

**STATE OF NEW MEXICO  
ENERGY, MINERALS AND NATURAL RESOURCES DEPARTMENT  
OIL CONSERVATION DIVISION**

**APPLICATIONS OF PERMIAN RESOURCES  
OPERATING, LLC FOR COMPULSORY POOLING,  
EDDY COUNTY, NEW MEXICO.**

**CASE NO. 26060  
DIVISION ORDER NO. R-21104-F (Case No. 24674)  
DIVISION ORDER NO. R-23748 (Case No. 25137)  
DIVISION ORDER NO. R-22893-A (Case No. 24837)  
DIVISION ORDER NO. R-21123-C (Case No. 22536)  
DIVISION ORDER NO. R-23828 (Case No. 24963)  
DIVISION ORDER NO. R-21096-D (Case No. 25233)**

**MOTION TO DISMISS**

Permian Resources Operating, LLC (“Permian”) hereby submits this motion to dismiss American Energy Resources, LLC’s (“AER”) “Application for Reopening and Motion Requesting Joinder of Claims” for the following reasons:

1. First, AER’s filing states that it “submits [its application] to the Oil Conservation Commission pursuant to 19.15.4.12D,” yet the matter is now before the Division. (emphasis added). The fact that the application has been improperly filed should be a basis for dismissal. AER, and its representative Jonathan Samaniego, should be held to the same standard as all other participants appearing before the Oil Conservation Commission (“OCC”) and Oil Conservation Division (“OCD”) and be required to follow the rules under the New Mexico Administrative Code (“NMAC”), including properly filing motions and applications for hearing before the correct tribunal.

2. Second, AER is not a party of record or affected party or pooled party in any of these matters. See Case Nos. 20860 (underlying pooling case for Order R-21104-F), 25137, 22554 (underlying pooling case for Order R-22893-A), 20858 (underlying pooling case for Order R-221123-C), 24963, and 25233 (underlying pooling case for Order R-21096-D). AER’s

representative, Jonathan Samaniego, owns a 0.00011250% working interest in Permian's Water Buffalo development, but that interest was pooled under Division Order No. R-23748, which was issued on April 1, 2025. See **Exhibit A**. No party filed a *de novo* application within 30 days of the Division issuing Order No. R-23748, as required by 19.15.4.23.A NMAC. And in Permian's Caveman development, AER/Jonathan Samaniego claimed an interest, but failed to provide evidence to support this assertion, the case was taken under advisement, and Division Order No. R-23828 was issued on June 18, 2025. See Case No. 24963. Again, no party filed a *de novo* application within 30 days of the order being issued, as required. Additionally, even if AER/Jonathan Samaniego acquired an interest in any of the matters listed in its filing after the orders were issued, the interest would be taken subject to the pooling orders.

3. Third, in its filing, AER refers to 19.15.4.12.D NMAC, which discusses reopening a case for failure to provide notice. Jonathan Samaniego was only entitled to notice as an affected party in Case No. 25137, which was sent by certified mail, return receipt requested, to the last known address for him at the time of filing the application. See 19.15.4.12.A(1) and B NMAC; see also **Exhibit A**. Thus, notice was proper. Moreover, AER's reference to "Rule 18 Joinder of Claims" is irrelevant because the federal rules of civil procedure do not apply to state administrative tribunals. See AER Filing.

4. Lastly, during the May 13, 2026 OCC meeting, Jonathan Samaniego, as representative of AER in a similar type of filing, raising the same claims raised here, repeatedly stated on the record to the Division Director that the OCC and OCD are not competent forums to resolve any issues presented by AER because of "clear conflict of interest or bias which the Division and the Commission under evidence have already shown bias in their orders" and "failed uh uh charge obligated duties to enforce New Mexico law that they're obligated to follow not contort to follow" and "therefore, that any determinations by the Commission . . . or Division . . . it's all moot." See

