

STATE OF NEW MEXICO  
ENERGY, MINERALS AND NATURAL RESOURCES DEPARTMENT  
OIL CONSERVATION COMMISSION

IN THE MATTER OF THE HEARING CALLED BY )  
THE OIL CONSERVATION COMMISSION FOR THE )  
PURPOSE OF CONSIDERING: )

PROPOSED AMENDMENT TO 19.15.1 NMAC )  
ADOPTING A NEW SECTION TO BE CODIFIED AS )  
19.15.1.21 NMAC. THIS SECTION APPLIES )  
TO THE CHIHUAHUAN DESERT AREAS OF OTERO )  
AND SIERRA COUNTIES, NEW MEXICO, )  
PROHIBITS THE USE OF PITS AND IMPOSES )  
ADDITIONAL LOCATION, CONSTRUCTION, )  
OPERATION AND TESTING REQUIREMENTS ON )  
INJECTION WELLS AND RELATED FACILITIES )  
USED TO DISPOSE OF PRODUCED WATER )

CASE NO. 13,269

ORIGINAL

COMMISSION HEARING  
EXCERPT OF PROCEEDINGS (Testimony of Robert Sivinski,  
Rachel Jankowitz and Steven Finch)

BEFORE: MARK E. FESMIRE, CHAIRMAN  
JAMI BAILEY, COMMISSIONER  
FRANK T. CHAVEZ, COMMISSIONER

June 17th and 18th, 2004

Santa Fe, New Mexico

This matter came on for hearing before the Oil Conservation Commission, MARK E. FESMIRE, Chairman, on Thursday and Friday, June 17th and 18th, 2004, at the New Mexico Energy, Minerals and Natural Resources Department, 1220 South Saint Francis Drive, Room 102, Santa Fe, New Mexico, Steven T. Brenner, Certified Court Reporter No. 7 for the State of New Mexico.

\* \* \*

## I N D E X

June 17th and 18th, 2004  
 Commission Hearing  
 CASE NO. 13,269  
 (Excerpts of proceedings)

PAGE

## DIVISION WITNESSES:

<u>ROBERT C. SIVINSKI</u> (Forestry Division, New Mexico Department of Energy, Minerals and Natural Resources)	
Direct Examination by Ms. Bada	3
Examination by Commissioner Bailey	14
Examination by Commissioner Chavez	20
Examination by Chairman Fesmire	21
Further Examination by Ms. Bada	22
<u>RACHEL JANKOWITZ</u> (New Mexico Game and Fish Department)	
Direct Examination by Ms. Bada	24
Examination by Commissioner Bailey	35
Examination by Commissioner Chavez	38

## OTERO MESA COALITION WITNESS:

<u>STEVEN T. FINCH, Jr.</u> (Hydrologist, Shoemaker and Associates)	
Direct Examination by Ms. Belin	40
Examination by Commissioner Bailey	64
Examination by Commissioner Chavez	72
Examination by Chairman Fesmire	77

REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE	79
------------------------	----

\* \* \*

1           WHEREUPON, the following proceedings were had at  
2           3:28 p.m. on Thursday, June 17th, 2004:

3                           ROBERT C. SIVINSKI,

4           the witness herein, after having been first duly sworn upon  
5           his oath, was examined and testified as follows:

6                           DIRECT EXAMINATION

7           BY MS. BADA:

8           Q.    Could you please state your name for the record?

9           A.    Robert C. Sivinski.

10          Q.    Where are you employed?

11          A.    I'm employed with the Energy, Minerals, Natural  
12          Resources Department, Forestry Division.

13          Q.    How long have you been employed with the Forestry  
14          Division?

15          A.    With the Forestry Division for 15 years.

16          Q.    And what are your job responsibilities?

17          A.    Seventy-five percent of my time I am a botanist  
18          for the State of New Mexico, mainly studying rare and  
19          endangered plants throughout the state, to fulfill the  
20          requirements of the New Mexico Endangered Plant Species  
21          Act, and to implement the state's full authorities  
22          agreement with the US Fish and Wildlife Service to conduct  
23          most of the research and recovery operations for endangered  
24          plant species in New Mexico.

25                        The other 25 percent of my time I work with

1 various land conservation programs, including the Forest  
2 Legacy Program, the Natural Lands Protection Act, and the  
3 Land Conservation Incentives Act

4 Q. Where were you employed prior to working for the  
5 Forestry Division?

6 A. Prior to that by the same department, Energy,  
7 Minerals and Natural Resources, but in the Mining and  
8 Minerals Division for five years.

9 Q. And what were your job responsibilities there?

10 A. I was a coal mine reclamation specialist, and by  
11 the end of that term I was the chief of the Surface Mine  
12 Permitting Bureau.

13 Q. And what did you do in the coal mine reclamation,  
14 what were your specific duties?

15 A. It was inspection and enforcement of reclamation  
16 regulations that the State has that were based on federal  
17 regulations, and approving mine plans and close-out plans,  
18 such things like that.

19 Q. And what is your educational background?

20 A. I have a bachelor's degree in wildlife biology  
21 from New Mexico State University with a minor in range  
22 science. I have a master's of science from New Mexico  
23 State, also in wildlife biology, and an additional two  
24 years of graduate work at UNM in plant taxonomy and  
25 systematics.

1 MR. BADA: I'd like to offer Bob as an expert in  
2 botany and rare plants.

3 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Is there any objection?

4 So accepted.

5 MR. SIMPSON: Could you have the witnesses speak  
6 louder. The background -- the air is -- hard to hear.

7 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Okay. Mr. Sivinski is  
8 acceptable to the Commission as an expert.

9 Q. (By Ms. Bada) Bob, are you familiar with the  
10 Chihuahuan Desert area in Otero and Sierra Counties?

11 A. Yes, I am. Like I said, I went to school in Las  
12 Cruces. I also worked for the Bureau of Land Management in  
13 the Las Cruces District for a year and in the Socorro  
14 District for a year and spent most of my life in New  
15 Mexico. My work with rare and endangered plants has also  
16 taken me to practically every county in the state. I have  
17 done quite a bit of field surveys in these two counties.

18 Q. Bob, did you take this photo?

19 A. Yes, that's on Otero Mesa, just north of the  
20 Cornudas Mountains. This is the famous Chihuahuan Desert  
21 grasslands with a lot of elk on it. I took this photo last  
22 December.

23 Q. Could you run the other three?

24 A. Same area. This grassland, as you can see, does  
25 have some minor shrub component, but that just adds to the

1 species diversity out there. It is predominantly  
2 grassland, black grama, purple three-awn, Torrey muhly,  
3 various native species of grasses, quite a diverse  
4 assemblage of plants.

5 This is on the northern end of the Otero Mesa  
6 looking at the Cornucopia Hills. This is more of a playa  
7 area that's mostly burro grass and Tobosa grass.

8 As you can see, there's quite a bit of plant  
9 diversity out here in the Chihuahuan Desert, especially of  
10 yuccas, agave, cacti, as well as the grasslands. But this  
11 is kind of a soaptree-yucca savannah out Otero Mesa.

12 Q. Could we go back to slide 9? Could you identify  
13 the approximate area on this vegetation map of Otero and  
14 Sierra Counties that contain Chihuahuan Desert vegetation  
15 types?

16 A. Just about anything you see that isn't green.  
17 These green designations represent coniferous woodlands,  
18 starting with piñon-juniper elevation and up into higher  
19 elevation coniferous forests. Below piñon-juniper we are  
20 in Chihuahuan Desert, the Chihuahuan Desert ecoregion,  
21 throughout the remainder of these two counties.

22 Q. What makes the Chihuahuan Desert important?

23 A. It's really a huge desert. It extends from  
24 approximately Socorro in New Mexico on the north, all the  
25 way down to Nuevo Leon in Mexico. About 70 percent of the

1 desert is in New Mexico, but the northern subunit of the  
2 Chihuahuan Desert is predominantly in southern New Mexico  
3 and west Texas.

4           It is one of three most species-diverse, as far  
5 as plants and animals, of the arid regions in the world.  
6 There is even greater species diversity in the Chihuahuan  
7 Desert than there is in the Sonoran Desert next to us in  
8 Arizona and southern California. Although that desert gets  
9 much more attention because it has big saguaros, we  
10 actually have greater species diversity in the Chihuahuan  
11 Desert than the Sonoran.

12           The northern unit of the Chihuahuan Desert that  
13 occurs from, say Chihuahua City up through New Mexico and  
14 west Texas, was predominantly grassland in historic times,  
15 and that's one of the things that make it really unique,  
16 is, it is a desert grass.

17           Q. How much of the Chihuahuan Desert grasslands  
18 remain?

19           A. There's various estimates. Anywhere from 50 to  
20 70 percent of the Chihuahuan Desert grassland has been  
21 eliminated and replaced with shrublands, less species-  
22 diverse scrub. In this particular area, the Bureau of Land  
23 Management has estimated that in the last 150 years  
24 approximately 62 percent of the grassland in these two  
25 counties have been highly degraded or eliminated.

1           Q.    In New Mexico, what counties have a majority of  
2 the remaining grasslands?

3           A.    Can I use this?

4           Q.    Uh-huh, sure.

5           A.    There is a little bit of grassland going up the  
6 Pecos River, not very much, but it's usually confined to  
7 the river valley.  The largest examples of remnant  
8 grassland in New Mexico are from the Otero Mesa to the  
9 southern end of the Tularosa Basin.  Then the northern end  
10 of the Tularosa Basin, there is some on the bajada of the  
11 San Andres mountains and a band of grasslands coming down  
12 the bajada of the Black Range in Sierra County.

13                    There are some further north in the Jornada del  
14 Muerto, although they're more spotty in that area, all the  
15 way up to the city -- the National Wildlife Refuge near  
16 Socorro.

17                    So there are remnant spots of grassland in quite  
18 a few places.  In fact, if you get into a different section  
19 of the Chihuahuan Desert, which is called the Apachean,  
20 over in the boot heel of New Mexico and adjacent Arizona,  
21 there are some remnant grasslands in those locations.  
22 Probably the best known is the Animas Valley.

23           Q.    Why are the grasslands in the Otero Mesa area  
24 different than those in the other counties?

25           A.    Mainly their size.  It's really a large,

1 relatively intact piece. There are still impacts to that  
2 area. They're somewhat higher in elevation, so they get a  
3 little bit more rain. They're mostly black grama  
4 grasslands, which are unusual for Chihuahuan Desert  
5 grasslands. Down lower it's usually various species of  
6 dropseed, but the density of background on this area is  
7 really kind of outstanding, really an outstanding example  
8 of a black grama grassland.

9 Q. Why are the desert grasslands important?

10 A. They're species diverse as far as plants, as far  
11 as wildlife. You'll probably hear testimony from the Game  
12 and Fish Department on why they're necessary for continuing  
13 populations of the antelope, prairie dogs, various  
14 predators in that area.

15 They have changed, though, over the last century  
16 or two, due to the pressures on them, mainly through  
17 grazing during drought periods and the elimination of  
18 wildfire that typically maintains grasslands.

19 So just having these remnant pieces, it's  
20 important to protect them, because animals move around.  
21 They need to be able to migrate, such as birds. Even  
22 larger animals will move from grassland to grassland, and  
23 it's good to have quite a few in proximity to one another  
24 so that movement -- those ecological processes can occur.

