and animals associated
10 with that community will no longer be there.

11 There are some creosote areas that move into
12 overgrazed areas, especially grazed areas that were
13 overgrazed during severe drought such as the late 1800s,
14 the early 1900s, even the 1950s there was quite a bit of
15 shrub dominance moving into Chihuahuan Desert grasslands in
16 southern New Mexico, simply because they were being
17 overgrazed during really dry periods. That is somewhat
18 ameliorated lately, but it still does occur, and we are in a
19 drought right now.

20 Q. So with all this creosote area, where would they
21 be on the map that we can eliminate them as grassland?

22 A. I think this is a vegetation map.

23 MS. BADA: Yeah, that's right.

24 THE WITNESS: Grasslands are the light yellow
25 color?

1 COMMISSIONER BAILEY: Uh-huh.

2 THE WITNESS: Now, throughout that area there is
3 going to be islands of shrublands. This is very gross
4 scale, but you can see where the grasslands remnants are in
5 this two-county region. Everything that's darker than that
6 is now a shrubland.

7 Q. (By Commissioner Bailey) So what would be the
8 harm of having oil and gas exploration in those areas of
9 the darker yellow and the gray and the other areas that are
10 not grasslands?

11 A. Ah-hah. The Chihuahuan Desert as a whole, the
12 grasslands -- especially in the northern part, the
13 grasslands make it special. Okay? So those are remnants
14 that would be good to keep, because there are whole suites
15 of flora and fauna that depend on that.

16 But not all of it is always grassland. There are
17 gypsum outcrops that support really rare plants and
18 animals, there are isolated mountain ranges that are
19 shrubby with rock outcrop that support really diverse
20 species assemblages of plants and animals. So those in
21 themselves are important as well. I think the whole of the
22 Chihuahuan Desert is important, but there are certain
23 elements that we're losing because of our management of
24 those areas, that deserve greater attention.

25 Q. But are you saying that there are no areas within

1 this vast map location where we don't have grasslands, that
2 we can't have oil and gas either?

3 A. Oh, I didn't say that, no. I'm saying that the
4 Chihuahuan Desert is important. There are certain elements
5 that are more important than others, possibly, and -- Just
6 because it's not a grassland, though, doesn't mean that
7 it's not threatened.

8 I wouldn't say that you can't disturb any of it.
9 There's disturbance going on out there all the time. Not
10 just oil and gas, but there's ranch roads out there,
11 there's towns out there, there's highways, there's ORV
12 traffic, there's all sorts of impacts going on out there.
13 I'm not saying that oil and gas has to stop in all parts of
14 the Chihuahuan Desert. That isn't my point at all.

15 Q. Just for a point of clarification, one of the
16 other folks who gave testimony said that this was the only
17 area for Chihuahuan grassland in North America. You did
18 clarify that this is simply the northernmost area of --

19 A. I think he --

20 Q. -- of a grassland that extends way into Mexico?

21 A. I think the intent was, this is one of the best
22 remnant examples on Otero Mesa of Chihuahuan Desert
23 grasslands left in New Mexico, and I would agree with that.
24 There are some good smaller examples in other places, such
25 as in Sierra County on the bajada of the Black Range, in

1 the Jornada del Muerto and in the Tularosa Basin, but they
2 are much smaller.

3 And there are other grasslands outside of these
4 two counties that are Chihuahuan Desert grasslands.

5 Q. Why do we have a huge area of the upper triangle
6 that's white between Sierra and Otero County? Is there not
7 grassland in through that area too? See how Otero County
8 goes north and south on that western boundary, and then
9 Sierra County comes up at an angle? But yet it appears
10 from the map that we have grasslands throughout the whole
11 area.

12 A. I'm not seeing where you're --

13 Q. North of I-25 --

14 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: She's talking about the white
15 area.

16 Q. (By Commissioner Bailey) The big white
17 triangular area to -- Go south, go south, go south, go
18 south, go east, go east --

19 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: The uncolored.

20 Q. (By Commissioner Bailey) Yeah.

21 A. Oh, this. That's Doña Ana County.

22 Q. Okay.

23 A. And this is Luna County, and this is Hidalgo, and
24 this is Chaves and this is Eddy. They all have Chihuahuan
25 Desert in them.

1 Q. But we're not including that county in this
2 discussion?

3 A. Apparently not. Apparently this discussion
4 centers around the Governor's Order, Executive Order, on
5 the Chihuahuan Desert in these two counties.

6 COMMISSIONER BAILEY: That's all I have.

7 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Commissioner Chavez?

8 EXAMINATION

9 BY COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ:

10 Q. Is there a -- since you've worked in reclamation,
11 do you foresee there's a reclamation land that could be
12 used by the oil and gas industry, or planning for
13 reclamation during drilling production and final
14 abandonment of operations that would minimize impacts or
15 even restore the grasslands after it's done?

16 A. I would love to see that. We've done that with
17 our mining industry in New Mexico already. Mining, all
18 types of mining, but especially coal mining in New Mexico,
19 have very strict regulations on reclamation standards and
20 what can be called successful reclamation. There is no
21 requirement yet, that I'm aware of, in regulation -- to
22 regulate the oil and gas industry on how they leave their
23 sites when they're finished.

24 Q. In studying what's happening with the Chihuahuan
25 Desert, especially that extends outside of New Mexico, the

1 practices that are proposed under this Rule, are they --
2 Have you looked at the other practices, in other parts of
3 the Chihuahuan Desert in Texas and New Mexico?

4 A. No, I have not.

5 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Okay, thanks. That's all.

6 EXAMINATION

7 BY CHAIRMAN FESMIRE:

8 Q. Quick question. When you come into one of these
9 grassland areas and you disturb the soil, dig deep enough
10 to create a pit, does that provide an assured degradation
11 of the grassland? I mean, does that destroy the grassland
12 at least from that point, in the pit area?

13 A. It would if all you're hoping for is for natural
14 revegetation of the site, because what would come in --
15 Once you mix the caliche layer or other subsoil layers with
16 the topsoil layer, you're not going to get grassland back,
17 you're going to get taprooted plants, shrubs and herbaceous
18 plants, that, in that area, just through natural
19 revegetation.

20 If you could top-dress the site with a topsoil
21 material that could support grass growth and successfully
22 seed grass on that area by using an appropriate seed mix
23 and possibly even irrigation for the first couple of years,
24 you could probably get it established as grassland and it
25 would stay that way.

1 Q. But you're telling us that seed mix isn't
2 available commercially?

3 A. No, and I don't know very many operators that
4 would be willing to irrigate the site, especially during a
5 drought period, to ensure that the grass comes in before
6 the other taprooted plants come in.

7 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Ms. Bada, I have no further
8 questions. Do you have a cross-examination, or can we --
9 further direct examination, or can we go to --

10 MS. BADA: I may have some redirect, but let's
11 see if there's any other cross.

12 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Mr. Carr, do you have any
13 cross-examination of this witness?

14 MR. CARR: No, I do not.

15 MS. BELIN: No questions.

16 MS. BADA: I had a couple questions that I wanted
17 to follow up on.

18 FURTHER EXAMINATION

19 BY MS. BADA:

20 Q. You talked earlier about the difference between
21 Sierra and Otero Counties as far as the highland --

22 A. Uh-huh.

23 Q. -- Chihuahuan Desert grasslands. Could you --
24 Are there large areas of that in the other counties?

25 A. Of the high --

1 Q. Of the black grama?

2 A. Black grama grasslands?

3 Q. Yeah.

4 A. There are small areas of it in this county. In
5 the Tularosa Basin, right up around here, is a good example
6 of black grama grassland. In this county there is little
7 spots of it here, but not a big, huge area. And that's
8 about it. So it is kind of a unique area, as far as a
9 desert --

10 Q. So you wouldn't see that in Lea County or Eddy
11 County or --

12 A. In Eddy County it's going to mostly be in playa
13 bottoms and along the valley bottoms and mostly consist of
14 alkali sacaton, which is a much taller grass species and
15 more of a monoculture. It's not nearly as species-diverse.
16 And that's true of a lot of these playa areas, such as the
17 Middle Tularosa Basin.

18 MS. BADA: I have no further questions.

19 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Mr. Carr, I assume you have
20 no --

21 MR. CARR: (Shakes head)

22 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Ms. Belin?

23 MS. BELIN: (Shakes head)

24 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Why don't you call your next
25 witness?

1 MS. MacQUESTEN: The OCD calls Roger Anderson.

2 (Testimony of Robert C. Sivinski was concluded at
3 4:01 p.m., Thursday, June 17th, 2004.)