Internet Archive, *OCC Meeting on May 13, 2026 Part 2 PM*, (YouTube, Tr. 5/13/26, 4:46-5:09), <https://youtu.be/VfMNaJ1zo0s?t=286>. The party in that proceeding agreed that AER's application was not properly before the OCC, as well. Based on Jonathan Samaniego's statements on the record, the Division Director promptly dismissed AER's application on the grounds that both parties agreed AER's application was not properly before the OCC. The Division Hearing Examiner should do the same in this matter too where Permian has established AER has no valid legal or factual basis for his claims and AER has taken the position, on the record, that neither OCC nor OCD are competent tribunals to hear the same claims he is raising here.

5. Since this is a motion to dismiss, 1-1007.1 NMRA does not require the movant to seek concurrence of other parties because it is presumed to be opposed due to the nature of the motion. That being said, the Division Hearing Examiner requested that counsel for Permian confirm AER/Jonathan Samaneigo's position in the matter, which is included as **Exhibit B**.

WHEREFORE, Permian respectfully requests that American Energy Resources, LLC's "Application for Reopening and Motion Requesting Joinder of Claims" be dismissed by the Division.

Respectfully submitted,

HOLLAND & HART, LLP



---

Adam G. Rankin  
Paula M. Vance  
A. Raylee Starnes  
Post Office Box 2208  
Santa Fe, New Mexico 87504  
(505) 988-4421  
(505) 983-6043 Facsimile  
agrarkin@hollandhart.com  
pmvance@hollandhart.com  
arstarnes@hollandhart.com

**ATTORNEYS FOR PERMIAN RESOURCES OPERATING,  
LLC**

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on May 18, 2026, I served a copy of the foregoing document to the following counsel of record via Electronic Mail to:

Jonathan Samaniego  
P.O. Box 114  
Hagerman, NM 88232  
*energy.jrs@gmail.com*

*Representative of American Energy Resources, LLC*

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Paula M. Vance", written over a horizontal line.