25 If we can maintain just the remnants we have, we

1 would have pieces of grassland all the way from the  
2 Sevilleta National Wildlife Refuge, down through the  
3 Jornada del Muerto, into the Tularosa Basin, across Otero  
4 Mesa, down to the Davis Mountain-Marfa grasslands in  
5 adjacent Texas, and then across the river to the remnant  
6 grasslands in central Chihuahua

7 Q. We've heard a lot of talk about pits, so I wanted  
8 to ask you about the problems that might be encountered in  
9 attempting to reclaim the vegetation over pits where  
10 drilling muds and other drilling wastes are buried.

11 A. I think it's going to depend on what it ends up  
12 in the pits. In reclaiming coal mines, our experience was,  
13 anytime you're dealing with very sodic material, a lot of  
14 salts of sodium, that material can migrate into whatever  
15 top dressing you use for the reclamation.

16 What you're burying these pits with, I assume,  
17 would be suitable root material for plants. But yet over  
18 time, if it's quite a bit of salt in that area, it can  
19 migrate upward into the root medium and essentially  
20 sterilize the soils.

21 Q. Are there any endangered or threatened plants in  
22 Otero and Sierra Counties in this area of the Chihuahuan  
23 Desert?

24 A. I wasn't finished on the reclamation part.

25 Q. Oh, sorry, go ahead and finish.

1           A.    Also, when you disturb grassland soils, which are  
2 out here typically fairly shallow because of a caliche  
3 layer, when you mix all that up, you're breaking up that  
4 soil horizon and typically making that area suitable more  
5 for taprooted plants than you are for grasses, and you'll  
6 see a lot of annual herbaceous species coming in and even  
7 shrubs coming in. And it's perfect root medium for noxious  
8 weeds as well, and we see that quite a bit in the well  
9 patch, because noxious weeds follow the roads, the  
10 pipelines, the wellpads, and it just takes a long time for  
11 that -- maybe centuries, for that soil structure to  
12 redevelop into grassland-type of soils.

13                 Also, one of the main problems for reclamation  
14 out here is, practically all of the species -- the grass  
15 species that I mentioned that occur on this area, are not  
16 available commercially. There has been so little  
17 reclamation done in the Chihuahuan Desert that growers have  
18 not begun to supply seed for reclamation purposes. There  
19 is no seed source on the open market for black grama, for  
20 Tobosa grass, for three-awn. All of the common grass  
21 species out here, just about, are not available for  
22 reclamation purposes. So even though this area might be  
23 seeded for a post-impact land use, it's probably not going  
24 to be seeded to effect restoration of what was there  
25 before.

1 Q. Okay.

2 A. Now your next question.

3 Q. Thanks, Bob. Are there any endangered or  
4 threatened plants in the Chihuahuan Desert in Otero and  
5 Sierra Counties?

6 A. Yes, there are six. Two are federally listed  
7 species. They occur on the Sacramento escarpment. One is  
8 the Sacramento prickly poppy. That's a very endangered  
9 plant that's on its way to extinction. It occurs on the  
10 lower part of the escarpment.

11 Just north of that is the Todson's pennyroyal,  
12 which occurs on gypsum outcrops on the escarpment. Those  
13 both are federally listed plants.

14 There's -- Villard's pincushion occurs on the  
15 escarpment just below Alamogordo. That is a state-listed  
16 cactus.

17 Duncan's pincushion occurs all over here, near  
18 T or C and the Mud Springs Mountains. That is a State-  
19 listed endangered cactus.

20 And down in the Crow Flats area there's the  
21 gypsum scale broom that occurs in the Alkali Lakes regions  
22 of Crow Flats.

23 And at Cornudas Mountain there's an endangered  
24 species of orchid called the shining coral root.

25 There are several other rare plant species out

1 here that do not have any formal protections under the  
2 federal or the state law but could be pushed in that  
3 direction, depending on what the land management in the  
4 area occurs as.

5 For instance, the Guadalupe mescal bean is in the  
6 Broke Off Mountains and the lower part of the Guadalupe  
7 Mountain escarpment.

8 And just right in here on gypsum is the Guadalupe  
9 blazing star and Howard's ringstem, which -- both of those  
10 plants were just found ten years ago. They were unknown to  
11 science until just ten years ago.

12 Q. The other thing I wanted to ask you is, how  
13 complete are the biological studies of the Otero Mesa area?

14 A. Very incomplete. This is probably one of the  
15 least botanically and biologically surveyed areas of New  
16 Mexico. It's very remote. There hasn't been a lot of  
17 agency interest in this area, because a lot of those types  
18 of surveys are project driven, so there's been very little  
19 survey in that area. I know I haven't looked at it all  
20 that much myself.

21 And I mentioned those two plants that were just  
22 discovered in the Cornudas Mountains. On the Texas side in  
23 the last ten years there's been two new species of ants and  
24 a new isopod discovery. So, you know, it's not just all  
25 antelope and prairie dogs out there, there's quite a few

1 other endemic species that could be unique to this area  
2 that just aren't known yet.

3 MS. BADA: I have no further direct questions.  
4 Does the Commission have questions?

5 EXAMINATION  
6 BY COMMISSIONER BAILEY:

7 Q. What impact have the hundred or so previously  
8 drilled oil and gas wells had on the grasslands and on the  
9 endangered species you talked about?

10 A. No impact on the endangered species to this  
11 point. I have not personally looked at those hundred  
12 wellpads but I'm sure they have roads associated with them,  
13 which disturb large linear areas that could influence  
14 ecological processes out there, such as roads stop fires.  
15 Natural fire is very important in maintaining natural  
16 grasslands, and roads stop fires.

17 So there could have been -- you know, it's all  
18 incremental. I'm sure each pad disturbed a certain  
19 acreage, each road disturbed a certain acreage. But when  
20 we're talking about an area that only has 32 percent -- or  
21 38 percent of its natural grasslands left, there are  
22 incremental impacts that will push that number even higher.

23 Q. Have you seen how many of the wellpads have been  
24 revegetated naturally?

25 A. You know, I've only looked at a couple of

1 wellpads in that area, and one was brand new, so I couldn't  
2 tell. I looked at an old wellpad and a pipeline running  
3 through the area that doesn't look like it's getting much  
4 natural vegetation on there.

5           There are a few annual species, native annual  
6 species coming in on them. But typically that isn't used  
7 as a reclamation criteria because it really doesn't --  
8 annual species typically do not support a post-impact land  
9 use for, say, livestock grazing or wildlife habitat. And  
10 they don't show up every year. When there's insufficient  
11 rain they just don't come up, so they're not that useful.  
12 We need permanent vegetation coming in on these things.

13           I did see some shrub species come in, but for a  
14 grassland, adding more and more shrubs actually degrades  
15 the grassland.

16           Q. Talk to me about plant succession order, of how  
17 the grasslands become shrublands and how that's becoming  
18 more and more apparent in this area, even without oil and  
19 gas.

20           A. Okay. Out in this area, recovery -- if that's  
21 what you mean, succession, coming back to a climax  
22 grassland -- could be very slow, perhaps centuries.  
23 Perhaps never at all, if the soils are completely changed.  
24 For instance, there's very little of it in Sierra County,  
25 but there is some in the Jornada del Muerto.

1           But throughout Doña Ana County and southern Luna  
2 County, along the Mexican border, that was all grassland at  
3 one time, and now it's nothing but mesquite coppice dunes.  
4 The soils have moved away, and they're piled up around very  
5 long-lived shrubs. That area is never going to be  
6 grassland again.

7           So if you do really dramatic changes out there,  
8 recovery probably will not happen at all. There will be a  
9 different community, and the plants and animals associated  
10 with that community will no longer be there.

11           There are some creosote areas that move into  
12 overgrazed areas, especially grazed areas that were  
13 overgrazed during severe drought such as the late 1800s,  
14 the early 1900s, even the 1950s there was quite a bit of  
15 shrub dominance moving into Chihuahuan Desert grasslands in  
16 southern New Mexico, simply because they were being  
17 overgrazed during really dry periods. That is somewhat  
18 ameliorated lately, but it still does occur, and we are in a  
19 drought right now.

20           Q.    So with all this creosote area, where would they  
21 be on the map that we can eliminate them as grassland?

22           A.    I think this is a vegetation map.

23           MS. BADA: Yeah, that's right.

24           THE WITNESS: Grasslands are the light yellow  
25 color?

1           COMMISSIONER BAILEY: Uh-huh.

2           THE WITNESS: Now, throughout that area there is  
3 going to be islands of shrublands. This is very gross  
4 scale, but you can see where the grasslands remnants are in  
5 this two-county region. Everything that's darker than that  
6 is now a shrubland.

7           Q.     (By Commissioner Bailey) So what would be the  
8 harm of having oil and gas exploration in those areas of  
9 the darker yellow and the gray and the other areas that are  
10 not grasslands?

11          A.     Ah-hah. The Chihuahuan Desert as a whole, the  
12 grasslands -- especially in the northern part, the  
13 grasslands make it special. Okay? So those are remnants  
14 that would be good to keep, because there are whole suites  
15 of flora and fauna that depend on that.

16                 But not all of it is always grassland. There are  
17 gypsum outcrops that support really rare plants and  
18 animals, there are isolated mountain ranges that are  
19 shrubby with rock outcrop that support really diverse  
20 species assemblages of plants and animals. So those in  
21 themselves are important as well. I think the whole of the  
22 Chihuahuan Desert is important, but there are certain  
23 elements that we're losing because of our management of  
24 those areas, that deserve greater attention.

25          Q.     But are you saying that there are no areas within

1 this vast map location where we don't have grasslands, that  
2 we can't have oil and gas either?

3 A. Oh, I didn't say that, no. I'm saying that the  
4 Chihuahuan Desert is important. There are certain elements  
5 that are more important than others, possibly, and -- Just  
6 because it's not a grassland, though, doesn't mean that  
7 it's not threatened.

8 I wouldn't say that you can't disturb any of it.  
9 There's disturbance going on out there all the time. Not  
10 just oil and gas, but there's ranch roads out there,  
11 there's towns out there, there's highways, there's ORV  
12 traffic, there's all sorts of impacts going on out there.  
13 I'm not saying that oil and gas has to stop in all parts of  
14 the Chihuahuan Desert. That isn't my point at all.

15 Q. Just for a point of clarification, one of the  
16 other folks who gave testimony said that this was the only  
17 area for Chihuahuan grassland in North America. You did  
18 clarify that this is simply the northernmost area of --

19 A. I think he --

20 Q. -- of a grassland that extends way into Mexico?

21 A. I think the intent was, this is one of the best  
22 remnant examples on Otero Mesa of Chihuahuan Desert  
23 grasslands left in New Mexico, and I would agree with that.  
24 There are some good smaller examples in other places, such  
25 as in Sierra County on the bajada of the Black Range, in

1 the Jornada del Muerto and in the Tularosa Basin, but they  
2 are much smaller.