4 * * *

5
6
7
8 (The following proceedings were had at 8:30 a.m.
9 on Friday, June 18th, 2004:)

10 RACHEL JANKOWITZ,

11 the witness herein, after having been first duly sworn upon
12 her oath, was examined and testified as follows:

13 DIRECT EXAMINATION

14 BY MS. BADA:

15 Q. Good morning, would you please state your name
16 for the record?

17 A. Rachel Jankowitz.

18 Q. And where are you employed?

19 A. New Mexico Department of Game and Fish,
20 Conservation Services Division.

21 Q. How long have you been employed there?

22 A. Since April, 2003.

23 Q. And what are your job responsibilities with the
24 Department of Game and Fish?

25 A. Well, my job title is habitat specialist. I

1 consult with the Energy, Minerals and Natural Resources
2 Department, Mining and Minerals Division, regarding mine
3 permits under the New Mexico Mining Act; I write response
4 letters to requests for our Department's comment on other
5 minerals-related development projects, including oil and
6 gas; and I represent the Department concerning the ongoing
7 hazardous materials cleanup at the old Terrero mine site in
8 Pecos, which is deeded property of the Game and Fish
9 Commission.

10 Q. Where were you employed prior to joining the Game
11 and Fish Department?

12 A. Prior to joining Game and Fish, I was self-
13 employed consultant. The bulk of my work was writing
14 environmental assessments for oil and gas developments in
15 San Juan Basin.

16 Q. And what are your educational qualifications?

17 A. A bachelor of arts degree in biology and a master
18 of science in wildlife management.

19 MS. BADA: At this time I'd like to offer Ms.
20 Jankowitz as an expert in wildlife management.

21 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Any objection from the
22 Commission?

23 COMMISSIONER BAILEY: (Shakes head)

24 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: No objection.

25 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: She's acceptable to the

1 Commission.

2 Q. (By Ms. Bada) First thing I'd like to ask you
3 about is the habitat in the Chihuahuan Desert in Sierra and
4 Otero Counties. What makes the Chihuahuan Desert in those
5 counties important for wildlife?

6 A. The Chihuahuan Desert has one of the world's
7 highest rates of plant diversity, both within the plant
8 communities and on a scale across the landscape. The World
9 Wildlife Fund has ranked the region globally outstanding
10 for species richness in the categories of reptiles, birds,
11 mammals and cacti. There's also a high degree of endovism,
12 which means species whose distributions are limited to a
13 small geographic area.

14 The high diversity of plants is a function of the
15 geographic location, soil and topographic diversity and the
16 history of evolution and response to climate change in that
17 area. And the reason I'm repeating a lot here of what you
18 heard from Bob Sivinski yesterday is because high plant
19 diversity translates largely to high diversity of wildlife
20 habitat.

21 The Chihuahuan Desert environment has been
22 degraded by historic overgrazing and other factors,
23 including loss of the fire regime and excessive diversion
24 of surface water. The grassland component is shrinking in
25 comparison with the area dominated by shrubs. Portion of

1 the Chihuahuan Desert in Sierra and Otero Counties is in
2 relatively intact and functional condition.

3 This area provides a corridor for the
4 connectivity of mobile wildlife between Mexico, trans-Pecos
5 Texas and more northern areas of New Mexico.

6 There's also a variety of freshwater habitats,
7 and these would be springs, cienegas, intermittent streams
8 with high degrees of complexity and endomism, some of which
9 provide home for rare fish and invertebrates. Although the
10 wetlands and watercourses will presumably be protected from
11 surface development, they are potentially vulnerable to
12 changes in water quality and subsurface hydrology.

13 Q. How does the Chihuahuan Desert habitat in these
14 two counties compare to surrounding counties?

15 A. Sierra and Otero Counties have the largest block
16 of intact Chihuahuan Desert grassland. The word "pristine"
17 was raised here yesterday morning, and the area is not
18 pristine, obviously. There's things going on there like
19 the existing gas well, ranching and other surface
20 activities.

21 What we mean by a large block of intact grassland
22 is that the level of impacts in that area is relatively
23 low, leaving the function and a good ecological functioning
24 system, condition.

25 So Chihuahuan Desert natural areas in the boot

1 heel area of New Mexico are part of a different ecological
2 subregion. They have distinct and different conservation
3 concerns.

4 The Chihuahuan Desert areas in Doña Ana County
5 and in the eastern New Mexico counties have relatively
6 heavy impacts from agriculture, urbanization and oil and
7 gas development.

8 With the exceptions of Big Bend and Guadalupe
9 National Parks, most all of the Chihuahuan Desert in Texas
10 is in private ownership. That's not to say it's not being
11 protected, but that is to say that its protected condition
12 could change tomorrow. And much of the Chihuahuan Desert
13 in Texas is also impacted by urbanization and pollution.

14 The northern subregion of the Chihuahuan Desert,
15 which is the region we're talking about, is also subject to
16 extensive urbanization and heavy grazing pressure in the
17 nation of Mexico.

18 Q. Other than threatened and endangered species,
19 what are the key wildlife species in this area?

20 A. Well, the BLM in consultation with our department
21 has designated important mule deer and pronghorn management
22 areas at the Caballo Mountains Deer Area, the Sacramento
23 Escarpment Deer Habitat Area, the Otero Mesa Habitat Area,
24 Nutt Antelope area and the Tularosa and Basin and White
25 Sands Antelope Areas.

1 Based on historic reports, the Otero Mesa
2 pronghorn herd appears to be one of the few herds in New
3 Mexico that survived intensive commercial market hunting in
4 the past and is truly native, not reintroduced.

5 Also important is that grassland birds, as a
6 group of species, have been on the decline across this
7 country. The decline is due to many factors, including
8 habitat fragmentation, pesticide use, and loss of winter
9 habitat to the south.

10 Chihuahuan Desert in Sierra and Otero Counties
11 with its strong grassland component and large blocks of
12 relatively unfragmented habitat is an important habitat
13 that may help prevent the need for federal listing of
14 members of this group of birds.

15 Q. Does the Chihuahuan Desert in these two counties
16 provide areas suitable for desert bighorn sheep
17 reintroduction?

18 A. The desert bighorn sheep is a state-listed
19 endangered species for which the Game and Fish Department
20 operates an active reintroduction and translocation
21 program. Within the area we're talking about today,
22 historic range, which is currently unoccupied by the sheep,
23 occurs in the Caballo and Guadalupe Mountains. The
24 Sacramento Range and escarpment has also been identified as
25 potentially suitable, although there's no evidence of

1 historic populations there.

2 Q. Does it contain any potential habitat or habitat
3 for any threatened or endangered species?

4 A. Yes, the BLM draft EIS for the fluid minerals
5 leasing in Sierra and Otero Counties identified 10
6 federally listed threatened and endangered species and 45
7 other special-status species, and those would be federal
8 candidate and proposed species, State-listed species and
9 BLM species of concern. And I think that those numbers
10 include those half dozen plant listed species that Bob
11 mentioned yesterday, the various listed status.

12 And I'd like to just talk about a couple of
13 animals on those lists.

14 The Aplomado falcon is a state and federally
15 listed endangered species. It reaches the northernmost
16 limit of its total distribution in the southwestern US.
17 This falcon was largely extirpated from the US by the
18 1930s. The last nesting documented in New Mexico until
19 recently was in 1952. Sightings have become more frequent
20 in New Mexico since the 1980s, and last year we believe we
21 had a nesting pair.

22 The Aplomado falcon requires large blocks of
23 grassland with standing yuccas, similar to the slide that
24 we saw yesterday. The Chihuahuan grasslands in Sierra and
25 Otero Counties are prime habitat for the return of this

1 falcon to New Mexico, either through reintroduction or
2 natural recolonization from old Mexico.

3 And another species that's -- for which that area
4 is important is the black-tailed prairie dog, and this is a
5 state-listed species of concern, is its status at the
6 moment. It's a candidate for federal listing. New Mexico
7 Department of Game and Fish has responsibility under a
8 formal multi-state conservation agreement to protect
9 existing colonies and increase statewide distribution to
10 meet multi-state conservation goals, to preclude the need
11 for federal listing.

12 Black-tailed prairie dogs occur on the BLM
13 portion of Otero Mesa in 22 or 23 colonies averaging
14 approximately five acres each. These colonies are
15 important for future conservation efforts because they are
16 some of the last extant populations within the Chihuahuan
17 Desert within the US. They are likely to be uniquely
18 adapted to their very xeric environment and represent most
19 of the few surviving source populations for recovery
20 elsewhere within the arid southern portion of their known
21 historic range.

22 Q. I want to ask you now about whether you've had an
23 opportunity to review the proposed Rules that are the
24 subject of this hearing.

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. And does the Department of Game and Fish support
2 those Rules?

