

STATE OF NEW MEXICO  
ENERGY, MINERALS AND NATURAL RESOURCES DEPARTMENT  
OIL CONSERVATION DIVISION

FOR THE CONSIDERATION OF:

APPLICATION OF PERMIAN RESOURCES  
OPERATING, LLC FOR COMPULSORY POOLING,  
EDDY COUNTY, NEW MEXICO

CASE NO. 24674  
ORDER NO. R-21104-F

APPLICATION OF PERMIAN RESOURCES  
OPERATING, LLC FOR COMPULSORY POOLING,  
EDDY COUNTY, NEW MEXICO

CASE NO. 25137  
AMENDED CASE NO. 24837  
ORDER NO. R-23748

APPLICATION OF PERMIAN RESOURCES  
OPERATING, LLC FOR COMPULSORY POOLING,  
EDDY COUNTY, NEW MEXICO

CASE NO. 22536  
ORDER NO. R-21123-C

APPLICATION OF PERMIAN RESOURCES  
OPERATING, LLC FOR COMPULSORY POOLING,  
EDDY COUNTY, NEW MEXICO

CASE NO. 24963  
AMENDED CASE NO. 25233  
ORDER NO. R-21096-F

APPLICATION OF PERMIAN RESOURCES  
OPERATING, LLC FOR COMPULSORY POOLING,  
EDDY COUNTY, NEW MEXICO

CASE NO. 26060

**MOTION TO DISQUALIFY A HEARING EXAMINER FOR LACK OF IMPARTIALITY**

American Energy Resources LLC (“American”), through statute 19.25.2.14 requests to disqualify hearing examiner Gregory Chakalian for lack of impartiality.

1. Before the scheduled hearing, the hearing examiner Gregory Chakalian singled out American and failed to demanded evidence of American ownership be presented before erroneous premature dismissal of relevant cases CASE NO. 24674, CASE NO. 22536, CASE NO. 24963 and AMENDED CASE NO. 25233, even though the following:

19.15.4.14 C opposing party is not obligated to present evidence

19.15.4.16 prehearing procedure for adjudicatory hearing

The hearing examiner Gregory Chakalian was willfully Bias in how he conducted his premature dismissal of relevant cases CASE NO. 24674, CASE NO. 22536, CASE NO. 24963 and AMENDED CASE NO. 25233 and in fact violated the laws of procedure with no remorse for his actions in his premature bias dismissal and harm toward American the effected party.

2. The hearing examiner Gregory Chakalian did not attempt to correct his Bias wrong actions, by entering an erroneous order to dismiss before the a scheduled hearing, and failed to request everybody provide their ownership interest.

The fact that the hearing examiner Gregory Chakalian failed to correct his bias wrongs is evidence with standing and merit of the hearing examiner continued Bias pattern toward protecting American correlative rights.

(“See American Exhibit Attachment A”)

3. Applicant Permian opposition to American motion is without legal basis of statutory of case law.

Applicant Permian and their attorney Paula Vance, along with all Division members, all witnessed the hearing examiner Gregory Chakalian orders dismissing American cases without standing or merits for his bias erroneous premature actions, and failed to request that American at minimum though not required by law under 19.15.4.14 C to provide proof of ownership interest before the scheduled hearing, though it would have been more appropriate of the hearing examiner Gregory Chakalian to have waited until the scheduled hearing as required by New Mexico law.


4. This is the Hearing Examiners second recorded time showing bias rulings as erroneous orders against American. The first filed reported case of capricious, bias, erroneous acts by the Hearing Examiner Greogry Chakalian was in Case no. 24944 and Case no. 25166, where American also filed motion to dismiss hearing examiner Gregory Chakalian for lack of impartiality, that the hearing examiner Gregory Chakalian personally denied and caused and continues to cause extensive damages to American correlative rights in those cases by his bias acts to frivolously terminate American leases unjustly without competent jurisdiction for such extreme bias actions as his orders that are in violation of New Mexico law NMSA 70-1-5 "that notice must proceed action" and without jurisdiction under his mandate.

These bias acts as his orders have not gone unnoticed and evidently shows a continued pattern of bad behavior and bad acting by the Hearing Examiner Gregory Chakalian towards American, which are prohibited violations of the Hearing Examiners Gregory Chakalian charged obligated duties under the Oil and gas act and New Mexico law that require of him the protection of correlative rights and to not act capricious, bias, and erroneous.

WHEREFORE, the hearing examiner Gregory Chakalian failed at his duties for the second time with great disregard to the hearing procedures and process or his charged obligated duties, and has shown a continued pattern of bias towards American an involved and effected party, by failing to wait for appropriate scheduled hearing procedures to demand evidence from American, instead of prematurely dismissing relevant cases CASE NO. 24674, CASE NO. 22536, CASE NO. 24963 and AMENDED CASE NO. 25233 before a set scheduled hearing that only singled out American and willfully failed to request the presentation of evidence of ownership at the appropriate set scheduled hearing.

Therefore, Disqualifying the Hearing Examiner Gregory Chakalian in his entirety from hearing Case no. 24674, CASE NO. 2513 and AMENDED CASE NO. 24837, CASE NO. 22536, CASE NO. 24963 and AMENDED CASE NO. 25233 and CASE No. 26060 is the only remedy to proceed with a fair hearing and to prevent future harm to an effected party.

Respectfully submitted,



---

Jonathan S. Martinez  
P.O. Box 104 Hagerman, NM 88232  
(575)499-7330  
Energy.jrs@gmail.com  
Representative for American Energy Resources LLC

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE I hereby certify that a true and correct copy of the foregoing was filed with the New Mexico New Mexico Oil Conservation Commission and was served on counsel of record via electronic mail on June 14, 2026:

Adam G. Rankin  
Paula M. Vance  
Post Office Box 2208  
Santa Fe, NM 87504  
505-988-4421  
505-983-6043 Facsimile  
arankin@hollandhart.com  
pmvance@hollandhart.com  
Attorneys for Permian Resources Operating, LLC

Dana S. Hardy  
Jaclyn M. McLean  
Yarithza Pena  
125 Lincoln Ave., Ste. 223  
Santa Fe, NM 87501  
Phone (505)230-4410  
dhardy@hardymclean.com  
jmclean@hardymclean.com  
ypena@hardymclean.com  
Attorneys for Earthstone Permian LLC and Earthstone Operating LLC