3 And there are other grasslands outside of these  
4 two counties that are Chihuahuan Desert grasslands.

5 Q. Why do we have a huge area of the upper triangle  
6 that's white between Sierra and Otero County? Is there not  
7 grassland in through that area too? See how Otero County  
8 goes north and south on that western boundary, and then  
9 Sierra County comes up at an angle? But yet it appears  
10 from the map that we have grasslands throughout the whole  
11 area.

12 A. I'm not seeing where you're --

13 Q. North of I-25 --

14 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: She's talking about the white  
15 area.

16 Q. (By Commissioner Bailey) The big white  
17 triangular area to -- Go south, go south, go south, go  
18 south, go east, go east --

19 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: The uncolored.

20 Q. (By Commissioner Bailey) Yeah.

21 A. Oh, this. That's Doña Ana County.

22 Q. Okay.

23 A. And this is Luna County, and this is Hidalgo, and  
24 this is Chaves and this is Eddy. They all have Chihuahuan  
25 Desert in them.

1           Q.    But we're not including that county in this  
2 discussion?

3           A.    Apparently not.  Apparently this discussion  
4 centers around the Governor's Order, Executive Order, on  
5 the Chihuahuan Desert in these two counties.

6                    COMMISSIONER BAILEY:  That's all I have.

7                    CHAIRMAN FESMIRE:  Commissioner Chavez?

8                                   EXAMINATION

9 BY COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ:

10           Q.    Is there a -- since you've worked in reclamation,  
11 do you foresee there's a reclamation land that could be  
12 used by the oil and gas industry, or planning for  
13 reclamation during drilling production and final  
14 abandonment of operations that would minimize impacts or  
15 even restore the grasslands after it's done?

16           A.    I would love to see that.  We've done that with  
17 our mining industry in New Mexico already.  Mining, all  
18 types of mining, but especially coal mining in New Mexico,  
19 have very strict regulations on reclamation standards and  
20 what can be called successful reclamation.  There is no  
21 requirement yet, that I'm aware of, in regulation -- to  
22 regulate the oil and gas industry on how they leave their  
23 sites when they're finished.

24           Q.    In studying what's happening with the Chihuahuan  
25 Desert, especially that extends outside of New Mexico, the

1 practices that are proposed under this Rule, are they --  
2 Have you looked at the other practices, in other parts of  
3 the Chihuahuan Desert in Texas and New Mexico?

4 A. No, I have not.

5 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Okay, thanks. That's all.

6 EXAMINATION

7 BY CHAIRMAN FESMIRE:

8 Q. Quick question. When you come into one of these  
9 grassland areas and you disturb the soil, dig deep enough  
10 to create a pit, does that provide an assured degradation  
11 of the grassland? I mean, does that destroy the grassland  
12 at least from that point, in the pit area?

13 A. It would if all you're hoping for is for natural  
14 revegetation of the site, because what would come in --  
15 Once you mix the caliche layer or other subsoil layers with  
16 the topsoil layer, you're not going to get grassland back,  
17 you're going to get taprooted plants, shrubs and herbaceous  
18 plants, that, in that area, just through natural  
19 revegetation.

20 If you could top-dress the site with a topsoil  
21 material that could support grass growth and successfully  
22 seed grass on that area by using an appropriate seed mix  
23 and possibly even irrigation for the first couple of years,  
24 you could probably get it established as grassland and it  
25 would stay that way.

1 Q. But you're telling us that seed mix isn't  
2 available commercially?

3 A. No, and I don't know very many operators that  
4 would be willing to irrigate the site, especially during a  
5 drought period, to ensure that the grass comes in before  
6 the other taprooted plants come in.

7 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Ms. Bada, I have no further  
8 questions. Do you have a cross-examination, or can we --  
9 further direct examination, or can we go to --

10 MS. BADA: I may have some redirect, but let's  
11 see if there's any other cross.

12 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Mr. Carr, do you have any  
13 cross-examination of this witness?

14 MR. CARR: No, I do not.

15 MS. BELIN: No questions.

16 MS. BADA: I had a couple questions that I wanted  
17 to follow up on.

18 FURTHER EXAMINATION

19 BY MS. BADA:

20 Q. You talked earlier about the difference between  
21 Sierra and Otero Counties as far as the highland --

22 A. Uh-huh.

23 Q. -- Chihuahuan Desert grasslands. Could you --  
24 Are there large areas of that in the other counties?

25 A. Of the high --

1 Q. Of the black grama?

2 A. Black grama grasslands?

3 Q. Yeah.

4 A. There are small areas of it in this county. In  
5 the Tularosa Basin, right up around here, is a good example  
6 of black grama grassland. In this county there is little  
7 spots of it here, but not a big, huge area. And that's  
8 about it. So it is kind of a unique area, as far as a  
9 desert --

10 Q. So you wouldn't see that in Lea County or Eddy  
11 County or --

12 A. In Eddy County it's going to mostly be in playa  
13 bottoms and along the valley bottoms and mostly consist of  
14 alkali sacaton, which is a much taller grass species and  
15 more of a monoculture. It's not nearly as species-diverse.  
16 And that's true of a lot of these playa areas, such as the  
17 Middle Tularosa Basin.

18 MS. BADA: I have no further questions.

19 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Mr. Carr, I assume you have  
20 no --

21 MR. CARR: (Shakes head)

22 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Ms. Belin?

23 MS. BELIN: (Shakes head)

24 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Why don't you call your next  
25 witness?

1 MS. MacQUESTEN: The OCD calls Roger Anderson.

2 (Testimony of Robert C. Sivinski was concluded at  
3 4:01 p.m., Thursday, June 17th, 2004.)

4 \* \* \*

5

6

7

8 (The following proceedings were had at 8:30 a.m.  
9 on Friday, June 18th, 2004:)

10 RACHEL JANKOWITZ,

11 the witness herein, after having been first duly sworn upon  
12 her oath, was examined and testified as follows:

13 DIRECT EXAMINATION

14 BY MS. BADA:

15 Q. Good morning, would you please state your name  
16 for the record?

17 A. Rachel Jankowitz.

18 Q. And where are you employed?

19 A. New Mexico Department of Game and Fish,  
20 Conservation Services Division.

21 Q. How long have you been employed there?

22 A. Since April, 2003.

23 Q. And what are your job responsibilities with the  
24 Department of Game and Fish?

25 A. Well, my job title is habitat specialist. I

1 consult with the Energy, Minerals and Natural Resources  
2 Department, Mining and Minerals Division, regarding mine  
3 permits under the New Mexico Mining Act; I write response  
4 letters to requests for our Department's comment on other  
5 minerals-related development projects, including oil and  
6 gas; and I represent the Department concerning the ongoing  
7 hazardous materials cleanup at the old Terrero mine site in  
8 Pecos, which is deeded property of the Game and Fish  
9 Commission.

10 Q. Where were you employed prior to joining the Game  
11 and Fish Department?

12 A. Prior to joining Game and Fish, I was self-  
13 employed consultant. The bulk of my work was writing  
14 environmental assessments for oil and gas developments in  
15 San Juan Basin.

16 Q. And what are your educational qualifications?

17 A. A bachelor of arts degree in biology and a master  
18 of science in wildlife management.

19 MS. BADA: At this time I'd like to offer Ms.  
20 Jankowitz as an expert in wildlife management.

21 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Any objection from the  
22 Commission?

23 COMMISSIONER BAILEY: (Shakes head)

24 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: No objection.

25 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: She's acceptable to the

1 Commission.

2 Q. (By Ms. Bada) First thing I'd like to ask you  
3 about is the habitat in the Chihuahuan Desert in Sierra and  
4 Otero Counties. What makes the Chihuahuan Desert in those  
5 counties important for wildlife?

6 A. The Chihuahuan Desert has one of the world's  
7 highest rates of plant diversity, both within the plant  
8 communities and on a scale across the landscape. The World  
9 Wildlife Fund has ranked the region globally outstanding  
10 for species richness in the categories of reptiles, birds,  
11 mammals and cacti. There's also a high degree of endovism,  
12 which means species whose distributions are limited to a  
13 small geographic area.

14 The high diversity of plants is a function of the  
15 geographic location, soil and topographic diversity and the  
16 history of evolution and response to climate change in that  
17 area. And the reason I'm repeating a lot here of what you  
18 heard from Bob Sivinski yesterday is because high plant  
19 diversity translates largely to high diversity of wildlife  
20 habitat.

21 The Chihuahuan Desert environment has been  
22 degraded by historic overgrazing and other factors,  
23 including loss of the fire regime and excessive diversion  
24 of surface water. The grassland component is shrinking in  
25 comparison with the area dominated by shrubs. Portion of

1 the Chihuahuan Desert in Sierra and Otero Counties is in  
2 relatively intact and functional condition.

3 This area provides a corridor for the  
4 connectivity of mobile wildlife between Mexico, trans-Pecos  
5 Texas and more northern areas of New Mexico.

6 There's also a variety of freshwater habitats,  
7 and these would be springs, cienegas, intermittent streams  
8 with high degrees of complexity and endomism, some of which  
9 provide home for rare fish and invertebrates. Although the  
10 wetlands and watercourses will presumably be protected from  
11 surface development, they are potentially vulnerable to  
12 changes in water quality and subsurface hydrology.

13 Q. How does the Chihuahuan Desert habitat in these  
14 two counties compare to surrounding counties?

15 A. Sierra and Otero Counties have the largest block  
16 of intact Chihuahuan Desert grassland. The word "pristine"  
17 was raised here yesterday morning, and the area is not  
18 pristine, obviously. There's things going on there like  
19 the existing gas well, ranching and other surface  
20 activities.

21 What we mean by a large block of intact grassland  
22 is that the level of impacts in that area is relatively  
23 low, leaving the function and a good ecological functioning  
24 system, condition.

25 So Chihuahuan Desert natural areas in the boot

1 heel area of New Mexico are part of a different ecological  
2 subregion. They have distinct and different conservation  
3 concerns.

4 The Chihuahuan Desert areas in Doña Ana County  
5 and in the eastern New Mexico counties have relatively  
6 heavy impacts from agriculture, urbanization and oil and  
7 gas development.

8 With the exceptions of Big Bend and Guadalupe  
9 National Parks, most all of the Chihuahuan Desert in Texas  
10 is in private ownership. That's not to say it's not being  
11 protected, but that is to say that its protected condition  
12 could change tomorrow. And much of the Chihuahuan Desert  
13 in Texas is also impacted by urbanization and pollution.

14 The northern subregion of the Chihuahuan Desert,  
15 which is the region we're talking about, is also subject to  
16 extensive urbanization and heavy grazing pressure in the  
17 nation of Mexico.

18 Q. Other than threatened and endangered species,  
19 what are the key wildlife species in this area?

20 A. Well, the BLM in consultation with our department  
21 has designated important mule deer and pronghorn management  
22 areas at the Caballo Mountains Deer Area, the Sacramento  
23 Escarpment Deer Habitat Area, the Otero Mesa Habitat Area,  
24 Nutt Antelope area and the Tularosa and Basin and White  
25 Sands Antelope Areas.

1           Based on historic reports, the Otero Mesa  
2 pronghorn herd appears to be one of the few herds in New  
3 Mexico that survived intensive commercial market hunting in  
4 the past and is truly native, not reintroduced.