3 A. Yes, we do.

4 Q. Why?

5 A. Above-ground tanks are more protective of
6 wildlife and wildlife habitat than in-ground pits. Pits
7 containing liquid in arid environments are a wildlife
8 attractant. They pose direct hazards of lethal or
9 sublethal toxicity. Oily substances on the exterior of
10 birds and mammals can also reduce the insulation provided
11 by fur and feathers, leading to risk of basically death by
12 exposure or contracting illness by exposure to cold.
13 Predators, scavengers and decomposers consuming
14 contaminated carcasses are potentially placed at risk.

15 Pits also pose a greater possibility than tanks
16 for indirect impact through contamination of surface water,
17 groundwater and soils. Based on what I heard yesterday, I
18 would think that tank pads are -- probably pose a greater
19 ease of reclamation of the vegetation community than does a
20 massively disturbed pit.

21 And we generally support closer regulation of
22 produced-water injection wells due to potential impact on
23 the groundwater, although we're not going to get into
24 commenting on specifics of the injection well rule.

25 Q. Are you familiar with the Oil Conservation

1 Commission's current rules on pits, Rule 50?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. And what concerns does the Game and Fish
4 Department have about the current rules with regard to
5 wildlife and habitat?

6 A. The existing fencing and netting requirements in
7 Rule 50 are not sufficient to protect wildlife in this
8 important habitat area. My answer to this question is kind
9 of a nested series of ifs, because we don't know which way
10 the Commission will decide to go on this.

11 If pits are going to be allowed, we would prefer
12 that the Oil Conservation Division use its authority under
13 the existing Rule to impose additional fencing requirements
14 for protection of wildlife. A wildlife-exclusion fence
15 would be a minimum seven-foot-high chain-link or woven or
16 welded wire mesh, secured to the ground around the
17 perimeter, with the finer-gauge material wrapped around the
18 base to exclude small mammals, reptiles and amphibians.

19 If the post-and-wire-strand livestock-type fence
20 is allowed, the Department would like to have the
21 opportunity to recommend a design that will exclude
22 antelope while minimizing potential injury to mule deer
23 jumping over. And a post-and-wire fence should also be
24 wrapped with finer gauge material around the base.

25 All pits should be netted, including drilling and

1 workover pits, which are accepted in the existing Rule.
2 That Rule was promulgated primarily for the purpose of
3 complying with the Migratory Bird Treaty Act. The
4 Department, however, is equally concerned about the 10
5 species of bat that are listed as species of concern in
6 Sierra and Otero Counties. Drowned or poisoned bats are
7 often overlooked due to their small size, dark color and
8 nocturnal habits.

9 Netting also needs to be extended through the
10 ground around the perimeter and maintained in functional
11 condition.

12 Steep-sided pits present a risk of entrapment to
13 wildlife. When you line them with a smooth-surface
14 material, you enhance that risk of entrapment -- in other
15 words, the difficulty of getting out of the pit. And we
16 would like to see the inclusion of ramps or ladders for the
17 escape of trapped wildlife, and Game and Fish does have
18 design specifications which would be adaptable to that
19 purpose.

20 Q. If tanks are used, what measures need to be in
21 place to protect wildlife?

22 A. Okay, the existing Rule requires that tanks
23 larger than 16 feet diameter be either covered or netted.
24 Game and Fish Department believes that tanks less than 16
25 feet should be similarly protected.

1 To contain contamination following a spill or
2 leak, above-ground tanks should be surrounded by an
3 impermeable berm with capacity greater than that of the
4 tank or tank battery.

5 And at whatever density of roads will exist on
6 the oilfield, the effects of habitat fragmentation can be
7 reduced by lighter traffic volume.

8 To this end, if produced water can't be used
9 onsite for beneficial use, we support piping the water to
10 central collector locations, rather than transport by water
11 truck from individual wellsites. And that pipe should
12 preferably be placed along access roads to minimize the
13 disturbance footprint, and second choice would be placement
14 along existing product pipeline rights of way.

15 MS. BADA: Thanks, I have no further direct
16 questions.

17 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Commissioner Bailey?

18 COMMISSIONER BAILEY: I have a few.

19 EXAMINATION

20 BY COMMISSIONER BAILEY:

21 Q. You talked about these large impacts that are
22 going on right now, the drought that affects the wildlife,
23 the overgrazing that's already destroyed so much of their
24 range, urbanization was a factor that you talked about.
25 Compared to these large, major factors, what impact have

1 the hundred or so oil and gas wells that have already been
2 drilled -- Can you give me a relative importance there, to
3 try to get some perspective?

4 A. Yeah, I think -- You know, the point I was trying
5 to make there was that the level of disturbance currently
6 in the area that we're talking about is lesser than that of
7 similar grassland environments in the surrounding area due
8 to those factors you just mentioned. That's not to say
9 there has been no impact from those existing hundred or so
10 oil and gas wells.

11 And I think I need to give the same answer that
12 Bob Sivinski gave yesterday, which is that the impact of
13 these things is going to be a cumulative impact which is
14 incremental with each development project, and also to keep
15 in mind that in terms of wildlife habitat, the roads
16 involved with the infrastructure are likely to have equal
17 or greater impact than the actual wellpads themselves.

18 Q. And that also applies to only five percent of the
19 area being developed? That's a very low percentage.

20 A. Right, you're talking about the five-percent
21 proposal from the BLM and their --

22 Q. Yes.

23 A. Yeah, yes. Yeah. The answer is that that
24 depends on some factors which I don't know the answer to,
25 and I'm not sure that anybody does, which is where exactly

1 those five percent are and how they would be spaced and how
2 they would be connected by roads.

3 Each road and each wellpad has a zone of impact
4 around it, and it really depends on a whole lot of things
5 that I believe are not specified at this point. And they
6 probably aren't known by the oil and gas industry until
7 they do their exploration.

8 Q. We heard testimony that beneficial use of
9 produced water was being encouraged. If there is the
10 possibility of beneficial use of produced water in this
11 area, would that not help the populations if these tanks
12 were not fenced in accordance with the way you've
13 recommended?

14 A. I don't think that the materials which are placed
15 directly into the tanks, pits, that there's any way to be
16 certain that those materials don't contain toxics.

17 And water that is -- either comes out of the
18 ground clean and is separated from hazardous materials or
19 is -- can be treated to a clean and safe condition, we'd
20 very much support use of that water for beneficial uses.
21 And I would add that the two beneficial uses we would most
22 like to see is on site right at the wellsite, irrigation
23 for re-establishment of native grasses and drinking
24 facilities for wildlife.

25 Q. Then my last question, concerning the antelope

1 herds, is there hunting allowed?

2 A. I believe so, yeah.

3 Q. So those herds are being hunted and killed as we
4 speak?

5 A. Yeah, hunting requires a license from our
6 department, and we have a process every two years, I
7 believe, by which we determine levels of exploitation that
8 the herds can sustain.

9 COMMISSIONER BAILEY: Those are all the questions
10 I have. Thank you.

11 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Commissioner Chavez?

12 EXAMINATION

13 BY COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ:

14 Q. Ms. Jankowitz, one of your qualifications was
15 that you had done assessments about oil and gas development
16 in the San Juan Basin. Did I understand that correctly?

17 A. Yes, sir, environmental assessments under the
18 NEPA process.

19 Q. Was that done for a government agency or --

20 A. Most -- the bulk of the work that I did
21 personally was on the Jicarilla Apache Reservation, and the
22 work was contracted to the Bureau of Indian Affairs.

23 Q. Okay. Is any of that observation helpful to you
24 in reviewing the proposed Rule that the OCD has come up
25 with?

1 A. Absolutely. Yeah, I think as a lot of the
2 testimony brought up yesterday, what you see on paper and
3 what you see in the field are not necessarily the same
4 thing. And just being out there and observing has been
5 tremendously helpful.

6 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Thank you.

7 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Mr. Carr, do you have any
8 cross-examination of this witness?

9 MR. CARR: No, Mr. Chairman, I do not.

10 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Ms. Belin?

11 MS. BELIN: I do not.

12 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Any redirect?

13 MS. BADA: No, thank you.

14 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Call your next witness,
15 please.

16 MS. MacQUESTEN: Thank you. The OCD calls Chris
17 Williams.

18 (Testimony of Rachel Jankowitz was concluded at
19 8:52 a.m., Friday, June 18th, 2004.)

20 * * *

21

22

23

24

25

1 (The following proceedings were had at 2:30 p.m.
2 on Friday, June 18th, 2004:)

3 STEVEN T. FINCH, Jr.,
4 the witness herein, after having been first duly sworn upon
5 his oath, was examined and testified as follows:

6 DIRECT EXAMINATION

7 BY MS. BELIN:

8 Q. Mr. Finch, would you state your name for the
9 record, please?

10 A. My name is Steven T. Finch, Jr.

11 Q. And what is your employment position?

12 A. I'm vice president and senior hydrogeologist at
13 John Shoemaker and Associates.

14 Q. Can you be sure -- This microphone isn't going to
15 amplify you, so you're just going have to --

16 A. Okay.

17 Q. -- amplify your own voice.

18 What is your educational background?

19 A. I have a bachelor's in science, in geology, from
20 Sul Ross State University in Alpine, Texas, with a minor in
21 chemistry. And I also have a master's in science, or a
22 master of science in geology, from Northern Arizona
23 University in Flagstaff, Arizona.