Paula M. Vance

EXHIBIT  
**A**

JENNIFER GALLOWAY	0.00006906	0.04420000
JERRY L. DICKSON	0.00000000	0.00000000
JESUS AND BARBARA ADAME, JR. HUSBAND AND WIFE	0.00023672	0.15150000
JIMMIE T. AUSTIN	0.00008297	0.05310000
JIMMY CHARLES WRIGHT	0.00001263	0.00808000
JOAN EILEEN BIRD	0.00000429	0.00274444
JOANN C DOPORTO AKA JOANNE DOPORTO	0.00029594	0.18940000
JODY C. VASQUEZ MARRIED, SOLE AND SEPARATE PROPERTY	0.00027625	0.17680000
JOE D & LUPE C NAVARETTE HUSBAND AND WIFE	0.00017578	0.11250000
JOE R RUEDA, II	0.00000471	0.00301364
JOHN A. AND MILDRED L. HINDS HUSBAND AND WIFE	0.00020125	0.12880000
JOHN CHANCE LANEY	0.00000000	0.00000000
JOHN ELDON BRAZEAL	0.00000000	0.00000000
JOHN GARY BAILEY	0.00006906	0.04420000
JOHNNIE BEATRICE SHEPARD AKA BEATRICE SHEPARD	0.00027625	0.17680000
JOHNNY A. AND CHRISTINE P. HAGGERTON, JR. HUSBAND AND WIFE	0.00014344	0.09180000
JONATHAN SAMANIEGO	0.00011250	0.07200000
JORDAN LAUHOFF	0.00002015	0.01289333
JOSEPH (DECEASED) P. SULLIVAN	0.00006906	0.04420000
JOSEPH A. GELOFSACK	0.00009938	0.06360000
JOSEPH CHRISTOPHER CUNNINGHAM	0.00000177	0.00113333
JOSEPH GIARRATANO	0.00003453	0.02210000
JOSEPH MORENO	0.00002191	0.01402222
JOSEPH W. BRININSTOOL SOLE AND SEPARATE PROPERTY, JOINED PRO FORMA BY HIS WIFE, JILL HOLT	0.00026641	0.17050000
JUAN A SAUCEDO MARRIED, SOLE AND SEPARATE PROPERTY	0.00020719	0.13260000
JUNE L DAVIS	0.00001633	0.01045000
JUSTIN RAY GORDON	0.00001094	0.00700000
KARL HOYLE MARRIED & SOLE AND SEPARATE PROPERTY	0.00001585	0.01014643
KATHY WILLIAMS WILLIAMS FKA KATHY FAY CROLEY	0.00002590	0.01657500
KENNETH LEE ARRINGTON	0.00002590	0.01657500
KIMBERLY LYNN HACKLER SOLE AND SEPARATE PROPERTY	0.00001724	0.01103232
KRYSTAL BLU RUEDA	0.00000471	0.00301364
LARRY G. AND REGENA K. FRY HUSBAND AND WIFE	0.00017766	0.11370000
LAURA L. RODGERS MCPHAIL A/K/A LAURA L. RODGERS, MARRIED, SOLE AND SEPARATE PROPERTY	0.00001727	0.01105000
LEANNA DIAMOND CASTILLO	0.00000044	0.00028333
LEE J DAVIS, JR	0.00001633	0.01045000
LINDA MARIE MELTON MARRIED, JOINED PROFORMA BY HER HUSBAND BILLY MELTON	0.00031250	0.20000000
LINDA MORENO	0.00002191	0.01402222
LINDA RAY EASTMAN	0.00000000	0.00000000
LINDA SUSAN WOLFE FKA LINDA S. CROLEY, WIDOW OF GERALD I. CROLEY, DIVORCED FROM RICHARD JAMES SHUTTER, NOW MARRIED TO BILLEY WOLFE	0.00002590	0.01657500
LISA VOGT	0.00010359	0.06630000
LONGI KAY OTERO	0.00002302	0.01473333
LORA LEE THOMAS	0.00000675	0.00432000
LORENA MARQUEZ GAXIOLA	0.00000596	0.00381750
LORENZO B. RUBIO	0.00020719	0.13260000
LORINE GONZALEZ FKA LORINE ASBURY	0.00020719	0.13260000
LOUIS F. RUIZ	0.00014438	0.09240000

JOHN H. WHITE, IV	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
JOHN L. CARTER SOLE AND SEPARATE PROPERTY	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
JOHN M OLDHAM	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
JOHN S PAPSUN	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
JOHNNIE BEATRICE SHEPARD AKA BEATRICE SHEPARD	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
JOHNNY A. AND CHRISTINE P. HAGGERTON, JR. HUSBAND AND WIFE	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
JOHNNY SARABIA	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
JONATHAN SAMANIEGO	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
JORDAN LAUHOFF	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
JOSEFA RAMIREZ WIDOW	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
JOSEPH (DECEASED) P. SULLIVAN	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
JOSEPH A. GELOFSACK	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
JOSEPH CHRISTOPHER CUNNINGHAM	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
JOSEPH GIARRATANO	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
JOSEPH GLEN HURLEY SOLE AND SEPARATE PROPERTY	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
JOSEPH LOPEZ	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
JOSEPH MORENO	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
JOSEPH W. BRININSTOOL SOLE AND SEPARATE PROPERTY, JOINED PRO FORMA BY HIS WIFE, JILL HOLT	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
JOY MCMAHAN	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
JOYCE WEHMEYER	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
JUAN A SAUCEDO MARRIED, SOLE AND SEPARATE PROPERTY	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
JUAN MANUEL & CYNTHIA C DURAN HUSBAND AND WIFE	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
JUDY LANIER	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
JUNE L DAVIS	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
JUSTIN C. SALDANA	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
JUSTIN P. CAMPBELL	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
JUSTIN RAY GORDON	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
KARECE PUTMAN GARDNER (KARECE GARDNER)	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
KAREN SPENCER ORR	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
KARL HOYLE MARRIED & SOLE AND SEPARATE PROPERTY	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
KARYN DIANNE FUNK	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
KATHLEEN M. STARK-PARKER MARRIED, SOLE AND SEPARATE PROPERTY	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
KATHRYN L. KELLER	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
KATHY WILLIAMS WILLIAMS FKA KATHY FAY CROLEY	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
KEITH EVAN HAGGERTON MARRIED & SOLE AND SEPARATE PROPERTY	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
KEITH MCMAHAN	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
KELLI A. WHITE	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
KENNETH DAVID MILLER	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
KENNETH LEE ARRINGTON	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
KENNETH M WILLIS, JR.	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
KENNETH R GROTE	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
KENNETH W. & LORETTA B. HAYES	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
KENNETH W. WHITE	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
KIMBERLY LYNN HACKLER SOLE AND SEPARATE PROPERTY	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
KRYSTAL BLU RUEDA	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
LAKE & LA VEDA BENNETT HUSBAND AND WIFE	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
LARRY AND BARBARA ASBURY HUSBAND AND WIFE	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
LARRY D. LAIRSON SOLE AND SEPARATE PROPERTY	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
LARRY DEAN BURNETT	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
LARRY G. AND REGENA K. FRY HUSBAND AND WIFE	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
LARRY NEAL AND MARY A. DEMOSS	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested
LAURA L. RODGERS MCPHAIL A/K/A LAURA L. RODGERS, MARRIED, SOLE AND SEPARATE PROPERTY	Y	Y	N	N	No lease or JOA requested