5           Also important is that grassland birds, as a  
6 group of species, have been on the decline across this  
7 country. The decline is due to many factors, including  
8 habitat fragmentation, pesticide use, and loss of winter  
9 habitat to the south.

10           Chihuahuan Desert in Sierra and Otero Counties  
11 with its strong grassland component and large blocks of  
12 relatively unfragmented habitat is an important habitat  
13 that may help prevent the need for federal listing of  
14 members of this group of birds.

15           Q.    Does the Chihuahuan Desert in these two counties  
16 provide areas suitable for desert bighorn sheep  
17 reintroduction?

18           A.    The desert bighorn sheep is a state-listed  
19 endangered species for which the Game and Fish Department  
20 operates an active reintroduction and translocation  
21 program. Within the area we're talking about today,  
22 historic range, which is currently unoccupied by the sheep,  
23 occurs in the Caballo and Guadalupe Mountains. The  
24 Sacramento Range and escarpment has also been identified as  
25 potentially suitable, although there's no evidence of

1 historic populations there.

2 Q. Does it contain any potential habitat or habitat  
3 for any threatened or endangered species?

4 A. Yes, the BLM draft EIS for the fluid minerals  
5 leasing in Sierra and Otero Counties identified 10  
6 federally listed threatened and endangered species and 45  
7 other special-status species, and those would be federal  
8 candidate and proposed species, State-listed species and  
9 BLM species of concern. And I think that those numbers  
10 include those half dozen plant listed species that Bob  
11 mentioned yesterday, the various listed status.

12 And I'd like to just talk about a couple of  
13 animals on those lists.

14 The Aplomado falcon is a state and federally  
15 listed endangered species. It reaches the northernmost  
16 limit of its total distribution in the southwestern US.  
17 This falcon was largely extirpated from the US by the  
18 1930s. The last nesting documented in New Mexico until  
19 recently was in 1952. Sightings have become more frequent  
20 in New Mexico since the 1980s, and last year we believe we  
21 had a nesting pair.

22 The Aplomado falcon requires large blocks of  
23 grassland with standing yuccas, similar to the slide that  
24 we saw yesterday. The Chihuahuan grasslands in Sierra and  
25 Otero Counties are prime habitat for the return of this

1 falcon to New Mexico, either through reintroduction or  
2 natural recolonization from old Mexico.

3 And another species that's -- for which that area  
4 is important is the black-tailed prairie dog, and this is a  
5 state-listed species of concern, is its status at the  
6 moment. It's a candidate for federal listing. New Mexico  
7 Department of Game and Fish has responsibility under a  
8 formal multi-state conservation agreement to protect  
9 existing colonies and increase statewide distribution to  
10 meet multi-state conservation goals, to preclude the need  
11 for federal listing.

12 Black-tailed prairie dogs occur on the BLM  
13 portion of Otero Mesa in 22 or 23 colonies averaging  
14 approximately five acres each. These colonies are  
15 important for future conservation efforts because they are  
16 some of the last extant populations within the Chihuahuan  
17 Desert within the US. They are likely to be uniquely  
18 adapted to their very xeric environment and represent most  
19 of the few surviving source populations for recovery  
20 elsewhere within the arid southern portion of their known  
21 historic range.

22 Q. I want to ask you now about whether you've had an  
23 opportunity to review the proposed Rules that are the  
24 subject of this hearing.

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. And does the Department of Game and Fish support  
2 those Rules?

3 A. Yes, we do.

4 Q. Why?

5 A. Above-ground tanks are more protective of  
6 wildlife and wildlife habitat than in-ground pits. Pits  
7 containing liquid in arid environments are a wildlife  
8 attractant. They pose direct hazards of lethal or  
9 sublethal toxicity. Oily substances on the exterior of  
10 birds and mammals can also reduce the insulation provided  
11 by fur and feathers, leading to risk of basically death by  
12 exposure or contracting illness by exposure to cold.  
13 Predators, scavengers and decomposers consuming  
14 contaminated carcasses are potentially placed at risk.

15 Pits also pose a greater possibility than tanks  
16 for indirect impact through contamination of surface water,  
17 groundwater and soils. Based on what I heard yesterday, I  
18 would think that tank pads are -- probably pose a greater  
19 ease of reclamation of the vegetation community than does a  
20 massively disturbed pit.

21 And we generally support closer regulation of  
22 produced-water injection wells due to potential impact on  
23 the groundwater, although we're not going to get into  
24 commenting on specifics of the injection well rule.

25 Q. Are you familiar with the Oil Conservation

1 Commission's current rules on pits, Rule 50?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. And what concerns does the Game and Fish  
4 Department have about the current rules with regard to  
5 wildlife and habitat?

6 A. The existing fencing and netting requirements in  
7 Rule 50 are not sufficient to protect wildlife in this  
8 important habitat area. My answer to this question is kind  
9 of a nested series of ifs, because we don't know which way  
10 the Commission will decide to go on this.

11 If pits are going to be allowed, we would prefer  
12 that the Oil Conservation Division use its authority under  
13 the existing Rule to impose additional fencing requirements  
14 for protection of wildlife. A wildlife-exclusion fence  
15 would be a minimum seven-foot-high chain-link or woven or  
16 welded wire mesh, secured to the ground around the  
17 perimeter, with the finer-gauge material wrapped around the  
18 base to exclude small mammals, reptiles and amphibians.

19 If the post-and-wire-strand livestock-type fence  
20 is allowed, the Department would like to have the  
21 opportunity to recommend a design that will exclude  
22 antelope while minimizing potential injury to mule deer  
23 jumping over. And a post-and-wire fence should also be  
24 wrapped with finer gauge material around the base.

25 All pits should be netted, including drilling and

1 workover pits, which are accepted in the existing Rule.  
2 That Rule was promulgated primarily for the purpose of  
3 complying with the Migratory Bird Treaty Act. The  
4 Department, however, is equally concerned about the 10  
5 species of bat that are listed as species of concern in  
6 Sierra and Otero Counties. Drowned or poisoned bats are  
7 often overlooked due to their small size, dark color and  
8 nocturnal habits.

9 Netting also needs to be extended through the  
10 ground around the perimeter and maintained in functional  
11 condition.

12 Steep-sided pits present a risk of entrapment to  
13 wildlife. When you line them with a smooth-surface  
14 material, you enhance that risk of entrapment -- in other  
15 words, the difficulty of getting out of the pit. And we  
16 would like to see the inclusion of ramps or ladders for the  
17 escape of trapped wildlife, and Game and Fish does have  
18 design specifications which would be adaptable to that  
19 purpose.

20 Q. If tanks are used, what measures need to be in  
21 place to protect wildlife?

22 A. Okay, the existing Rule requires that tanks  
23 larger than 16 feet diameter be either covered or netted.  
24 Game and Fish Department believes that tanks less than 16  
25 feet should be similarly protected.



1 the hundred or so oil and gas wells that have already been  
2 drilled -- Can you give me a relative importance there, to  
3 try to get some perspective?

4 A. Yeah, I think -- You know, the point I was trying  
5 to make there was that the level of disturbance currently  
6 in the area that we're talking about is lesser than that of  
7 similar grassland environments in the surrounding area due  
8 to those factors you just mentioned. That's not to say  
9 there has been no impact from those existing hundred or so  
10 oil and gas wells.

11 And I think I need to give the same answer that  
12 Bob Sivinski gave yesterday, which is that the impact of  
13 these things is going to be a cumulative impact which is  
14 incremental with each development project, and also to keep  
15 in mind that in terms of wildlife habitat, the roads  
16 involved with the infrastructure are likely to have equal  
17 or greater impact than the actual wellpads themselves.

18 Q. And that also applies to only five percent of the  
19 area being developed? That's a very low percentage.

20 A. Right, you're talking about the five-percent  
21 proposal from the BLM and their --

22 Q. Yes.

23 A. Yeah, yes. Yeah. The answer is that that  
24 depends on some factors which I don't know the answer to,  
25 and I'm not sure that anybody does, which is where exactly

1 those five percent are and how they would be spaced and how  
2 they would be connected by roads.

3 Each road and each wellpad has a zone of impact  
4 around it, and it really depends on a whole lot of things  
5 that I believe are not specified at this point. And they  
6 probably aren't known by the oil and gas industry until  
7 they do their exploration.

8 Q. We heard testimony that beneficial use of  
9 produced water was being encouraged. If there is the  
10 possibility of beneficial use of produced water in this  
11 area, would that not help the populations if these tanks  
12 were not fenced in accordance with the way you've  
13 recommended?

14 A. I don't think that the materials which are placed  
15 directly into the tanks, pits, that there's any way to be  
16 certain that those materials don't contain toxics.

17 And water that is -- either comes out of the  
18 ground clean and is separated from hazardous materials or  
19 is -- can be treated to a clean and safe condition, we'd  
20 very much support use of that water for beneficial uses.  
21 And I would add that the two beneficial uses we would most  
22 like to see is on site right at the wellsite, irrigation  
23 for re-establishment of native grasses and drinking  
24 facilities for wildlife.

25 Q. Then my last question, concerning the antelope

1 herds, is there hunting allowed?

2 A. I believe so, yeah.

3 Q. So those herds are being hunted and killed as we  
4 speak?

5 A. Yeah, hunting requires a license from our  
6 department, and we have a process every two years, I  
7 believe, by which we determine levels of exploitation that  
8 the herds can sustain.

9 COMMISSIONER BAILEY: Those are all the questions  
10 I have. Thank you.

11 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Commissioner Chavez?

12 EXAMINATION

13 BY COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ:

14 Q. Ms. Jankowitz, one of your qualifications was  
15 that you had done assessments about oil and gas development  
16 in the San Juan Basin. Did I understand that correctly?

17 A. Yes, sir, environmental assessments under the  
18 NEPA process.

19 Q. Was that done for a government agency or --

20 A. Most -- the bulk of the work that I did  
21 personally was on the Jicarilla Apache Reservation, and the  
22 work was contracted to the Bureau of Indian Affairs.

23 Q. Okay. Is any of that observation helpful to you  
24 in reviewing the proposed Rule that the OCD has come up  
25 with?



1 (The following proceedings were had at 2:30 p.m.  
2 on Friday, June 18th, 2004:)

3 STEVEN T. FINCH, Jr.,

4 the witness herein, after having been first duly sworn upon  
5 his oath, was examined and testified as follows:

6 DIRECT EXAMINATION

7 BY MS. BELIN:

8 Q. Mr. Finch, would you state your name for the  
9 record, please?

10 A. My name is Steven T. Finch, Jr.

11 Q. And what is your employment position?

12 A. I'm vice president and senior hydrogeologist at  
13 John Shoemaker and Associates.

14 Q. Can you be sure -- This microphone isn't going to  
15 amplify you, so you're just going have to --

16 A. Okay.

17 Q. -- amplify your own voice.

18 What is your educational background?

19 A. I have a bachelor's in science, in geology, from  
20 Sul Ross State University in Alpine, Texas, with a minor in  
21 chemistry. And I also have a master's in science, or a  
22 master of science in geology, from Northern Arizona  
23 University in Flagstaff, Arizona.