24 Q. And could you give a brief summary of your
25 employment history?

1 A. Yes, I won't go all the way back, but before I
2 started working with John Shoemaker and Associates I had
3 various jobs related to geology, both in the oil and mining
4 industry, and in 1990 I started working with John Shoemaker
5 and Associates as a staff hydrogeologist. And in 1995 Mr.
6 -- or Dr. Shoemaker made me a principal of the firm, and 14
7 years later I'm now vice president.

8 Q. So for the past 14 years you've been a
9 hydrogeologist with John Shoemaker and Associates?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. And did you say that -- did you -- Have you
12 worked for an oil or gas company during your career?

13 A. I briefly worked in San Antonio for a petroleum
14 geologist, or petroleum engineer, as essentially an
15 apprentice geologist, go out and watch activities on
16 various well sites and stuff, workovers, frac jobs, et
17 cetera.

18 Q. Could you give a -- just a thumbnail sketch of
19 the kinds of work you do at John Shoemaker?

20 A. You bet. I have really focused on water resource
21 evaluation, both the quantification of groundwater but also
22 the chemical aspects. A lot of my academic training was in
23 geochemistry, so I've kind of jumped the fence a little bit
24 there.

25 A lot of the projects that I've worked on have

1 ranged from things for -- everything, as far as clients,
2 from a person that owns a domestic well, to industry, State
3 of New Mexico and federal government, and all of those have
4 related to wells and groundwater systems and analysis of
5 those systems, whether to develop or protect them.

6 And more specifically, I've kind of gotten into
7 the realm of modeling, which Dr. Shoemaker mentored me on,
8 and I have developed a lot of regional groundwater fluid
9 models within the State of New Mexico for municipalities
10 and for the -- let's see -- State Engineer, thank you.
11 Some of those models were the Tularosa Basin, Jornada,
12 along the Rio Grande, various different models, San Juan
13 Basin.

14 I've also had some experience with evaluating the
15 feasibility of injection wells in the San Juan Basin as a
16 project I did for the Gas Research Institute, which I now
17 believe they've changed their name to something else.

18 Also kind of in parallel with that project was a
19 fracture study looking at the occurrence of migration
20 pathways for methane and water in the San Juan Basin along
21 the Animas River valley.

22 Locally within the area that we're talking about
23 here today, I've had quite a bit of experience of working
24 in the Tularosa Basin and the Salt Basin, in the Tularosa
25 Basin primarily for the City of Alamogordo and village of

1 Cloudcroft. Well, actually they're on the other side of
2 the -- barely outside of the Tularosa Basin.

3 I'm currently working on the Tularosa Basin
4 National Research Desalinization Facility for the
5 Interstate Stream Commission and have done a detailed study
6 of the Salt Basin, which we have used and revised for this
7 particular, submitted -- or the work has been updated for
8 the Coalition.

9 Q. And describe the nature of your study of the Salt
10 Basin and who you did it for.

11 A. Well, it started off with a regional water plan
12 for the Tularosa and Salt Basin. And then during that time
13 -- I believe that was around 1999 -- the State Engineer
14 became interested in what was going on in the Salt Basin.
15 It was essentially an undeclared area. Very little was
16 known about it.

17 And so then a few years later the Interstate
18 Stream Commission hired us to do essentially an evaluation
19 of the water resources in the Basin. Basically we
20 collected all the data that was available to us and looked
21 at what the possibilities were for developing water to meet
22 compact deliveries related to stream-flow obligations.

23 Q. So you prepared a report for the Interstate
24 Stream Commission on that area?

25 A. I did.

1 Q. And then subsequently you were hired to work in
2 connection with the BLM's land plan amendment for the Otero
3 Mesa area?

4 A. That's correct, I was hired by the Coalition to
5 review the BLM Resource Management Plan and to provide
6 comments based on my understanding of the water resources.

7 Q. And most recently the Coalition asked you to look
8 at the proposed rules that are under consideration at this
9 hearing and prepare the testimony you're preparing today?

10 A. They did, and I submitted comments which include
11 the report that I've prepared that describes the details of
12 the Salt Basin, and a summary letter that was attached to
13 that and a map.

14 MS. BELIN: I would offer Mr. Finch as an expert
15 in hydrogeology.

16 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Any objection?

17 COMMISSIONER BAILEY: No.

18 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: No.

19 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: He's acceptable as such to the
20 Commission.

21 Q. (By Ms. Belin) Thank you. The format we would
22 like to use is that Mr. Finch will go ahead and just make a
23 PowerPoint presentation with his comments. I'll probably
24 just have a few questions at the end, rather than a
25 question-answer dialogue, if that's all right.

1 A. Okay, the map shown on the first slide of the
2 PowerPoint presentation is from the report that I submitted
3 as part of the comments, and it's titled Figure 7.

4 And what I wanted to, or how I envisioned
5 structuring this, was briefly describe why there are
6 important water resources in the Salt Basin area and then
7 kind of give you a brief overview of where those resources
8 are, just basically a description of the Basin since that's
9 -- I think it's been lacking in this hearing -- and then
10 provide some of the conclusions that are laid out in my
11 report, and then finally my opinions related to the
12 proposed Rule.

13 This map, which is Figure 7, shows -- the gray
14 area is the outline of the Salt Basin. And there are
15 several features I'd like to point out. One at the bottom
16 is the Texas-New Mexico state line. And then at the top
17 here, the Sacramento River comes in and essentially dead-
18 ends in an area, a very vast linear feature that goes from
19 the northern or northwestern to southeastern portion of the
20 Basin that we call the Otero Break. And I'll discuss this
21 in more detail here in a minute, but it's a significant
22 hydrologic feature.

23 The little dots on the map represent water wells
24 that we know about, and the yellow areas are areas of
25 water-right applications that have been submitted to the

1 State Engineer.

2 There are a few communities that use the aquifer
3 within the Salt Basin for municipal supply, one being
4 Timberon, which is a small community up in the northwestern
5 corner, right along the Sacramento River. The other is
6 Piñon. And most of the other wells and dots in the -- I
7 would say the western and northern parts of the Salt Basin
8 -- are stock and -- primarily stock and domestic wells,
9 until you get down into an area in the eastern -- the
10 southeastern part which is called Crow Flat. Crow Flat is
11 an area where there's significant irrigation and very
12 productive wells.

13 In addition to Crow Flat you have an area right
14 on the edge called the Dell City Irrigation District in
15 Texas, right along the state line, and you'll see a
16 concentration of wells down there. Those are primarily
17 irrigation wells.

18 My next slide is a picture --

19 COMMISSIONER BAILEY: Before you leave that --

20 THE WITNESS: Yes.

21 COMMISSIONER BAILEY: -- what are the little red
22 squares that are horizontal?

23 THE WITNESS: The little red squares. You know,
24 that is an artifact of the land net, and I'm not really
25 sure -- See, those are township/ranges --

1 COMMISSIONER BAILEY: Yeah.

2 THE WITNESS: -- and I'm not really sure what
3 this part of that overlay -- and it has something to do
4 with the land net, the way a survey was done or something,
5 as far as the township/range stuff. I really don't know.
6 It does look odd.

7 Well, the Otero Mesa area to the west of this has
8 nice grasslands and antelope. To the east we have the
9 irrigation and agricultural areas that I was talking about.
10 This is right along the state line looking east. In the
11 background there, you see the Guadalupe Mountains, and many
12 of these wells produce over 2000 gallons per minute. It's
13 very significant.

14 The first thing that I did when I started
15 researching the Salt Basin was, I pulled up everything that
16 I knew, or that I can find, and so I wanted to describe
17 basically some of the major work that's been done on the
18 area that I think has been overlooked by a lot of people.

19 In the 1950s the State Engineer did an assessment
20 on the groundwater conditions in Crow Flat, which is east
21 of Otero Mesa. And then -- or sometime after that, 1995,
22 there's some work done by Mayer, which he did his PhD
23 dissertation, and his advisor, Dr. Sharp -- They're both
24 from the University of Texas at Austin. And they studied
25 the Otero Break and the whole Salt Basin in great detail.

1 Mayer went out and mapped out all the fractures and
2 provided great information on the types of fracturing, the
3 distribution of them, and went to describe structurally how
4 those occur, or why they're there, and also developed a
5 groundwater flow model of the Basin.