Permian - Water Buffalo 133H BS well - Case no. 25137

Postal Delivery Report

9414811898765458068217	Jessie Warren Smith	7560 Farm Road 2120	Bagwell	TX	75412-4619	In Transit
9414811898765458068262	Stephanie Lynn Smith Huston	712 E Lee St	Rotan	TX	79546-3112	In Transit
9414811898765458068224	Estate of John R. Peters, aka John Roger Peters	761 Highway 355 E	Hope	AR	71801-1007	In Transit
9414811898765458068200	Estate of Elizabeth Z. Peters, aka Elizabeth Zenobia Hodges Peters	761 Highway 355 E	Hope	AR	71801-1007	In Transit
9414811898765458068293	Debra Lee aka Debra Lee McKeethen Schnoeker Schnoeker	309 Windy Ln	Vista	CA	92083-5764	In Transit
9414811898765458068248	Heirs of Mike Adams, aka Charles Michial Rank	4040 Highway 50	Whitewater	CO	81527-6701	In Transit
9414811898765458068286	Jonathan Samaniego	PO Box 114	Hagerman	NM	88232-0114	In Transit
9589071052700581156858	Jonathan Samaniego	P.O. Box 114	Hagerman	NM	88232-0114	In Transit
9414811898765458847324	Ida La Verne Plumlee	103 Redriver	Nocona	TX	76255	In Transit
9414811898765458050762	Bigsky Estates, Inc	4511 National Parks Hwy	Carlsbad	NM	88220	In Transit
9414811898765458050700	Carolyn B. Galvan	1412 W Greene St	Carlsbad	NM	88220-3774	In Transit
9414811898765458050793	Alfredo Q. & Connie E. Hernandez	1620 W Tansill St	Carlsbad	NM	88220-3771	In Transit
9414811898765458050748	Daniel Ray Hernandez, III	1412 W Tansill St	Carlsbad	NM	88220-3767	In Transit
9414811898765458050786	Winnie Laney	PO Box 67110	Albuquerque	NM	87193-7110	In Transit
9414811898765458050731	Bertie Hobbs	2508 Utah St	Carlsbad	NM	88220-2965	In Transit
9414811898765458050779	Internationalites Federal Credit Union	901 N Canal St	Carlsbad	NM	88220-5109	In Transit
9414811898765458050915	Robert Jacquez	108 S Ash St	Carlsbad	NM	88220-4402	In Transit
9414811898765458050960	Donald E Jones	1411 Normandy St	Carlsbad	NM	88220-3708	In Transit
9414811898765458052711	SCAN-Harbor, Inc. f/k/a Boys and Girls Harbor	345 E 102nd St Ste 301	New York	NY	10029-5611	In Transit
9414811898765458050922	Jordan Family Trust	412 S Olive St	Carlsbad	NM	88220-4368	In Transit
9414811898765458050908	Estate of Juanita Margaret Funk	1106 Ortega St	Carlsbad	NM	88220-4331	In Transit
9414811898765458050991	Jimmy W. and Melva G. Keen	505 Leavel Dr	Carlsbad	NM	88220-3755	In Transit
9414811898765458050946	Melva Keen	510 Leavel Dr	Carlsbad	NM	88220-3784	In Transit
9414811898765458050984	Heirs of Lidia Baeza	114 N 2nd St	Carlsbad	NM	88220-4263	In Transit
9414811898765458050939	Heirs of Kenneth M. Smith	PO Box 4051	Silver City	NM	88062-4051	In Transit
9414811898765458050977	Pete A Leyva	1006 W Fox St	Carlsbad	NM	88220-4385	In Transit
9414811898765458050618	Alicia G. and Raymundo S. Lopez	PO Box 725	Tijeras	NM	87059-0725	In Transit
9414811898765458050656	Heirs of Arlie Andrew Yarbrough and Vanita May Yarbrough	9744 Drummannon Ave	Las Vegas	NV	89129-8005	In Transit