24 Q. And could you give a brief summary of your  
25 employment history?

1           A.    Yes, I won't go all the way back, but before I  
2 started working with John Shoemaker and Associates I had  
3 various jobs related to geology, both in the oil and mining  
4 industry, and in 1990 I started working with John Shoemaker  
5 and Associates as a staff hydrogeologist. And in 1995 Mr.  
6 -- or Dr. Shoemaker made me a principal of the firm, and 14  
7 years later I'm now vice president.

8           Q.    So for the past 14 years you've been a  
9 hydrogeologist with John Shoemaker and Associates?

10          A.    Yes.

11          Q.    And did you say that -- did you -- Have you  
12 worked for an oil or gas company during your career?

13          A.    I briefly worked in San Antonio for a petroleum  
14 geologist, or petroleum engineer, as essentially an  
15 apprentice geologist, go out and watch activities on  
16 various well sites and stuff, workovers, frac jobs, et  
17 cetera.

18          Q.    Could you give a -- just a thumbnail sketch of  
19 the kinds of work you do at John Shoemaker?

20          A.    You bet. I have really focused on water resource  
21 evaluation, both the quantification of groundwater but also  
22 the chemical aspects. A lot of my academic training was in  
23 geochemistry, so I've kind of jumped the fence a little bit  
24 there.

25                   A lot of the projects that I've worked on have

1 ranged from things for -- everything, as far as clients,  
2 from a person that owns a domestic well, to industry, State  
3 of New Mexico and federal government, and all of those have  
4 related to wells and groundwater systems and analysis of  
5 those systems, whether to develop or protect them.

6 And more specifically, I've kind of gotten into  
7 the realm of modeling, which Dr. Shoemaker mentored me on,  
8 and I have developed a lot of regional groundwater fluid  
9 models within the State of New Mexico for municipalities  
10 and for the -- let's see -- State Engineer, thank you.  
11 Some of those models were the Tularosa Basin, Jornada,  
12 along the Rio Grande, various different models, San Juan  
13 Basin.

14 I've also had some experience with evaluating the  
15 feasibility of injection wells in the San Juan Basin as a  
16 project I did for the Gas Research Institute, which I now  
17 believe they've changed their name to something else.

18 Also kind of in parallel with that project was a  
19 fracture study looking at the occurrence of migration  
20 pathways for methane and water in the San Juan Basin along  
21 the Animas River valley.

22 Locally within the area that we're talking about  
23 here today, I've had quite a bit of experience of working  
24 in the Tularosa Basin and the Salt Basin, in the Tularosa  
25 Basin primarily for the City of Alamogordo and village of

1 Cloudcroft. Well, actually they're on the other side of  
2 the -- barely outside of the Tularosa Basin.

3 I'm currently working on the Tularosa Basin  
4 National Research Desalinization Facility for the  
5 Interstate Stream Commission and have done a detailed study  
6 of the Salt Basin, which we have used and revised for this  
7 particular, submitted -- or the work has been updated for  
8 the Coalition.

9 Q. And describe the nature of your study of the Salt  
10 Basin and who you did it for.

11 A. Well, it started off with a regional water plan  
12 for the Tularosa and Salt Basin. And then during that time  
13 -- I believe that was around 1999 -- the State Engineer  
14 became interested in what was going on in the Salt Basin.  
15 It was essentially an undeclared area. Very little was  
16 known about it.

17 And so then a few years later the Interstate  
18 Stream Commission hired us to do essentially an evaluation  
19 of the water resources in the Basin. Basically we  
20 collected all the data that was available to us and looked  
21 at what the possibilities were for developing water to meet  
22 compact deliveries related to stream-flow obligations.

23 Q. So you prepared a report for the Interstate  
24 Stream Commission on that area?

25 A. I did.

1 Q. And then subsequently you were hired to work in  
2 connection with the BLM's land plan amendment for the Otero  
3 Mesa area?

4 A. That's correct, I was hired by the Coalition to  
5 review the BLM Resource Management Plan and to provide  
6 comments based on my understanding of the water resources.

7 Q. And most recently the Coalition asked you to look  
8 at the proposed rules that are under consideration at this  
9 hearing and prepare the testimony you're preparing today?

10 A. They did, and I submitted comments which include  
11 the report that I've prepared that describes the details of  
12 the Salt Basin, and a summary letter that was attached to  
13 that and a map.

14 MS. BELIN: I would offer Mr. Finch as an expert  
15 in hydrogeology.

16 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Any objection?

17 COMMISSIONER BAILEY: No.

18 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: No.

19 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: He's acceptable as such to the  
20 Commission.

21 Q. (By Ms. Belin) Thank you. The format we would  
22 like to use is that Mr. Finch will go ahead and just make a  
23 PowerPoint presentation with his comments. I'll probably  
24 just have a few questions at the end, rather than a  
25 question-answer dialogue, if that's all right.

1           A.    Okay, the map shown on the first slide of the  
2 PowerPoint presentation is from the report that I submitted  
3 as part of the comments, and it's titled Figure 7.

4                    And what I wanted to, or how I envisioned  
5 structuring this, was briefly describe why there are  
6 important water resources in the Salt Basin area and then  
7 kind of give you a brief overview of where those resources  
8 are, just basically a description of the Basin since that's  
9 -- I think it's been lacking in this hearing -- and then  
10 provide some of the conclusions that are laid out in my  
11 report, and then finally my opinions related to the  
12 proposed Rule.

13                   This map, which is Figure 7, shows -- the gray  
14 area is the outline of the Salt Basin. And there are  
15 several features I'd like to point out. One at the bottom  
16 is the Texas-New Mexico state line. And then at the top  
17 here, the Sacramento River comes in and essentially dead-  
18 ends in an area, a very vast linear feature that goes from  
19 the northern or northwestern to southeastern portion of the  
20 Basin that we call the Otero Break. And I'll discuss this  
21 in more detail here in a minute, but it's a significant  
22 hydrologic feature.

23                   The little dots on the map represent water wells  
24 that we know about, and the yellow areas are areas of  
25 water-right applications that have been submitted to the

1 State Engineer.

2           There are a few communities that use the aquifer  
3 within the Salt Basin for municipal supply, one being  
4 Timberon, which is a small community up in the northwestern  
5 corner, right along the Sacramento River. The other is  
6 Piñon. And most of the other wells and dots in the -- I  
7 would say the western and northern parts of the Salt Basin  
8 -- are stock and -- primarily stock and domestic wells,  
9 until you get down into an area in the eastern -- the  
10 southeastern part which is called Crow Flat. Crow Flat is  
11 an area where there's significant irrigation and very  
12 productive wells.

13           In addition to Crow Flat you have an area right  
14 on the edge called the Dell City Irrigation District in  
15 Texas, right along the state line, and you'll see a  
16 concentration of wells down there. Those are primarily  
17 irrigation wells.

18           My next slide is a picture --

19           COMMISSIONER BAILEY: Before you leave that --

20           THE WITNESS: Yes.

21           COMMISSIONER BAILEY: -- what are the little red  
22 squares that are horizontal?

23           THE WITNESS: The little red squares. You know,  
24 that is an artifact of the land net, and I'm not really  
25 sure -- See, those are township/ranges --

1 COMMISSIONER BAILEY: Yeah.

2 THE WITNESS: -- and I'm not really sure what  
3 this part of that overlay -- and it has something to do  
4 with the land net, the way a survey was done or something,  
5 as far as the township/range stuff. I really don't know.  
6 It does look odd.

7 Well, the Otero Mesa area to the west of this has  
8 nice grasslands and antelope. To the east we have the  
9 irrigation and agricultural areas that I was talking about.  
10 This is right along the state line looking east. In the  
11 background there, you see the Guadalupe Mountains, and many  
12 of these wells produce over 2000 gallons per minute. It's  
13 very significant.

14 The first thing that I did when I started  
15 researching the Salt Basin was, I pulled up everything that  
16 I knew, or that I can find, and so I wanted to describe  
17 basically some of the major work that's been done on the  
18 area that I think has been overlooked by a lot of people.

19 In the 1950s the State Engineer did an assessment  
20 on the groundwater conditions in Crow Flat, which is east  
21 of Otero Mesa. And then -- or sometime after that, 1995,  
22 there's some work done by Mayer, which he did his PhD  
23 dissertation, and his advisor, Dr. Sharp -- They're both  
24 from the University of Texas at Austin. And they studied  
25 the Otero Break and the whole Salt Basin in great detail.

1 Mayer went out and mapped out all the fractures and  
2 provided great information on the types of fracturing, the  
3 distribution of them, and went to describe structurally how  
4 those occur, or why they're there, and also developed a  
5 groundwater flow model of the Basin.

6           Shortly -- maybe during the same time or  
7 thereafter, the New Mexico Water Resource Research  
8 Institute did a nice overview of water resources in the  
9 Salt Basin area and their trans-boundary aquifers of the El  
10 Paso and Las Cruces report that was one in several series,  
11 and then finally of the Tularosa and Salt Basin Regional  
12 Water Plan. We provided a lot of detail on the resources  
13 in that water plan, more than you see in the other regional  
14 water plans of the State.

15           This is my third slide, and it's really a  
16 generalized geologic map. It is also Figure 2 of the  
17 report that I've submitted as comments.

18           And basically what I wanted to show you are these  
19 regions that are divided by these green lines, and all of  
20 them except for the one in the Crow Flat area and down in  
21 the Salt Lakes, into Texas, by Dell City -- all those are  
22 -- there's bedrock at the surface, essentially, and it's  
23 primarily of Permian age, with the exception of right in  
24 the Otero Mesa area there's a series of hills, the Cornudas  
25 Mountains, which are, you know, volcanic intrusions and

1 things like that, that have come up.

2 One thing that I wanted to discuss or mention  
3 briefly about the water use from our previous map is that  
4 -- just to give you some numbers of what's going on in the  
5 Salt Basin, currently there's about 50,000 acre-feet of  
6 water rights that have been declared, and there's  
7 approximately 15,000 to 20,000 acre-feet of water that's  
8 historically been put to beneficial use.

9 Jumping back into the geology here, what I want  
10 to do is just show you what we -- some of the cross-  
11 sections that we put together, essentially to look at the  
12 vertical profiles of the aquifers. Here we have A-A',  
13 which is east to west on the north end of the Basin. And  
14 then down here is B-B'. Essentially it runs parallel to  
15 the state line. And I think this will give a good idea of  
16 what the aquifer looks like, and I'll point out some key  
17 features there.

18 Now, these cross-sections were developed from  
19 geologic mapping of what few -- or little data we had from  
20 wells, and also what the expected thickness or the measured  
21 thicknesses of those units are, the geologic units are in  
22 that area.

23 What you see here is, the blue primarily  
24 represents the Permian-age rocks, which are carbonate  
25 rocks. And then the red down here is primarily

1 Precambrian. There is a big section of rock missing from  
2 the Permian to Precambrian that was eroded off in the  
3 northern part of the Basin.

4 If you'll look at the scale on the -- the  
5 vertical scale on the map, each one of those numbers  
6 represents a thousand feet. And you'll see that the  
7 aquifer is approximately 1000 to 2000 feet thick in this  
8 region.

9 The black vertical line right here is called  
10 Number 1 -- I can't read it, but anyway that's an oil and  
11 gas exploration well, so we do have a control point there.  
12 These other black lines with the up-and-down arrows on them  
13 represent faults. And the faults -- those signify the  
14 northern part of what makes the Salt Basin, which is a  
15 graben feature. It's where rocks have been faulted and  
16 essentially dropped down.