6 Shortly -- maybe during the same time or
7 thereafter, the New Mexico Water Resource Research
8 Institute did a nice overview of water resources in the
9 Salt Basin area and their trans-boundary aquifers of the El
10 Paso and Las Cruces report that was one in several series,
11 and then finally of the Tularosa and Salt Basin Regional
12 Water Plan. We provided a lot of detail on the resources
13 in that water plan, more than you see in the other regional
14 water plans of the State.

15 This is my third slide, and it's really a
16 generalized geologic map. It is also Figure 2 of the
17 report that I've submitted as comments.

18 And basically what I wanted to show you are these
19 regions that are divided by these green lines, and all of
20 them except for the one in the Crow Flat area and down in
21 the Salt Lakes, into Texas, by Dell City -- all those are
22 -- there's bedrock at the surface, essentially, and it's
23 primarily of Permian age, with the exception of right in
24 the Otero Mesa area there's a series of hills, the Cornudas
25 Mountains, which are, you know, volcanic intrusions and

1 things like that, that have come up.

2 One thing that I wanted to discuss or mention
3 briefly about the water use from our previous map is that
4 -- just to give you some numbers of what's going on in the
5 Salt Basin, currently there's about 50,000 acre-feet of
6 water rights that have been declared, and there's
7 approximately 15,000 to 20,000 acre-feet of water that's
8 historically been put to beneficial use.

9 Jumping back into the geology here, what I want
10 to do is just show you what we -- some of the cross-
11 sections that we put together, essentially to look at the
12 vertical profiles of the aquifers. Here we have A-A',
13 which is east to west on the north end of the Basin. And
14 then down here is B-B'. Essentially it runs parallel to
15 the state line. And I think this will give a good idea of
16 what the aquifer looks like, and I'll point out some key
17 features there.

18 Now, these cross-sections were developed from
19 geologic mapping of what few -- or little data we had from
20 wells, and also what the expected thickness or the measured
21 thicknesses of those units are, the geologic units are in
22 that area.

23 What you see here is, the blue primarily
24 represents the Permian-age rocks, which are carbonate
25 rocks. And then the red down here is primarily

1 Precambrian. There is a big section of rock missing from
2 the Permian to Precambrian that was eroded off in the
3 northern part of the Basin.

4 If you'll look at the scale on the -- the
5 vertical scale on the map, each one of those numbers
6 represents a thousand feet. And you'll see that the
7 aquifer is approximately 1000 to 2000 feet thick in this
8 region.

9 The black vertical line right here is called
10 Number 1 -- I can't read it, but anyway that's an oil and
11 gas exploration well, so we do have a control point there.
12 These other black lines with the up-and-down arrows on them
13 represent faults. And the faults -- those signify the
14 northern part of what makes the Salt Basin, which is a
15 graben feature. It's where rocks have been faulted and
16 essentially dropped down.

17 Let's see, go to the next one.

18 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Excuse me, you're saying
19 that blue line is the water table?

20 THE WITNESS: That blue line is the water table
21 at that point, and that's the regional water table. Thank
22 you for helping me out there. There are also, in some of
23 these arroyos and channels, there are perched water. So
24 the depth of water, I'll touch on in a minute, is quite
25 variable throughout the Basin. And I'll explain that. I

1 guess the next map would be my opportunity to do that.

2 Back to the geologic map that we had. Depth of
3 water in the northern part up here, based on some of the
4 wells that I've been involved with for the community of
5 Timberon, ranges anywhere from 30 to 200 feet.

6 As you get out into the center of the Basin, the
7 depth of water varies quite a bit, depending on whether
8 it's a localized perched system or a regional system. And
9 the measurements that I've seen range from one to five
10 hundred feet.

11 Around the Cornudas Mountains, the same kind of
12 thing. You'll see a lot more perched water, because it's a
13 significant area of recharge. And I'd like to show my next
14 cross-section, which goes through the Cornudas Mountains
15 and down along the southern part of the Salt Basin.

16 As you can see, the blue line represents the
17 water table on the regional system. Like I said, there
18 will be shallower perched systems above that. A lot of the
19 wells are in the perched system, and there are -- I'd say
20 about half and half in the perched and in the regional
21 system.

22 One thing that you can deem from this cross-
23 section is that there's a lot of faulting that's been
24 mapped, and -- plus with some well control. We know that
25 those formations, there's blocks of them and they're

1 essentially stepped down to the east, and some around the
2 Cornudas Mountains might be fairly high or closer to the
3 land surface.

4 The blue color represents the Permian-age rocks
5 again, that carbonate aquifer that I'm talking about, which
6 is mainly the San Andres and the Yeso, similar to what the
7 Roswell-Artesian Basin is composed of.

8 And this pink color here are the older rocks,
9 sedimentary rocks, that from what I gather, reviewing the
10 oil and gas logs, that's where some of the shows have been,
11 in the Mississippian age, which probably might be in the
12 middle of that pink section.

13 I would also like to make one other comment about
14 the deeper rocks. Farther south and into Texas, right on
15 the other side of the state line, I've reviewed some
16 information on an oil/gas well that was done by Texaco
17 years ago, and it was drilled down to, I believe, a little
18 over 3000 feet. And they collected a water sample from the
19 Fusselman formation, which is in the lower part of this
20 pink stuff. And they took a water sample, and their
21 analysis showed it was around 2000 to 2500 part-per-million
22 water, which is fairly fresh for that depth.

23 There have been other publications that said
24 there's a likelihood of fresh water at depth in this
25 region, but with no specifics. Essentially one indication

1 is that the lack of salts -- we've been talking about salt
2 beds, but the lack -- there are salt beds or gypsum
3 deposits in the Yezo formation. The lack of them indicates
4 a flushing effect, which means fresh water has moved
5 through that system.

6 This slide is Figure 5 from my report, which
7 shows groundwater or water-level contours, and this
8 particular slide also shows the Salt Basin in New Mexico,
9 as well as the portion in Texas. It extends fairly far
10 into Texas, from Dell City on south, close to --
11 essentially all the way, practically, to Van Horn, Texas.

12 Q. (By Ms. Belin) Are the black numbers elevations?

13 A. The black numbers are elevations of the water-
14 level con- -- that represent the water-level contours, yes.
15 And the blue arrows are flow directions.

16 Now, one thing I would like to point out here
17 that to me is significant as a hydrogeologist, the closer
18 these lines are, the tighter their formation is and the
19 less permeable the water -- I mean the slower the flow of
20 water is, and the less will flow through that particular
21 section of water. As they open up, means the formation has
22 a greater transmissivity, it's able to move the water out
23 faster.

24 Where these lines are greatly separated right
25 here in the central part of the Basin, actually a good part

1 of the Basin, that's the Otero Break. And the Otero Break
2 essentially consists of a group of fractures and faults and
3 extremely high-density -- or high fracture density in areas
4 right at the -- from where the Sacramento River stops, all
5 the way to Dell City.

6 One thing we do not know is how deep these
7 fractures are and the faulting. I suspect they're fairly
8 continuous and deep. Essentially, it's a structure that's
9 been reactivated from Pennsylvanian time, which means it
10 was a structure that developed in those lower pink rocks,
11 and then as the Permian rocks were overlaying it
12 reactivated. So it's likely that it's fairly deep-seated,
13 these -- this fracture system.

14 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: What number is that?

15 THE WITNESS: That is Figure 5 --

16 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Figure 5 --

17 THE WITNESS: -- from my report.

18 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: -- thank you.

19 THE WITNESS: The well -- the oil -- or the gas
20 test well I was talking about that had the fresh water down
21 to 3000 feet was right over here, approximately 20 miles
22 south of the state line, south of Otero Mesa.

23 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Those elevations are sea
24 level?

25 THE WITNESS: That is correct, that's feet above

1 sea level.

2 One thing, I did talk a little bit about the
3 water use, but I haven't really mentioned anything about
4 the recharge. And one of my big points about -- or the
5 things that I've learned about this system is that it's a
6 very large regional system. The Salt Basin, and
7 particularly the Otero Mesa area, is a recharge area. It's
8 -- You can see where all these flow lines are flowing
9 towards the Otero Break, which essentially collects water
10 and discharges it down to the Salt Lakes south of Dell
11 City. But the recharge is primarily here where the
12 fracturing is. There's also fracturing around the Cornudas
13 mountains where the intrusions came up and essentially
14 broke through the rocks around it.

15 This particular figure is appended in the report
16 that I've provided, and essentially it's from Mayer and his
17 PhD dissertation. And like I said, he went out and mapped
18 the fractures, and that was a quite easy job for him. You
19 can see here, this is the exposed rock, and that's a
20 fracture, and so is this. And that's his dog up here. You
21 read the title and it says, 45-pound dog for scale.