## Permian - Water Buffalo 133H BS well - Case no. 25137

## Postal Delivery Report

9414811898765458050076	Ramon Valenzuela Irrevocable Special Needs Trust	1307 W Fox St	Carlsbad	NM	88220-4342	In Transit
9414811898765458050410	Daniel H & Carmen F Rascon	403 Leavel Dr	Carlsbad	NM	88220-3753	In Transit
9414811898765458050458	Heirs of Ermon Lee Roberts	1206 W Lea St	Carlsbad	NM	88220-4353	In Transit
9414811898765458052704	Eva Jeanette Hansen	3008 Abbott Ave	Wichita Falls	TX	76308-3528	In Transit
9414811898765458050465	Adon Molinar and Patricia Rodriguez	512 S Ash St	Carlsbad	NM	88220-4805	In Transit
9414811898765458050403	Heirs of Retha Naomi Jones	2605 Westernway St	Carlsbad	NM	88220-3218	In Transit
9414811898765458050496	Asusena V Rodriguez Revocable Trust Agreement Dated February 20, 2002	1407 Ortega St	Carlsbad	NM	88220-3710	In Transit
9414811898765458050441	Jennifer N Roper	1805 W Tansill St	Carlsbad	NM	88220-3798	In Transit
9414811898765458050434	The Rudolph D Woolf and Patricia A Woolf Revocable Trust, dated September 8, 1993	1201 W Ural Dr	Carlsbad	NM	88220-4060	In Transit
9414811898765458050472	Administrator of Veterans Affairs	810 Vermont Ave NW	Washington	DC	20420-0001	In Transit
9414811898765458050519	Jonathan Samaniego	511 Leavel Dr	Carlsbad	NM	88220-3755	In Transit
9414811898765458050557	Louis Sanchez	2514 Florida St	Carlsbad	NM	88220-2947	In Transit
9414811898765458050564	Johnny Sarabia	1709 W Tansill St	Carlsbad	NM	88220-3772	In Transit
9414811898765458050526	Juan A Saucedo	112 S Walnut St	Carlsbad	NM	88220-4473	In Transit
9414811898765458052797	Daniel & Maria M. Anaya	PO Box 811	Carlsbad	NM	88221-0811	In Transit
9414811898765458050502	Joe D. and Gina L. Saunders	1828 Muscatel Ave	Carlsbad	NM	88220-9269	In Transit
9414811898765458050540	Associates Financial Services Co of New Mexico, Inc	2860 Exchange Blvd Ste 100	Southlake	TX	76092-9151	In Transit
9414811898765458050571	Heirs of William Calvin Scivally	2315 Utah St	Carlsbad	NM	88220-3338	In Transit
9414811898765458058218	The Secretary Of Housing and Urban Development	625 Truman St NE	Albuquerque	NM	87110-6443	In Transit
9414811898765458058256	Marna D McCann	1111 Tracy Pl	Carlsbad	NM	88220-5224	In Transit
9414811898765458058201	Roy Sing	403 S Ash St	Carlsbad	NM	88220-4802	In Transit
9414811898765458058249	Susan Bridges Revocable Trust	408 Leavel Dr	Carlsbad	NM	88220-3754	In Transit
9414811898765458058287	Douglas M & Ival Jane Weldy	806 E Rancho Rd	Hobbs	NM	88242-0502	In Transit
9414811898765458058270	Carolyn A Schrock	1702 Curry Rd	Carlsbad	NM	88220-2528	In Transit
9414811898765458058812	Javier L. and Terri Valenzuela	1310 W Fox St	Carlsbad	NM	88220	In Transit
9414811898765458052742	BT-OH, LLC	55 Glenlake Pkwy	Atlanta	GA	30328-3474	In Transit
9414811898765458058850	Petra S Venegas	412 S Walnut St	Carlsbad	NM	88220-4382	In Transit
9414811898765458058829	Shirley J. Walker	411 S Ash St	Carlsbad	NM	88220-4877	In Transit
9414811898765458058805	Bill B. and Katrina Waters	1610 W Bronson St	Carlsbad	NM	88220-3725	In Transit