17 Let's see, go to the next one.

18 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Excuse me, you're saying  
19 that blue line is the water table?

20 THE WITNESS: That blue line is the water table  
21 at that point, and that's the regional water table. Thank  
22 you for helping me out there. There are also, in some of  
23 these arroyos and channels, there are perched water. So  
24 the depth of water, I'll touch on in a minute, is quite  
25 variable throughout the Basin. And I'll explain that. I

1 guess the next map would be my opportunity to do that.

2 Back to the geologic map that we had. Depth of  
3 water in the northern part up here, based on some of the  
4 wells that I've been involved with for the community of  
5 Timberon, ranges anywhere from 30 to 200 feet.

6 As you get out into the center of the Basin, the  
7 depth of water varies quite a bit, depending on whether  
8 it's a localized perched system or a regional system. And  
9 the measurements that I've seen range from one to five  
10 hundred feet.

11 Around the Cornudas Mountains, the same kind of  
12 thing. You'll see a lot more perched water, because it's a  
13 significant area of recharge. And I'd like to show my next  
14 cross-section, which goes through the Cornudas Mountains  
15 and down along the southern part of the Salt Basin.

16 As you can see, the blue line represents the  
17 water table on the regional system. Like I said, there  
18 will be shallower perched systems above that. A lot of the  
19 wells are in the perched system, and there are -- I'd say  
20 about half and half in the perched and in the regional  
21 system.

22 One thing that you can deem from this cross-  
23 section is that there's a lot of faulting that's been  
24 mapped, and -- plus with some well control. We know that  
25 those formations, there's blocks of them and they're

1 essentially stepped down to the east, and some around the  
2 Cornudas Mountains might be fairly high or closer to the  
3 land surface.

4 The blue color represents the Permian-age rocks  
5 again, that carbonate aquifer that I'm talking about, which  
6 is mainly the San Andres and the Yeso, similar to what the  
7 Roswell-Artesian Basin is composed of.

8 And this pink color here are the older rocks,  
9 sedimentary rocks, that from what I gather, reviewing the  
10 oil and gas logs, that's where some of the shows have been,  
11 in the Mississippian age, which probably might be in the  
12 middle of that pink section.

13 I would also like to make one other comment about  
14 the deeper rocks. Farther south and into Texas, right on  
15 the other side of the state line, I've reviewed some  
16 information on an oil/gas well that was done by Texaco  
17 years ago, and it was drilled down to, I believe, a little  
18 over 3000 feet. And they collected a water sample from the  
19 Fusselman formation, which is in the lower part of this  
20 pink stuff. And they took a water sample, and their  
21 analysis showed it was around 2000 to 2500 part-per-million  
22 water, which is fairly fresh for that depth.

23 There have been other publications that said  
24 there's a likelihood of fresh water at depth in this  
25 region, but with no specifics. Essentially one indication

1 is that the lack of salts -- we've been talking about salt  
2 beds, but the lack -- there are salt beds or gypsum  
3 deposits in the Yeso formation. The lack of them indicates  
4 a flushing effect, which means fresh water has moved  
5 through that system.

6 This slide is Figure 5 from my report, which  
7 shows groundwater or water-level contours, and this  
8 particular slide also shows the Salt Basin in New Mexico,  
9 as well as the portion in Texas. It extends fairly far  
10 into Texas, from Dell City on south, close to --  
11 essentially all the way, practically, to Van Horn, Texas.

12 Q. (By Ms. Belin) Are the black numbers elevations?

13 A. The black numbers are elevations of the water-  
14 level con- -- that represent the water-level contours, yes.  
15 And the blue arrows are flow directions.

16 Now, one thing I would like to point out here  
17 that to me is significant as a hydrogeologist, the closer  
18 these lines are, the tighter their formation is and the  
19 less permeable the water -- I mean the slower the flow of  
20 water is, and the less will flow through that particular  
21 section of water. As they open up, means the formation has  
22 a greater transmissivity, it's able to move the water out  
23 faster.

24 Where these lines are greatly separated right  
25 here in the central part of the Basin, actually a good part

1 of the Basin, that's the Otero Break. And the Otero Break  
2 essentially consists of a group of fractures and faults and  
3 extremely high-density -- or high fracture density in areas  
4 right at the -- from where the Sacramento River stops, all  
5 the way to Dell City.

6 One thing we do not know is how deep these  
7 fractures are and the faulting. I suspect they're fairly  
8 continuous and deep. Essentially, it's a structure that's  
9 been reactivated from Pennsylvanian time, which means it  
10 was a structure that developed in those lower pink rocks,  
11 and then as the Permian rocks were overlaying it  
12 reactivated. So it's likely that it's fairly deep-seated,  
13 these -- this fracture system.

14 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: What number is that?

15 THE WITNESS: That is Figure 5 --

16 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Figure 5 --

17 THE WITNESS: -- from my report.

18 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: -- thank you.

19 THE WITNESS: The well -- the oil -- or the gas  
20 test well I was talking about that had the fresh water down  
21 to 3000 feet was right over here, approximately 20 miles  
22 south of the state line, south of Otero Mesa.

23 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Those elevations are sea  
24 level?

25 THE WITNESS: That is correct, that's feet above

1 sea level.

2 One thing, I did talk a little bit about the  
3 water use, but I haven't really mentioned anything about  
4 the recharge. And one of my big points about -- or the  
5 things that I've learned about this system is that it's a  
6 very large regional system. The Salt Basin, and  
7 particularly the Otero Mesa area, is a recharge area. It's  
8 -- You can see where all these flow lines are flowing  
9 towards the Otero Break, which essentially collects water  
10 and discharges it down to the Salt Lakes south of Dell  
11 City. But the recharge is primarily here where the  
12 fracturing is. There's also fracturing around the Cornudas  
13 mountains where the intrusions came up and essentially  
14 broke through the rocks around it.

15 This particular figure is appended in the report  
16 that I've provided, and essentially it's from Mayer and his  
17 PhD dissertation. And like I said, he went out and mapped  
18 the fractures, and that was a quite easy job for him. You  
19 can see here, this is the exposed rock, and that's a  
20 fracture, and so is this. And that's his dog up here. You  
21 read the title and it says, 45-pound dog for scale.

22 This is primarily exposed rock, and then the thin  
23 veneer of soil is what you see in the background. That's  
24 typically what I've seen in a lot of the Otero Mesa area,  
25 particularly in the Otero Break, is a thin veneer soil,

1 lots of fractures.

2 The recharge, quantity of recharge, has been  
3 estimated by several, including myself. But the estimates  
4 range from anywhere from 30 to 200,000 acre-feet a year,  
5 which is a lot. The 200,000 acre-feet a year I'm not  
6 buying. The 30 to maybe 75 is definitely more in the right  
7 ballpark.

8 Even given that, for how arid this climate is and  
9 the elevation, lack of snowfall and stuff like that, that  
10 is a significant amount of water. And what that means is  
11 that in order to have that much recharge you have to have a  
12 mechanism to efficiently really water from the surface to  
13 the ground, and that's indicative of the fracturing.

14 Let's see. The one thing I haven't discussed is  
15 water quality, and I couldn't -- within the short time  
16 frame I couldn't find a nice map that would demonstrate it,  
17 but there are maps that we've developed that show the  
18 distribution of water quality in the Tularosa and Salt  
19 Basin Regional Water Plan, which was adopted by the  
20 Interstate Stream Commission in 2002. But if I can just  
21 use my pointer, I think that might suffice.

22 Primarily, everything except for the Dell City  
23 and maybe part of the Cornudas Mountain area is less than  
24 1000 part-per-million water. There is limited data on  
25 that, but we have fairly good coverage. And --

1 Q. (By Ms. Belin) When you say 1000 parts-per-  
2 million water, you mean 1000 parts TDS?

3 A. Correct, that's what I'm referring to, total  
4 dissolved solids. Essentially fresh water and -- what I  
5 call fresh water. I know the oil and gas industry has a  
6 looser term for fresh water sometimes.

7 In the Dell City area the water is, although  
8 saltier -- and the reason why that is is because it's near  
9 the Salt Lakes or the playas, but also because of the  
10 extensive irrigation that's been going on for the last 50,  
11 60 years, they've had a lot of return flow and kind of a  
12 little issue with salting of the water locally from  
13 agriculture.

14 The particular map I have up as a slide now is  
15 one that I submitted with my letter as part of the comment,  
16 and it shows many things. And it gets fairly complicated,  
17 but essentially I wanted to show everything I could on one  
18 map.

19 It has the water level contours, so you know the  
20 direction of flow, with the arrows. This brown line that  
21 covers a good portion of the Salt Basin, essentially the  
22 area of high fracture density that Mayer has identified,  
23 taken directly from his report. And then the light green  
24 coverage is from the BLM Resource Management Plan, which is  
25 the area that they claim has some -- I guess medium or

1 moderate oil and gas potential.

2           And there's some land ownership coverage here.  
3 The gray, which is also underneath this green -- it looks  
4 like a darker green -- that particular overlay represents  
5 the BLM land. You can see it's predominantly BLM.

6           Okay, I know I've missed some things, but  
7 hopefully I'll get questions where I can fill those gaps  
8 in. But I think I'll just go -- to save time, I'll just go  
9 right into my opinions that I've provided as public  
10 comment, and I'm just going to read them right off my  
11 PowerPoint slides, which makes it easier for me, and then  
12 conclude.

13           The first thing is that I think the proposed Rule  
14 is a good start, it's in the right direction for protecting  
15 water resources. I can probably talk all day on how  
16 valuable the water resources are. I know the Interstate  
17 Stream Commission would like to see those preserved for  
18 future use, as well as the Governor.

19           And the next bullet is essentially what I've  
20 pointed out. Given the geologic setting, which means the  
21 fractured rock, the lack of soil cover and the subsequent  
22 vulnerability of groundwater to contamination, the  
23 potential for leaks and spills needs to be eliminated to  
24 the maximum extent to protect known water resources.

25           I got the impression through listening to

1 testimony from the last day and a half of the hearing that  
2 people don't feel like they know a whole lot about the Salt  
3 Basin, and they probably don't. But I'm glad I'm here,  
4 because I feel fairly comfortable -- I've had five years of  
5 time to study the Salt Basin and I feel like it's a known  
6 water resource. We've quantified how much is there in the  
7 regional water plan, and for the Interstate Stream  
8 Commission's interest.

9           The groundwater in other areas has been impacted  
10 from oil and gas operations. I think that's been well  
11 demonstrated. Even though they're from older operations  
12 and the Rules might have been different at that time, they  
13 probably thought the Rules were great. They weren't good  
14 enough. We're learning all the time, and through that  
15 learning process, things eventually need to change.

16           I guess my comment on that is, Otero and Sierra  
17 County should not be put at risk to suffer the same  
18 consequences.

19           My opinions regarding pits, digging pits where  
20 there is little or no topsoil and fractured rock, I don't  
21 see how that's really a viable protective measure, or  
22 really economical. In the water-well business we wouldn't  
23 even -- we'd do a closed-loop system. It's just cheaper.  
24 I know there are differences in scale of depth, size of  
25 hole, all those kind of things, but I think there's room to

1 be able to modify things to meet those objectives.