22 This is primarily exposed rock, and then the thin
23 veneer of soil is what you see in the background. That's
24 typically what I've seen in a lot of the Otero Mesa area,
25 particularly in the Otero Break, is a thin veneer soil,

1 lots of fractures.

2 The recharge, quantity of recharge, has been
3 estimated by several, including myself. But the estimates
4 range from anywhere from 30 to 200,000 acre-feet a year,
5 which is a lot. The 200,000 acre-feet a year I'm not
6 buying. The 30 to maybe 75 is definitely more in the right
7 ballpark.

8 Even given that, for how arid this climate is and
9 the elevation, lack of snowfall and stuff like that, that
10 is a significant amount of water. And what that means is
11 that in order to have that much recharge you have to have a
12 mechanism to efficiently really water from the surface to
13 the ground, and that's indicative of the fracturing.

14 Let's see. The one thing I haven't discussed is
15 water quality, and I couldn't -- within the short time
16 frame I couldn't find a nice map that would demonstrate it,
17 but there are maps that we've developed that show the
18 distribution of water quality in the Tularosa and Salt
19 Basin Regional Water Plan, which was adopted by the
20 Interstate Stream Commission in 2002. But if I can just
21 use my pointer, I think that might suffice.

22 Primarily, everything except for the Dell City
23 and maybe part of the Cornudas Mountain area is less than
24 1000 part-per-million water. There is limited data on
25 that, but we have fairly good coverage. And --

1 Q. (By Ms. Belin) When you say 1000 parts-per-
2 million water, you mean 1000 parts TDS?

3 A. Correct, that's what I'm referring to, total
4 dissolved solids. Essentially fresh water and -- what I
5 call fresh water. I know the oil and gas industry has a
6 looser term for fresh water sometimes.

7 In the Dell City area the water is, although
8 saltier -- and the reason why that is is because it's near
9 the Salt Lakes or the playas, but also because of the
10 extensive irrigation that's been going on for the last 50,
11 60 years, they've had a lot of return flow and kind of a
12 little issue with salting of the water locally from
13 agriculture.

14 The particular map I have up as a slide now is
15 one that I submitted with my letter as part of the comment,
16 and it shows many things. And it gets fairly complicated,
17 but essentially I wanted to show everything I could on one
18 map.

19 It has the water level contours, so you know the
20 direction of flow, with the arrows. This brown line that
21 covers a good portion of the Salt Basin, essentially the
22 area of high fracture density that Mayer has identified,
23 taken directly from his report. And then the light green
24 coverage is from the BLM Resource Management Plan, which is
25 the area that they claim has some -- I guess medium or

1 moderate oil and gas potential.

2 And there's some land ownership coverage here.
3 The gray, which is also underneath this green -- it looks
4 like a darker green -- that particular overlay represents
5 the BLM land. You can see it's predominantly BLM.

6 Okay, I know I've missed some things, but
7 hopefully I'll get questions where I can fill those gaps
8 in. But I think I'll just go -- to save time, I'll just go
9 right into my opinions that I've provided as public
10 comment, and I'm just going to read them right off my
11 PowerPoint slides, which makes it easier for me, and then
12 conclude.

13 The first thing is that I think the proposed Rule
14 is a good start, it's in the right direction for protecting
15 water resources. I can probably talk all day on how
16 valuable the water resources are. I know the Interstate
17 Stream Commission would like to see those preserved for
18 future use, as well as the Governor.

19 And the next bullet is essentially what I've
20 pointed out. Given the geologic setting, which means the
21 fractured rock, the lack of soil cover and the subsequent
22 vulnerability of groundwater to contamination, the
23 potential for leaks and spills needs to be eliminated to
24 the maximum extent to protect known water resources.

25 I got the impression through listening to

1 testimony from the last day and a half of the hearing that
2 people don't feel like they know a whole lot about the Salt
3 Basin, and they probably don't. But I'm glad I'm here,
4 because I feel fairly comfortable -- I've had five years of
5 time to study the Salt Basin and I feel like it's a known
6 water resource. We've quantified how much is there in the
7 regional water plan, and for the Interstate Stream
8 Commission's interest.

9 The groundwater in other areas has been impacted
10 from oil and gas operations. I think that's been well
11 demonstrated. Even though they're from older operations
12 and the Rules might have been different at that time, they
13 probably thought the Rules were great. They weren't good
14 enough. We're learning all the time, and through that
15 learning process, things eventually need to change.

16 I guess my comment on that is, Otero and Sierra
17 County should not be put at risk to suffer the same
18 consequences.

19 My opinions regarding pits, digging pits where
20 there is little or no topsoil and fractured rock, I don't
21 see how that's really a viable protective measure, or
22 really economical. In the water-well business we wouldn't
23 even -- we'd do a closed-loop system. It's just cheaper.
24 I know there are differences in scale of depth, size of
25 hole, all those kind of things, but I think there's room to

1 be able to modify things to meet those objectives.

2 The proposed Rule does not allow for pits, which
3 I think is good, and supported by the things that I've
4 observed and I've presented here today. Depth to water, we
5 know, is less than 100 feet in many places. The fracturing
6 is well documented, and there's a driving force for
7 migration of surface spills. Essentially it's the
8 recharge. If it spills out and becomes soil contamination,
9 the recharge will drive it back in if it's not mitigated
10 within a quick time frame.

11 Also, I think this has been discussed, but there
12 are other things that are used in the oil and gas drilling,
13 and I think the closed-loop system in the pits are a good
14 idea when you -- it gives you the freedom to be able to use
15 those things without worrying about the environmental
16 consequences.

17 I know, for instance, I've seen a few cases where
18 dealing with stuck pipe you'll have to circulate with
19 diesel to get the stuck pipe out. Oil-based muds have
20 quite a bit of diesel in them. I think I'd want to recover
21 as much as I could. And I wouldn't even really recommend
22 that in this particular area with the degree of fracturing.

23 For the injection wells, I'm not really sure if
24 there's a zone viable for injecting produced water, unless
25 if you inject it back into the zone you took it from, which

1 would be not in the interest of the industry.

2 There's a lot of unknowns as far as how deep-
3 seated the regional freshwater groundwater flow system is,
4 and I think given the structural setting it's probably
5 likely it's there.

6 Also, with the fracturing and faulting there's a
7 high potential for vertical migration. Even if you make
8 the most beautiful Class I injection well, you can still
9 contaminate the aquifer, freshwater aquifer, through these
10 preferential pathways of faults and fractures. I don't
11 think it's worth the risk to do it.

12 And then just some other things to conclude with,
13 food for thought that I kind of picked up yesterday.

14 The water-well drilling methods are designed to
15 protect the aquifer. They're quite different than oil and
16 gas operations. Although we both do the same thing, we're
17 trying -- I'm not saying oil and gas operations don't
18 protect the aquifer. The primary method of a water well is
19 to extract water, so you're going to do everything you can
20 to maximize its production and maintain its integrity,
21 while the oilfield and oil and gas industry has a similar
22 objective, but mainly more focused for the resource they're
23 trying to get. And a lot of times in lost-circulation
24 zones, which might be freshwater zones, they'll use lost-
25 circulation material, cement or whatever, which really, to

1 me, kind of -- what it does is, it ruins the porosity of
2 the aquifer. It's not good for -- especially a fractured
3 system. If someone wants to have a nearby well, it might
4 limit that ability to do that.

5 The leaks that might incur from not -- using
6 these -- the proposed Rule, from the past methods,
7 essentially from buried piping, they're very difficult to
8 detect in fractured rock settings. I've seen this in water
9 systems. You'll have high water loss, you don't know where
10 it's coming from.

11 And the last thing is, the water resource beneath
12 the Salt Basin is -- it's really only an asset to the State
13 of New Mexico if it remains protected and contaminant-free.

14 Right now, I remember Mr. Core saying that the
15 feasibility of exporting water out of the Salt Basin to,
16 say, the Pecos River or whatever was very low or
17 negligible. Well, it would be even less if the resource is
18 contaminated, and it kind of lessens our options to do
19 things like that.

20 Q. I have just a couple of wrap-up questions.

21 A. Okay.

22 Q. Why, in your opinion -- why do you think that
23 injection wells should be prohibited in this area covered
24 by the Rule, as opposed to regulated as the Rule proposes?

25 A. Because I think there are areas that -- like I

1 said, you can construct a -- you can go through all the
2 motions. You can do the calculations using the Tice
3 equation, which doesn't apply to fractured rock. You can
4 do all these things, even select another method, look at
5 the -- you know, go through the motions of the regulations
6 which are good in most cases.

7 But here, I think you still have the probability,
8 or a high probability, of affecting a freshwater resource,
9 mainly because of the fracturing and the depth at which it
10 can occur. There's not much -- to my mind, there's not
11 much separation between -- from what I know, between what
12 might be the injection zone and the freshwater aquifer.