9414811898765458068286	Jonathan Samaniego, PO Box 114, Hagerman, NM 88232-0114	As of March 3, 2025 - Your package will arrive later than expected, but is still on its way. It is currently in transit to the next facility. Arrived at USPS Regional Origin Facility LAFAYETTE LA DISTRIBUTION CENTER February 26, 2025, 9:26 pm
9589071052700581156858	Jonathan Samaniego, P.O. Box 114, Hagerman, NM 88232-0114	Your item has been delivered to the original sender at 10:46 am on March 15, 2025 in LAFAYETTE, LA 70508.
9414811898765458050519	Jonathan Samaniego, 511 Leavel Dr, Carlsbad, NM 88220-3755	As of February 15, 2025 - Your package will arrive later than expected, but is still on its way. It is currently in transit to the next facility. Arrived at USPS Regional Origin Facility. LAFAYETTE LA DISTRIBUTION CENTER February 12, 2025, 9:42 pm

\*As of 5/11/25

EXHIBIT  
B

**From:** [Jonathan Samaniego](#)  
**To:** [Corral, Madai, EMNRD](#); [Zachary Shandler](#); [Adam Rankin](#); [Paula M. Vance](#); [Raylee Starnes](#); [Apodaca, Sheila, EMNRD](#); [Tschantz, Freya, EMNRD](#)  
**Subject:** Re: [EXTERNAL] FW: Motion to Dismiss by Permian Resources Operating, LLC re: De Novo Case no. 26060  
**Date:** Friday, May 15, 2026 12:14:13 PM  
**Attachments:** [image001.png](#)

---

External Email

Corral,

American objects to any new motion filed by Mr. Rankin or with Mr. Rankin as counsel, or the affiliation of Mr. Rankin in the case.

Mr. Rankin as a bad actor just attempted to mislead the Division and further attempted misconduct with a willful attempt to frivolously dismiss a case by abetting the Division to act arbitrary that can not be overlooked, and for Mr. Rankin to start off in that bad manner this early in the cases is unacceptable behavior that severely prejudices the fairness of the proceedings, and is legal grounds to disqualify Mr. Rankin as counsel in the matter and Sanction Mr. Rankin, simultaneously, which are both necessary and appropriate for such willful bad behavior by Mr. Rankin, that was just witnessed, and to not grant American requests to disqualify and sanction Mr. Rankin would be more negligence that would act as a catalyst for more future harmful behavior.