2           The proposed Rule does not allow for pits, which  
3 I think is good, and supported by the things that I've  
4 observed and I've presented here today. Depth to water, we  
5 know, is less than 100 feet in many places. The fracturing  
6 is well documented, and there's a driving force for  
7 migration of surface spills. Essentially it's the  
8 recharge. If it spills out and becomes soil contamination,  
9 the recharge will drive it back in if it's not mitigated  
10 within a quick time frame.

11           Also, I think this has been discussed, but there  
12 are other things that are used in the oil and gas drilling,  
13 and I think the closed-loop system in the pits are a good  
14 idea when you -- it gives you the freedom to be able to use  
15 those things without worrying about the environmental  
16 consequences.

17           I know, for instance, I've seen a few cases where  
18 dealing with stuck pipe you'll have to circulate with  
19 diesel to get the stuck pipe out. Oil-based muds have  
20 quite a bit of diesel in them. I think I'd want to recover  
21 as much as I could. And I wouldn't even really recommend  
22 that in this particular area with the degree of fracturing.

23           For the injection wells, I'm not really sure if  
24 there's a zone viable for injecting produced water, unless  
25 if you inject it back into the zone you took it from, which

1 would be not in the interest of the industry.

2           There's a lot of unknowns as far as how deep-  
3 seated the regional freshwater groundwater flow system is,  
4 and I think given the structural setting it's probably  
5 likely it's there.

6           Also, with the fracturing and faulting there's a  
7 high potential for vertical migration. Even if you make  
8 the most beautiful Class I injection well, you can still  
9 contaminate the aquifer, freshwater aquifer, through these  
10 preferential pathways of faults and fractures. I don't  
11 think it's worth the risk to do it.

12           And then just some other things to conclude with,  
13 food for thought that I kind of picked up yesterday.

14           The water-well drilling methods are designed to  
15 protect the aquifer. They're quite different than oil and  
16 gas operations. Although we both do the same thing, we're  
17 trying -- I'm not saying oil and gas operations don't  
18 protect the aquifer. The primary method of a water well is  
19 to extract water, so you're going to do everything you can  
20 to maximize its production and maintain its integrity,  
21 while the oilfield and oil and gas industry has a similar  
22 objective, but mainly more focused for the resource they're  
23 trying to get. And a lot of times in lost-circulation  
24 zones, which might be freshwater zones, they'll use lost-  
25 circulation material, cement or whatever, which really, to

1 me, kind of -- what it does is, it ruins the porosity of  
2 the aquifer. It's not good for -- especially a fractured  
3 system. If someone wants to have a nearby well, it might  
4 limit that ability to do that.

5 The leaks that might incur from not -- using  
6 these -- the proposed Rule, from the past methods,  
7 essentially from buried piping, they're very difficult to  
8 detect in fractured rock settings. I've seen this in water  
9 systems. You'll have high water loss, you don't know where  
10 it's coming from.

11 And the last thing is, the water resource beneath  
12 the Salt Basin is -- it's really only an asset to the State  
13 of New Mexico if it remains protected and contaminant-free.

14 Right now, I remember Mr. Core saying that the  
15 feasibility of exporting water out of the Salt Basin to,  
16 say, the Pecos River or whatever was very low or  
17 negligible. Well, it would be even less if the resource is  
18 contaminated, and it kind of lessens our options to do  
19 things like that.

20 Q. I have just a couple of wrap-up questions.

21 A. Okay.

22 Q. Why, in your opinion -- why do you think that  
23 injection wells should be prohibited in this area covered  
24 by the Rule, as opposed to regulated as the Rule proposes?

25 A. Because I think there are areas that -- like I

1 said, you can construct a -- you can go through all the  
2 motions. You can do the calculations using the Tice  
3 equation, which doesn't apply to fractured rock. You can  
4 do all these things, even select another method, look at  
5 the -- you know, go through the motions of the regulations  
6 which are good in most cases.

7 But here, I think you still have the probability,  
8 or a high probability, of affecting a freshwater resource,  
9 mainly because of the fracturing and the depth at which it  
10 can occur. There's not much -- to my mind, there's not  
11 much separation between -- from what I know, between what  
12 might be the injection zone and the freshwater aquifer.

13 Q. Given all of your experience looking at water  
14 resources around the state, do you believe that the water  
15 resources in the area covered by this Rule are an  
16 extraordinary resource that deserve special protection?

17 A. Yes, I do, and that's -- I mean, I think the  
18 State has always had that in mind, in other areas as well,  
19 in their protection measures, to do that. But yes, I think  
20 this one is particularly of interest.

21 And it's not uncommon -- it's actually analogous  
22 in some ways to the Edwards Aquifer in central Texas.  
23 They've established a non-degradation policy where in the  
24 recharge zone there's no such activity for potential  
25 contamination.

1 Q. Because of the importance of this aquifer for --

2 A. Or that aquifer, right, that's right.

3 Q. And just so I understand, what are the  
4 hydrological problems that come from digging pits in areas  
5 of fractured rock with just a little bit of topsoil. Why  
6 do you think you shouldn't put pits in that kind of  
7 geology?

8 A. Well, you hit -- I mean, to dig a pit you'd have  
9 to excavate the rock, essentially. And a lot of times what  
10 a contractor will do is blast it out, which just magnifies  
11 the problem of the fracturing issue. And then you don't  
12 have a nice, even surface -- and I believe this was talked  
13 about by -- I've forgotten, maybe Mr. Olson -- where a  
14 liner or such can fail through a puncture.

15 It's just not worth the risk, I don't see the  
16 benefit. If I was a contractor, I wouldn't -- I'd rather  
17 do the closed-loop system.

18 Q. Is there anything else you want to add to your  
19 testimony?

20 A. I think I've done my -- my part.

21 MS. BELIN: I have no further questions.

22 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Commissioner Bailey?

23 EXAMINATION

24 BY COMMISSIONER BAILEY:

25 Q. Your reference to the Edwards Aquifer is rather

1 interesting since their issues have to do with resort  
2 hotels, golf courses, parking lots or shopping malls.  
3 Somehow I don't see Mall of America in Timberon.

4 A. No, you don't, but they also deal with -- Well,  
5 you never know about Timberon. They have, you know, high  
6 hopes. They did before their spring dried up. But it's  
7 the principle of protecting a recharge zone. You don't  
8 have to have a shopping mall or whatever. There's -- They  
9 also have special visions for underground storage tanks,  
10 well drilling, of provisions. There are many other things,  
11 rather than just what can be built on top of the recharge  
12 zone.

13 Q. Would a better comparison be right here in New  
14 Mexico, in the Carlsbad area, in the Dark Canyon area, and  
15 have special cementing provisions have been instituted for  
16 wells drilled throughout the fractured limestones?  
17 Wouldn't that be a more equal kind of comparison?

18 A. Well, you know, that's -- I'm interested in that,  
19 and I'm not as familiar, or I'm not familiar with that  
20 particular example that you've provided.

21 Q. Another thing that's crossed my mind is that this  
22 Application has to do with Otero County and Sierra  
23 County --

24 A. That's correct.

25 Q. -- but there's been very little testimony at all

1 for water resources or implications for Sierra County. I'm  
2 just curious why we should include Sierra County when we're  
3 talking Otero County water supplies?

4 A. Well, that's a very good question. I've done  
5 quite a bit of work in Sierra County, as well as Otero and  
6 the Tularosa Basin, and the geology is quite different.  
7 And I believe Mr. Core testified to that.

8 My primary focus was the Salt Basin, and the  
9 reason why is because it stands out from the rest because  
10 of its characteristics. I don't think you see those  
11 characteristics in the other parts of Sierra County or  
12 Otero.

13 Q. But you don't have any testimony for us to  
14 include Sierra County in our consideration of the --

15 A. I would be -- If you have an area in particular,  
16 I would be more than glad to provide testimony with what I  
17 know.

18 Q. You said that 50,000 acre-feet had been declared  
19 in the lower Otero County area, 20,000 acre-feet storage  
20 use. Do you know what the beneficial use is or is  
21 anticipated to be for those 70,000 acre-feet?

22 A. Maybe that was confusing. There's 50,000 acre-  
23 feet per year of declared water right. Of those declared  
24 rights, on the average, approximately 20 have been put to  
25 beneficial use.

1 Q. Oh, okay, I just had that wrong. The beneficial  
2 use, is that irrigation in Dell City?

3 A. No, that's irrigation in Crow Flats, that's  
4 municipal supply in Timberon and Piñon and all the other  
5 little -- you know, if you add up all the stock wells, all  
6 those things. It's a combination.

7 Q. So there is some beneficial use within New  
8 Mexico?

9 A. That is all in New Mexico. The Dell City  
10 portion, if you go right on the other side of the state  
11 line in Dell City, they pump over 100,000 acre-feet a year,  
12 and the City of El Paso is currently gearing up to spend  
13 \$700 million to put a -- to buy good portions of that and  
14 pipe it to El Paso.

15 Q. With that high transmissivity within the Salt  
16 Basin, does that mean, then, that the rule of capture is  
17 applying here, that we are being drained by the Texas  
18 interests?

19 A. It does. The main thing, what we haven't -- the  
20 one reason why we haven't seen effects of great magnitude  
21 historically is because the return flows have been  
22 significant from the irrigation. Once El Paso starts to  
23 pump it, there will no longer be return flows.

24 Q. And so New Mexico will lose its resource through  
25 use in Texas?

1           A. To me, it is a very important card in the deck,  
2 with our ongoing water war with Texas. And New Mexico has  
3 the opportunity to develop that water and come up with good  
4 plans to use it, which would put the breaks on the Texas  
5 side, and that would be an extremely good negotiation tool  
6 for New Mexico.

7           Q. But at this time we're losing our water  
8 resources, we're not getting taxes from use of our  
9 resources if we offer oil and gas and coal --

10          A. Uh-huh.

11          Q. -- and uranium and other natural resources of the  
12 State --

13          A. That's right.

14          Q. -- we're not getting taxes, we're not getting  
15 royalties. So the beneficial use to New Mexico is only for  
16 a couple of small towns and a couple of ranches?

17          A. Well, and of that 20,000 acre-feet, I'd say 80  
18 percent of it is agriculture and Crow Flat. So that's  
19 fairly -- you know, that's fairly significant, you know,  
20 10,000 to 15,000 acre-feet a year of irrigation is nothing  
21 to sneeze at.

22          Q. Figure 2 shows the regional geology.

23          A. Yes.

24          Q. Has the northwestern portion showing as the Yeso  
25 formation and not the San Andres, which is more towards the

1 center and towards the Dell City area.

2 A. That's correct.

3 Q. Is the water quality in the Yeso as clean as the  
4 water quality around Dell City?

5 A. The wells that I've tested in the Timberon area  
6 are in the Yeso, and that's very fresh water. It's less  
7 than 500 milligrams per liter total dissolved solids.