13 Q. Given all of your experience looking at water
14 resources around the state, do you believe that the water
15 resources in the area covered by this Rule are an
16 extraordinary resource that deserve special protection?

17 A. Yes, I do, and that's -- I mean, I think the
18 State has always had that in mind, in other areas as well,
19 in their protection measures, to do that. But yes, I think
20 this one is particularly of interest.

21 And it's not uncommon -- it's actually analogous
22 in some ways to the Edwards Aquifer in central Texas.
23 They've established a non-degradation policy where in the
24 recharge zone there's no such activity for potential
25 contamination.

1 Q. Because of the importance of this aquifer for --

2 A. Or that aquifer, right, that's right.

3 Q. And just so I understand, what are the
4 hydrological problems that come from digging pits in areas
5 of fractured rock with just a little bit of topsoil. Why
6 do you think you shouldn't put pits in that kind of
7 geology?

8 A. Well, you hit -- I mean, to dig a pit you'd have
9 to excavate the rock, essentially. And a lot of times what
10 a contractor will do is blast it out, which just magnifies
11 the problem of the fracturing issue. And then you don't
12 have a nice, even surface -- and I believe this was talked
13 about by -- I've forgotten, maybe Mr. Olson -- where a
14 liner or such can fail through a puncture.

15 It's just not worth the risk, I don't see the
16 benefit. If I was a contractor, I wouldn't -- I'd rather
17 do the closed-loop system.

18 Q. Is there anything else you want to add to your
19 testimony?

20 A. I think I've done my -- my part.

21 MS. BELIN: I have no further questions.

22 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Commissioner Bailey?

23 EXAMINATION

24 BY COMMISSIONER BAILEY:

25 Q. Your reference to the Edwards Aquifer is rather

1 interesting since their issues have to do with resort
2 hotels, golf courses, parking lots or shopping malls.
3 Somehow I don't see Mall of America in Timberon.

4 A. No, you don't, but they also deal with -- Well,
5 you never know about Timberon. They have, you know, high
6 hopes. They did before their spring dried up. But it's
7 the principle of protecting a recharge zone. You don't
8 have to have a shopping mall or whatever. There's -- They
9 also have special visions for underground storage tanks,
10 well drilling, of provisions. There are many other things,
11 rather than just what can be built on top of the recharge
12 zone.

13 Q. Would a better comparison be right here in New
14 Mexico, in the Carlsbad area, in the Dark Canyon area, and
15 have special cementing provisions have been instituted for
16 wells drilled throughout the fractured limestones?
17 Wouldn't that be a more equal kind of comparison?

18 A. Well, you know, that's -- I'm interested in that,
19 and I'm not as familiar, or I'm not familiar with that
20 particular example that you've provided.

21 Q. Another thing that's crossed my mind is that this
22 Application has to do with Otero County and Sierra
23 County --

24 A. That's correct.

25 Q. -- but there's been very little testimony at all

1 for water resources or implications for Sierra County. I'm
2 just curious why we should include Sierra County when we're
3 talking Otero County water supplies?

4 A. Well, that's a very good question. I've done
5 quite a bit of work in Sierra County, as well as Otero and
6 the Tularosa Basin, and the geology is quite different.
7 And I believe Mr. Core testified to that.

8 My primary focus was the Salt Basin, and the
9 reason why is because it stands out from the rest because
10 of its characteristics. I don't think you see those
11 characteristics in the other parts of Sierra County or
12 Otero.

13 Q. But you don't have any testimony for us to
14 include Sierra County in our consideration of the --

15 A. I would be -- If you have an area in particular,
16 I would be more than glad to provide testimony with what I
17 know.

18 Q. You said that 50,000 acre-feet had been declared
19 in the lower Otero County area, 20,000 acre-feet storage
20 use. Do you know what the beneficial use is or is
21 anticipated to be for those 70,000 acre-feet?

22 A. Maybe that was confusing. There's 50,000 acre-
23 feet per year of declared water right. Of those declared
24 rights, on the average, approximately 20 have been put to
25 beneficial use.

1 Q. Oh, okay, I just had that wrong. The beneficial
2 use, is that irrigation in Dell City?

3 A. No, that's irrigation in Crow Flats, that's
4 municipal supply in Timberon and Piñon and all the other
5 little -- you know, if you add up all the stock wells, all
6 those things. It's a combination.

7 Q. So there is some beneficial use within New
8 Mexico?

9 A. That is all in New Mexico. The Dell City
10 portion, if you go right on the other side of the state
11 line in Dell City, they pump over 100,000 acre-feet a year,
12 and the City of El Paso is currently gearing up to spend
13 \$700 million to put a -- to buy good portions of that and
14 pipe it to El Paso.

15 Q. With that high transmissivity within the Salt
16 Basin, does that mean, then, that the rule of capture is
17 applying here, that we are being drained by the Texas
18 interests?

19 A. It does. The main thing, what we haven't -- the
20 one reason why we haven't seen effects of great magnitude
21 historically is because the return flows have been
22 significant from the irrigation. Once El Paso starts to
23 pump it, there will no longer be return flows.

24 Q. And so New Mexico will lose its resource through
25 use in Texas?

1 A. To me, it is a very important card in the deck,
2 with our ongoing water war with Texas. And New Mexico has
3 the opportunity to develop that water and come up with good
4 plans to use it, which would put the breaks on the Texas
5 side, and that would be an extremely good negotiation tool
6 for New Mexico.

7 Q. But at this time we're losing our water
8 resources, we're not getting taxes from use of our
9 resources if we offer oil and gas and coal --

10 A. Uh-huh.

11 Q. -- and uranium and other natural resources of the
12 State --

13 A. That's right.

14 Q. -- we're not getting taxes, we're not getting
15 royalties. So the beneficial use to New Mexico is only for
16 a couple of small towns and a couple of ranches?

17 A. Well, and of that 20,000 acre-feet, I'd say 80
18 percent of it is agriculture and Crow Flat. So that's
19 fairly -- you know, that's fairly significant, you know,
20 10,000 to 15,000 acre-feet a year of irrigation is nothing
21 to sneeze at.

22 Q. Figure 2 shows the regional geology.

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. Has the northwestern portion showing as the Yeso
25 formation and not the San Andres, which is more towards the

1 center and towards the Dell City area.

2 A. That's correct.

3 Q. Is the water quality in the Yeso as clean as the
4 water quality around Dell City?

5 A. The wells that I've tested in the Timberon area
6 are in the Yeso, and that's very fresh water. It's less
7 than 500 milligrams per liter total dissolved solids.

8 Q. So -- You gave an example of water quality only
9 around the Dell City area. I was looking for water quality
10 more --

11 A. Oh --

12 Q. -- in other areas.

13 A. -- right, most of the Basin is 1000 milligrams
14 per liter total dissolved solids, or less.

15 Q. That's what I was getting at.

16 A. We're blessed with the good quality of water,
17 Texas is blessed with the ability to pump it from us.

18 Q. The intense fracturing is in the Otero Breaks
19 area; is that what I understood you to say?

20 A. That's correct, and -- surrounding the Otero
21 Break area, yes.

22 Q. What is the fracturing like in the other areas?
23 Is it as widespread, or is it as conducive for
24 transportation or whatever you call it in water?

25 A. Well, the map I showed, this brown line is

1 essentially the area that Mayer identified as extensive
2 fracturing. I'd have to go back and look at his report,
3 exactly how far he went to the west and east of that. But
4 I'm not -- it's -- Primarily my understanding is that when
5 you go back and look at the geologic map, the only place
6 where there's not bedrock exposed at the surface or the --
7 you know, the Yesso or San Andres, is in the Crow Flat,
8 which is essentially a small -- it's in the middle of the
9 graben where sediments have filled in, so there wouldn't be
10 fracturing there, except for below that.

11 Q. I'm looking for areas that don't have as high a
12 potential for transmissivity as you have indicated, such as
13 maybe in the northwestern area?

14 A. In the far north area, when you get up into the
15 mountains, the Sacramento Mountains, where these water-
16 level contours are fairly tight, around the communities of
17 Timberon and Piñon and north, I'd say it's less fractured
18 there, from my -- from what I know.

19 Q. So the testimony concerning the fracturing in the
20 pipelines, as you have it, to Dell City --

21 A. Uh-huh.

22 Q. -- would not be as apparent everywhere, and there
23 could be areas where the threat to groundwater as pictured
24 by so many people over the last two days is not as
25 threatening?

1 A. There may be localized areas, but even localized
2 -- it depends on what your zone of influence is, as far as
3 an injection well. In addition to the fracturing, there's
4 the faulting that we showed on the map, that offsets the
5 blocks, you know, essentially forms the Salt Basin graben.

6 So I think it's very complex. I'd be reluctant
7 to say there's an area that's not vulnerable or susceptible
8 in this particular region, Salt Basin.