Thank you

Respectfully,  
John

On Fri, May 15, 2026 at 11:29 AM Corral, Madai, EMNRD <[Madai.Corral@emnrd.nm.gov](mailto:Madai.Corral@emnrd.nm.gov)> wrote:  
Good morning Mr. Rankin,

If you wish to refile a new motion to dismiss, please include the other party's position.

Thank you,

Madai

---

**From:** Adam Rankin <[AGRankin@hollandhart.com](mailto:AGRankin@hollandhart.com)>  
**Sent:** Thursday, May 14, 2026 8:11 AM  
**To:** Corral, Madai, EMNRD <[Madai.Corral@emnrd.nm.gov](mailto:Madai.Corral@emnrd.nm.gov)>; Paula M. Vance <[PMVance@hollandhart.com](mailto:PMVance@hollandhart.com)>  
**Cc:** Jonathan Samaniego <[energy.jrs@gmail.com](mailto:energy.jrs@gmail.com)>; Raylee Starnes <[ARStarnes@hollandhart.com](mailto:ARStarnes@hollandhart.com)>; Apodaca, Sheila, EMNRD <[Sheila.Apodaca@emnrd.nm.gov](mailto:Sheila.Apodaca@emnrd.nm.gov)>; Tschantz, Freya, EMNRD <[Freya.Tschantz@emnrd.nm.gov](mailto:Freya.Tschantz@emnrd.nm.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: [EXTERNAL] FW: Motion to Dismiss by Permian Resources Operating, LLC re: De Novo Case no. 26060

Ms. Corral,

We will be filing an objection later today or tomorrow. As to the motion to dismiss, under the civil rules, a party against whom a motion to dismiss is filed is presumed to oppose. If preferred, we can re-file the motion to dismiss with the citation to the civil rules.

#### **1-007.1. Motions; how presented.**

**A. Requirement of written motion.** All motions, except motions made during trial, or as may be permitted by the court, shall be in writing and shall state with particularity the grounds and the relief sought.

**B. Unopposed motions.** The movant shall determine whether a motion will be opposed. If the motion will not be opposed, an order approved by all parties shall accompany the motion.

**C. Opposed motions.** The motion shall recite that the movant requested the concurrence of all parties or shall specify why no such request was made. **The movant shall not assume that the nature of the motion obviates the need for concurrence from all parties unless the motion is a:**

**(1) motion to dismiss;**

**(2) motion for new trial;**

**(3) motion for judgment as a matter of law;**

**(4) motion for summary judgment;**

**(5) motion for relief from a final judgment, order or proceeding pursuant to Paragraph B of Rule 1-060 NMRA.**

#### [1-007.1 NMRA](#)

**Adam Rankin**

Partner, Holland & Hart LLP

[agrarkin@hollandhart.com](mailto:agrarkin@hollandhart.com) | **T:** (505) 954-7294 | **M:** (505) 570-0377

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This message is confidential and may be privileged. If you believe that this email has been sent to you in error, please reply to the sender that you received the message in error; then please delete this email.

---

**From:** Corral, Madai, EMNRD <[Madai.Corral@emnrd.nm.gov](mailto:Madai.Corral@emnrd.nm.gov)>

**Sent:** Thursday, May 14, 2026 7:36 AM

**To:** Paula M. Vance <[PMVance@hollandhart.com](mailto:PMVance@hollandhart.com)>

**Cc:** Jonathan Samaniego <[energy.jrs@gmail.com](mailto:energy.jrs@gmail.com)>; Adam Rankin <[AGRankin@hollandhart.com](mailto:AGRankin@hollandhart.com)>; Raylee Starnes <[ARStarnes@hollandhart.com](mailto:ARStarnes@hollandhart.com)>; Apodaca, Sheila, EMNRD <[Sheila.Apodaca@emnrd.nm.gov](mailto:Sheila.Apodaca@emnrd.nm.gov)>; Tschantz, Freya, EMNRD <[Freya.Tschantz@emnrd.nm.gov](mailto:Freya.Tschantz@emnrd.nm.gov)>