8 Q. So -- You gave an example of water quality only  
9 around the Dell City area. I was looking for water quality  
10 more --

11 A. Oh --

12 Q. -- in other areas.

13 A. -- right, most of the Basin is 1000 milligrams  
14 per liter total dissolved solids, or less.

15 Q. That's what I was getting at.

16 A. We're blessed with the good quality of water,  
17 Texas is blessed with the ability to pump it from us.

18 Q. The intense fracturing is in the Otero Breaks  
19 area; is that what I understood you to say?

20 A. That's correct, and -- surrounding the Otero  
21 Break area, yes.

22 Q. What is the fracturing like in the other areas?  
23 Is it as widespread, or is it as conducive for  
24 transportation or whatever you call it in water?

25 A. Well, the map I showed, this brown line is

1 essentially the area that Mayer identified as extensive  
2 fracturing. I'd have to go back and look at his report,  
3 exactly how far he went to the west and east of that. But  
4 I'm not -- it's -- Primarily my understanding is that when  
5 you go back and look at the geologic map, the only place  
6 where there's not bedrock exposed at the surface or the --  
7 you know, the Yeso or San Andres, is in the Crow Flat,  
8 which is essentially a small -- it's in the middle of the  
9 graben where sediments have filled in, so there wouldn't be  
10 fracturing there, except for below that.

11 Q. I'm looking for areas that don't have as high a  
12 potential for transmissivity as you have indicated, such as  
13 maybe in the northwestern area?

14 A. In the far north area, when you get up into the  
15 mountains, the Sacramento Mountains, where these water-  
16 level contours are fairly tight, around the communities of  
17 Timberon and Piñon and north, I'd say it's less fractured  
18 there, from my -- from what I know.

19 Q. So the testimony concerning the fracturing in the  
20 pipelines, as you have it, to Dell City --

21 A. Uh-huh.

22 Q. -- would not be as apparent everywhere, and there  
23 could be areas where the threat to groundwater as pictured  
24 by so many people over the last two days is not as  
25 threatening?

1           A.    There may be localized areas, but even localized  
2    -- it depends on what your zone of influence is, as far as  
3    an injection well. In addition to the fracturing, there's  
4    the faulting that we showed on the map, that offsets the  
5    blocks, you know, essentially forms the Salt Basin graben.

6           So I think it's very complex. I'd be reluctant  
7    to say there's an area that's not vulnerable or susceptible  
8    in this particular region, Salt Basin.

9           Q.    Including Sierra County?

10          A.    No, I'm speaking just for the Salt Basin. Sierra  
11    County and the remainder of Otero County, it's quite  
12    variable. As Mr. Core testified to, you have the Rio  
13    Grande Rift, you know, the basin there. If you go out in  
14    the middle of the Tularosa Basin, essentially, you know,  
15    it's where the extremely saline water is, but it's also  
16    essentially mud. I mean, there's clay and silt. There's  
17    no fracturing there.

18          Q.    Did you map the location of the hundred or so oil  
19    and gas wells to overlay your location of other wells in  
20    that --

21          A.    I do have those locations, but I don't have that  
22    with me today.

23          Q.    Could you see any impact from the previous oil  
24    and gas drilling on water wells?

25          A.    I don't -- that assessment has not been done.

1 That would be quite an elaborate study all in itself.

2 Q. But for your purposes, you did not see any  
3 indications?

4 A. I don't think I can answer that question. I do  
5 not have the data to support it either way.

6 COMMISSIONER BAILEY: Those are all the questions  
7 I have.

8 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Commissioner Chavez?

9 EXAMINATION

10 BY COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ:

11 Q. Yes, in your slide titled Geology of Salt Basin,  
12 or Salt Basin --

13 A. Right, it was one of those cross-sections?

14 Q. Yes, I think that one right there.

15 A. Okay.

16 Q. I think it was the one before that --

17 A. Okay, that --

18 Q. -- with the same title.

19 A. Let's see, there's Figure 4 and Figure 3.

20 Q. That's the one I'm --

21 A. Okay.

22 Q. What you're showing there as the regional water  
23 table, that's the first occurrence of groundwater, is that  
24 what you're --

25 A. No, it's not.

1 Q. Okay, maybe I'm misunderstanding. What does that  
2 mean?

3 A. That is the regional water table. There are  
4 perched systems, as I described a lot of times, like along  
5 this geologic contact or in these valleys, there will be  
6 perched water that is essentially migrating down to the  
7 regional system. And you've got to remember, this is in  
8 the far north area, at the tail end of the Sacramento  
9 Mountains.

10 Q. Okay, so the water depth there, let's say right  
11 above where that little wording is, Otero Mesa, let's say  
12 the high point to just under the -- if you go down to the  
13 R, from there to the water table, we're looking at a  
14 distance of perhaps almost 2000 feet?

15 A. That's correct, in that particular area.

16 Q. Okay. And there doesn't seem to be any break  
17 because of the grabens for the regional table there on the  
18 right side of your graph. It seems like the regional water  
19 table is continuous regardless of what the geology shows  
20 with the grabens. Is that what that was indicating?

21 A. You mean the faulting doesn't affect the --

22 Q. Doesn't appear to affect the --

23 A. -- affect it as much?

24 Q. Right.

25 A. That's correct. My understanding is that a lot

1 of the faulting -- you know, faults can be barriers or  
2 conduits, and I guess it depends on which formation is  
3 offset from the other, but in this region the Yeso and the  
4 San Andres are fairly similar. There's not a big offset of  
5 totally different geologic units to cause a feature like  
6 that.

7 Q. Okay. In the very center of that slide, you show  
8 that regional water table with a bit of a dip in it --

9 A. Right.

10 Q. -- and yet you show the direction of flow  
11 downward?

12 A. Yeah, that is confusing. I need to probably  
13 brush that up a little bit.

14 Q. How would it look if you brushed it up?

15 A. I would probably take that one arrow out that's  
16 dipping down in the middle of that dip.

17 Q. Well, then on either side of it you have water  
18 flowing towards the center.

19 A. Right, then it's flowing out this way like a  
20 trough. This is only a cross-sectional plane, so there's  
21 another dimension we're not looking at.

22 Q. Okay. Then let's take a look at the other,  
23 similarly titled, the B slide, that one there.

24 A. Okay.

25 Q. I guess according to those mountains with those

1 intrusions there, we have the same type of effect. There's  
2 no apparent change in water across there.

3 A. That's right, it's fairly -- from previous work  
4 that's been done by -- oh, I can't remember exactly who it  
5 was. It might have been somebody that -- New Mexico Tech  
6 was one paper, and then the City of El Paso has had me  
7 review their model of the area. And essentially the  
8 Cornudas Mountains is a highly fractured zone where it's  
9 radial flow of recharge away from it.

10 You can't determine the radial-flow from this --  
11 a cross-section like this.

12 Q. Okay. You showed a slide where the fractures  
13 were right at the surface of the ground with very little  
14 soil, and you mentioned the -- There you go. How typical  
15 is that in the Otero Mesa area that -- the notation  
16 underneath says a fracture zone in Otero Mesa. Is this  
17 what might call typical of Otero Mesa, with this type of  
18 rock exposure with little soil?

19 A. You know, I've driven through the Otero Mesa  
20 area, Salt Basin, several times, and it's such a vast  
21 region. And I don't live there, so I'd be reluctant to say  
22 how typical this is. This is what Mayer presented as  
23 typical in his PhD dissertation.

24 Q. Okay. Now to the Figure 5 illustration that you  
25 have. There you go. You attribute the high

1 transmissibility to fractures. Now, we're talking about  
2 the same water -- regional water table that you showed in  
3 that other slide, the B-B' slide --

4 A. Correct.

5 Q. How -- Maybe I don't understand here. How is it  
6 determined that is more attributable to fractures than to  
7 some other connectivity of the natural permeability of the  
8 lithology of the rock itself?

9 A. Well, I took it from the PhD dissertation by  
10 Mayer and his advisor, Jack Sharp. They're the ones that  
11 did the very detailed study. And that's what I reference  
12 for this. The high-yielding wells that transect along that  
13 line also -- you know --

14 Q. So fracture permeabilities --

15 A. Fracture permeability has also been verified by  
16 well drilling, water-well drilling --

17 Q. Oh, okay.

18 A. -- in the southern part.

19 Q. This is kind of an odd one. Yesterday Mr. Core  
20 referenced a fault and I wasn't able to get back to him.  
21 Did you hear his testimony about a fault in Otero?

22 A. I vaguely recall that.

23 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ: Okay. Well, I just  
24 wondered if there was something generalized there that --  
25 it came up, that you might know about.

1                   That's all that I have, thank you.

2   EXAMINATION

3       BY CHAIRMAN FESMIRE:

4           Q.    I do need to follow up on something Commissioner  
5       Bailey said.  I too don't understand the idea of 50,000  
6       acre-feet of water rights and 20,000 acre-feet of  
7       beneficial use.  Having spent some time at the State  
8       Engineer's Office, I thought those numbers would be pretty  
9       close together.

10          A.    What happens is, say, a rancher, or a farmer or a  
11       a town or whoever, drills a well and then they file a  
12       declaration for a water right associated with that.  
13       Typically they'll file their declaration based on either --  
14       let's take the farmer as an example.  He's got a hundred  
15       acres he wants to irrigate, and his well will make 300  
16       acre-feet.  So he gets three acre feet per acre over his  
17       farm.  That will be what he declares.

18                   Now maybe over time, in reality, he only farms 50  
19       acres.  And so what he's diverting is half that.

20                   And so when I talk about a declared water right,  
21       it's what people have declared as what they can legally  
22       use, and -- opposed to what they're actually pumping.

23          Q.    So New Mexico could develop very easily another  
24       30,000 acre-feet of use per year if the State Engineer were  
25       to step in and say, you know, if you don't develop this

1 right, you're going to lose it, right?

2 A. That's correct, those people can still -- until  
3 the State Engineer says you've forfeited your right, they  
4 could pump up to that amount.

5 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: That was the only question I  
6 had.

7 Ms. MacQuesten, do you have any cross-examination  
8 for this witness?

9 MS. MacQUESTEN: No, Mr. Chairman.

10 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Mr. Carr, do you have any  
11 cross-examination?

12 MR. CARR: No, Mr. Chairman.

13 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Ms. Belin --

14 MS. BELIN: No further questions.

15 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: -- do you have any other  
16 witnesses?

17 MS. BELIN: No.

18 CHAIRMAN FESMIRE: Okay. Why don't we take a 10-  
19 minute break and reconvene at 10 minutes to 4:00?

20 (Testimony of Steven T. Finch, Jr., was concluded  
21 at 3:50 p.m., Friday, June 18th, 2004.)

22 \* \* \*

23

24

25

## CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER

STATE OF NEW MEXICO )  
 ) ss.  
 COUNTY OF SANTA FE )

I, Steven T. Brenner, Certified Court Reporter and Notary Public, HEREBY CERTIFY that the foregoing excerpts of proceedings before the Oil Conservation Commission were reported by me; that I transcribed my notes; and that the foregoing is a true and accurate record of the excerpted proceedings.

I FURTHER CERTIFY that I am not a relative or employee of any of the parties or attorneys involved in this matter and that I have no personal interest in the final disposition of this matter.

WITNESS MY HAND AND SEAL June 23rd, 2004.



STEVEN T. BRENNER  
 CCR No. 7

My commission expires: October 16th, 2006