9 Q. Including Sierra County?

10 A. No, I'm speaking just for the Salt Basin. Sierra
11 County and the remainder of Otero County, it's quite
12 variable. As Mr. Core testified to, you have the Rio
13 Grande Rift, you know, the basin there. If you go out in
14 the middle of the Tularosa Basin, essentially, you know,
15 it's where the extremely saline water is, but it's also
16 essentially mud. I mean, there's clay and silt. There's
17 no fracturing there.

18 Q. Did you map the location of the hundred or so oil
19 and gas wells to overlay your location of other wells in
20 that --

21 A. I do have those locations, but I don't have that
22 with me today.

23 Q. Could you see any impact from the previous oil
24 and gas drilling on water wells?

25 A. I don't -- that assessment has not been done.

1 That would be quite an elaborate study all in itself.

2 Q. But for your purposes, you did not see any
3 indications?

4 A. I don't think I can answer that question. I do
5 not have the data to support it either way.

6 COMMISSIONER BAILEY: Those are all the questions
7 I have.

8 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Commissioner Chavez?

9 EXAMINATION

10 BY COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ:

11 Q. Yes, in your slide titled Geology of Salt Basin,
12 or Salt Basin --

13 A. Right, it was one of those cross-sections?

14 Q. Yes, I think that one right there.

15 A. Okay.

16 Q. I think it was the one before that --

17 A. Okay, that --

18 Q. -- with the same title.

19 A. Let's see, there's Figure 4 and Figure 3.

20 Q. That's the one I'm --

21 A. Okay.

22 Q. What you're showing there as the regional water
23 table, that's the first occurrence of groundwater, is that
24 what you're --

25 A. No, it's not.

1 Q. Okay, maybe I'm misunderstanding. What does that
2 mean?

3 A. That is the regional water table. There are
4 perched systems, as I described a lot of times, like along
5 this geologic contact or in these valleys, there will be
6 perched water that is essentially migrating down to the
7 regional system. And you've got to remember, this is in
8 the far north area, at the tail end of the Sacramento
9 Mountains.

10 Q. Okay, so the water depth there, let's say right
11 above where that little wording is, Otero Mesa, let's say
12 the high point to just under the -- if you go down to the
13 R, from there to the water table, we're looking at a
14 distance of perhaps almost 2000 feet?

15 A. That's correct, in that particular area.

16 Q. Okay. And there doesn't seem to be any break
17 because of the grabens for the regional table there on the
18 right side of your graph. It seems like the regional water
19 table is continuous regardless of what the geology shows
20 with the grabens. Is that what that was indicating?

21 A. You mean the faulting doesn't affect the --

22 Q. Doesn't appear to affect the --

23 A. -- affect it as much?

24 Q. Right.

25 A. That's correct. My understanding is that a lot

1 of the faulting -- you know, faults can be barriers or
2 conduits, and I guess it depends on which formation is
3 offset from the other, but in this region the Yeso and the
4 San Andres are fairly similar. There's not a big offset of
5 totally different geologic units to cause a feature like
6 that.

7 Q. Okay. In the very center of that slide, you show
8 that regional water table with a bit of a dip in it --

9 A. Right.

10 Q. -- and yet you show the direction of flow
11 downward?

12 A. Yeah, that is confusing. I need to probably
13 brush that up a little bit.

14 Q. How would it look if you brushed it up?

15 A. I would probably take that one arrow out that's
16 dipping down in the middle of that dip.

17 Q. Well, then on either side of it you have water
18 flowing towards the center.

19 A. Right, then it's flowing out this way like a
20 trough. This is only a cross-sectional plane, so there's
21 another dimension we're not looking at.

22 Q. Okay. Then let's take a look at the other,
23 similarly titled, the B slide, that one there.

24 A. Okay.

25 Q. I guess according to those mountains with those

1 intrusions there, we have the same type of effect. There's
2 no apparent change in water across there.

3 A. That's right, it's fairly -- from previous work
4 that's been done by -- oh, I can't remember exactly who it
5 was. It might have been somebody that -- New Mexico Tech
6 was one paper, and then the City of El Paso has had me
7 review their model of the area. And essentially the
8 Cornudas Mountains is a highly fractured zone where it's
9 radial flow of recharge away from it.

10 You can't determine the radial-flow from this --
11 a cross-section like this.

12 Q. Okay. You showed a slide where the fractures
13 were right at the surface of the ground with very little
14 soil, and you mentioned the -- There you go. How typical
15 is that in the Otero Mesa area that -- the notation
16 underneath says a fracture zone in Otero Mesa. Is this
17 what might call typical of Otero Mesa, with this type of
18 rock exposure with little soil?

19 A. You know, I've driven through the Otero Mesa
20 area, Salt Basin, several times, and it's such a vast
21 region. And I don't live there, so I'd be reluctant to say
22 how typical this is. This is what Mayer presented as
23 typical in his PhD dissertation.

24 Q. Okay. Now to the Figure 5 illustration that you
25 have. There you go. You attribute the high

1 transmissibility to fractures. Now, we're talking about
2 the same water -- regional water table that you showed in
3 that other slide, the B-B' slide --

4 A. Correct.

5 Q. How -- Maybe I don't understand here. How is it
6 determined that is more attributable to fractures than to
7 some other connectivity of the natural permeability of the
8 lithology of the rock itself?

9 A. Well, I took it from the PhD dissertation by
10 Mayer and his advisor, Jack Sharp. They're the ones that
11 did the very detailed study. And that's what I reference
12 for this. The high-yielding wells that transect along that
13 line also -- you know --

14 Q. So fracture permeabilities --

15 A. Fracture permeability has also been verified by
16 well drilling, water-well drilling --

17 Q. Oh, okay.

18 A. -- in the southern part.

19 Q. This is kind of an odd one. Yesterday Mr. Core
20 referenced a fault and I wasn't able to get back to him.
21 Did you hear his testimony about a fault in Otero?

22 A. I vaguely recall that.

23 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Okay. Well, I just
24 wondered if there was something generalized there that --
25 it came up, that you might know about.

1 That's all that I have, thank you.

2 EXAMINATION

3 BY CHAIRMAN FESMIRE:

4 Q. I do need to follow up on something Commissioner
5 Bailey said. I too don't understand the idea of 50,000
6 acre-feet of water rights and 20,000 acre-feet of
7 beneficial use. Having spent some time at the State
8 Engineer's Office, I thought those numbers would be pretty
9 close together.

10 A. What happens is, say, a rancher, or a farmer or a
11 a town or whoever, drills a well and then they file a
12 declaration for a water right associated with that.
13 Typically they'll file their declaration based on either --
14 let's take the farmer as an example. He's got a hundred
15 acres he wants to irrigate, and his well will make 300
16 acre-feet. So he gets three acre feet per acre over his
17 farm. That will be what he declares.

18 Now maybe over time, in reality, he only farms 50
19 acres. And so what he's diverting is half that.

20 And so when I talk about a declared water right,
21 it's what people have declared as what they can legally
22 use, and -- opposed to what they're actually pumping.

23 Q. So New Mexico could develop very easily another
24 30,000 acre-feet of use per year if the State Engineer were
25 to step in and say, you know, if you don't develop this

1 right, you're going to lose it, right?

2 A. That's correct, those people can still -- until
3 the State Engineer says you've forfeited your right, they
4 could pump up to that amount.

5 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: That was the only question I
6 had.

7 Ms. MacQuesten, do you have any cross-examination
8 for this witness?

9 MS. MacQUESTEN: No, Mr. Chairman.

10 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Mr. Carr, do you have any
11 cross-examination?

12 MR. CARR: No, Mr. Chairman.

13 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Ms. Belin --

14 MS. BELIN: No further questions.

15 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: -- do you have any other
16 witnesses?

17 MS. BELIN: No.

18 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Okay. Why don't we take a 10-
19 minute break and reconvene at 10 minutes to 4:00?

20 (Testimony of Steven T. Finch, Jr., was concluded
21 at 3:50 p.m., Friday, June 18th, 2004.)

22 * * *

23

24

25

CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER

STATE OF NEW MEXICO)
) ss.
 COUNTY OF SANTA FE)

I, Steven T. Brenner, Certified Court Reporter and Notary Public, HEREBY CERTIFY that the foregoing excerpts of proceedings before the Oil Conservation Commission were reported by me; that I transcribed my notes; and that the foregoing is a true and accurate record of the excerpted proceedings.

I FURTHER CERTIFY that I am not a relative or employee of any of the parties or attorneys involved in this matter and that I have no personal interest in the final disposition of this matter.

WITNESS MY HAND AND SEAL June 23rd, 2004.



STEVEN T. BRENNER
 CCR No. 7

My commission expires: October 16th, 2006