**Subject:** Re: [EXTERNAL] FW: Motion to Dismiss by Permian Resources Operating, LLC re: De Novo Case

no. 26060

**External Email**

Good morning Parties,

After reviewing the motion to dismiss, the Hearing Examiner has denied the motion. Ms. Vance entered an appearance but did not object (if she had it would have been moved to June 2<sup>nd</sup> status conference docket. The Hearing Examiner advises that if Ms. Vance wishes to refile a new motion to dismiss, she must accurately include the other party's position. If she does so, the other party will have seven days to file a response before the Hearing Examiner considers the motion.

Thank you for your attention to this matter.

Madai

---

**From:** Paula M. Vance <[PMVance@hollandhart.com](mailto:PMVance@hollandhart.com)>

**Sent:** Wednesday, May 13, 2026 12:48:12 PM

**To:** Corral, Madai, EMNRD <[Madai.Corral@emnrd.nm.gov](mailto:Madai.Corral@emnrd.nm.gov)>

**Cc:** Jonathan Samaniego <[energy.jrs@gmail.com](mailto:energy.jrs@gmail.com)>; Adam Rankin <[AGRankin@hollandhart.com](mailto:AGRankin@hollandhart.com)>; Raylee Starnes <[ARStarnes@hollandhart.com](mailto:ARStarnes@hollandhart.com)>

**Subject:** [EXTERNAL] FW: Motion to Dismiss by Permian Resources Operating, LLC re: De Novo Case no. 26060

CAUTION: This email originated outside of our organization. Exercise caution prior to clicking on links or opening attachments.

Madai,

The attached motion to dismiss was filed today with the Division. Attached is a proposed order.

Thank you for your time and consideration.

**Paula Vance**

Her / Hers / She [\(What's this?\)](#)  
Associate, Holland & Hart LLP

[pmvance@hollandhart.com](mailto:pmvance@hollandhart.com) | T: (505) 954-7286 | M: (337) 280-9055

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This message is confidential and may be privileged. If you believe that this email has been sent to you in error, please reply to the sender that you received the message in error; then please delete this email.

---

**From:** Kari D. Perez <[KDPerez@hollandhart.com](mailto:KDPerez@hollandhart.com)>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, May 13, 2026 12:45 PM  
**To:** Jonathan Samaniego <[energy.jrs@gmail.com](mailto:energy.jrs@gmail.com)>  
**Cc:** Adam Rankin <[AGRankin@hollandhart.com](mailto:AGRankin@hollandhart.com)>; Paula M. Vance <[PMVance@hollandhart.com](mailto:PMVance@hollandhart.com)>; Raylee Starnes <[ARStarnes@hollandhart.com](mailto:ARStarnes@hollandhart.com)>  
**Subject:** Motion to Dismiss by Permian Resources Operating, LLC re: De Novo Case no. 26060

Mr. Samaniego,

Please find the attached *Motion to Dismiss* on behalf of Permian Resources Operating, LLC in the above-referenced matter that was filed May 13, 2026, via the NMOCD online filing system.

Regards,



**Kari Perez**

Legal Assistant

**Holland  
& Hart**

**HOLLAND & HART LLP**

110 North Guadalupe Street, Suite 1, Santa Fe, NM 87501

[kdperetz@hollandhart.com](mailto:kdperetz@hollandhart.com) | T: (505) 954-3672 F: (505) 944-9790

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This message is confidential and may be privileged. If you believe that this email has been sent to you in error, please reply to the sender that you received the message in error; then please delete this email.